

Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group Call for Evidence – Responses

January 2014



Cefnogir gan
Lywodraeth Cymru
Supported by
Welsh Government

	Page
1. Dyfodol i'r Iaith	1
2. Cymdeithas yr Iaith	8
3. Gwyn Jones	15
4. Christopher David	16
5. Eiry Thomas	17
6. Y Ganolfan Cynllunio Iaith	20
7. Medi Jones	23
8. David Ludlow	24
9. Clive James	26
10. Federation of Small Businesses Wales	27
11. Tinoplois	29
12. Welsh Music Foundation	34
13. Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru	37
14. Gwyn Roberts	39
15. RWE	41
16. Name withheld	44
17. Biopower UK	47
18. Dalen Newydd	49
19. John Walker	52
20. David Wyn Williams	55
21. ICAEW (Institute of Chartered Accountants)	59
22. Language Technologies Unit, Bangor Uni	62
23. UCAC	65
24. Business in Focus	66
25. S4C	68
26. Huw Marshall	76
27. Comisynydd y Gymraeg	77
28. Mentrau Iaith	83
29. CBI	87
30. Menter a Busnes	93
31. Cwmni Theatr Arad Goch	103
32. Ceir Cymru	106

COMMENTS FOR THE WELSH LANGUAGE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

TASK AND FINISH GROUP

Dr Heini Gruffudd -DYFODOL I'R IAITH

The Welsh Language and Economic Development

Dyfodol i'r iaith (A Future for the Language) is a non-party organisation that acts in the best interests of the Welsh language. The organisation aims to influence, by constitutional means, the substance and content of public policies and legislation in order to promote the growth and prosperity of the Welsh language in every policy area. It acts in the best interests of Wales and its people, gaining support and respect for the language and ensuring that the Welsh language is an active issue on the political agenda.

Dyfodol i'r iaith welcomes the opportunity to submit comments to the Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group.

SUMMARY

Question 1

How could the use of the Welsh language and bilingualism support business growth and economic development?

- i. The 'micro' and 'macro' connection: individual businesses will not succeed in this context unless there are national policies in place
- ii. Highlighting businesses that provide services through the medium of Welsh: the need to raise the profile of businesses that provide services through the medium of Welsh
- iii. A free translation service: to facilitate the use of Welsh
- iv. Prominent signs on doors and windows of businesses and shops: to attract Welsh-speaking customers

Question 2

How could economic development support increased use of the Welsh language?

- i. A need for Government leadership: to make using Welsh the norm
- ii. Tendering and procurement processes that support local businesses: to support strong community foundations
- iii. Rural economic structure: crucial if businesses are to succeed

- iv. Planning housing developments wisely: so that the local economy contributes towards language sustainability
- v. Developing a Welsh language labour market: linking jobs and language, and developing a comprehensive programme of language training
- vi. Urban growth: choosing specific places to develop the language in order to create attractive Welsh towns.
- vii. Job creation: by relocating; by providing financial packages and favourable planning

Question 3

How could the public sector support increased use of the Welsh language through its local economic impact?

- i. Moving out of Cardiff: relocating and devolving organisations
- ii. The education service: a key devolved contribution, and the need to expand Welsh language provision
- iii. Administration in Welsh: the need for local authorities to develop this aspect
- iv. Driving natural growth: planning isn't the answer to everything. The need to support an image that promotes an attractive perception of Welsh towns

Historical context

One likely reason why the Welsh language has been more successful than the other Celtic languages is that it has been a strong community language in areas that have seen considerable economic and industrial development, in particular the coalfields and steelworks of the South and North-east, and the slate-mining areas of Gwynedd. When people descended on these areas from every corner of the British Isles and the rest of Europe to find work, many of them were integrated into the local community, and became Welsh speakers. This is one reason why so many people who speak Welsh as a first language have typical English, Irish, Scottish and Italian surnames, to name but a few. This broad range of origins is a feature to be celebrated, and is a way of counteracting the claims of some people who feel alienated towards the language and feel that it is a narrow, closed and parochial phenomenon.

The success and growth of the language was attributed in part to the fact that Welsh was the natural language of the workplace. This is reflected, for example, in the provision of Section 171 of the Mines and Quarries Act 1954 (which is still in force), that states: Where the natural language of communication of the persons employed at a mine . . . or of a substantial number of those persons is Welsh, then, in considering the qualification of candidates for appointments required, by or by virtue

of this Act, to be made in the case of that mine . . . , regard shall be had to the possession of a knowledge of the language.

Without geographical areas where Welsh is a strong community language, there is grave doubt whether the language can survive as a viable language. The existence and survival of such areas depend in turn on their economic prosperity. Investment needs to be prioritised for these areas, along with policies and measures targeted towards maintaining the language, such as developing Welsh-speaking workplaces, and enabling people who have moved into these areas to work to acquire language skills.

Question 1

How could the use of the Welsh language and bilingualism support business growth and economic development?

i. The 'micro' and 'macro' connection

The questions that were asked combine some micro level (involving the conduct of individual businesses) and some macro level (involving wider economic policy). Very little can be achieved at individual company level without having the wider policies in place. It is good to see companies using Welsh at work, but for this to be truly effective, they need to operate in an environment which allows the use of Welsh between businesses, and also between businesses and the government.

ii. Highlighting businesses that provide services through the medium of Welsh

On a local and personal level, a company that provides services through the medium of Welsh can be attractive. This promotes a network of Welsh communities. For this to succeed, it would be worth highlighting companies that can provide oral or written services through the medium of Welsh. This can be an appropriate target for the Welsh Language Commissioner and also for the language enterprises (Mentrau Iaith), so that information is easily available for customers and businesses about the Welsh language in business. Contacts and trade between Welsh businesses could be promoted by creating a 'Business to business' website in Welsh.

iii. A free translation service

To facilitate the use of Welsh in businesses, it would be good if the Welsh Government or the Welsh Language Commissioner could provide a free translation service for signs and documents.

iv. Prominent signs on the doors and windows of businesses and shops

All too often, customers are unaware that a business or a shop can provide services through the medium of Welsh. Although signs are available from the Welsh Language Commissioner, there hasn't been a targeted campaign for their distribution. Also, their purpose is unclear from a distance. These signs should be as

prominent as hygiene signs in restaurant windows, and workers should wear clear Welsh badges. This is likely to increase support among Welsh-speakers and add to the value of the Welsh language within the business.

Question 2

How could economic development support increased use of the Welsh language?

viii. A need for Government leadership

Generally, unless a business is located in a relatively Welsh-speaking area, or serves a Welsh audience (e.g. a publishing company), it is unlikely to use Welsh for strictly financial reasons. The Government needs to create an ethos in favour of Welsh by adopting policies in favour of Welsh across areas such as planning, media, education and the economy. Businesses would then be willing to be more Welsh in their ways, and would see that this doesn't conflict with their self-interest. As a result, using Welsh would develop as the norm, and would not be used as a less desirable exercise.

ix. Tendering and procurement processes that support local businesses

Broad Welsh Government economic policies (e.g. involving grants, tendering) need to consider the interests of the language. There are many examples of local companies failing to attract business because the authorities claim that their hands are tied due to tendering guidelines received from the Government. Recently, this has involved milk for Carmarthenshire schools, and some time ago, grass-cutting services for Anglesey schools. There is a need to create tendering conditions that overcome the need to attract large companies from further afield.

x. Rural economic structure

Carter and Aitchison note that there are specific difficulties to be faced whilst developing the economy in areas which are relatively Welsh-speaking. They argue that closing shops, schools, courts, leisure centres, swimming pools and medical services in rural areas weaken the economic viability of rural areas, leading to out-migration amongst the young and people who are economically active, and this in turn makes it difficult for small and medium sized businesses to flourish. ('Economics rather than rights critical for language survival', accessed from

<http://www.clickonwales.org/2013/05/economics-rather-than-rights-critical-for-language-survival/>)

xi. Planning housing developments wisely

Planning for housing must be considered alongside economic planning, because of the economic contribution that arises as a result of building homes, and also because such plans can be a danger to language sustainability if they are

disproportionate. One key issue is that strong guidelines are set for planning authorities, and the delay before the introduction of new council notes – the TAN 20 – was unfortunate. The way that the language is treated in planning matters needs to be closely scrutinized, and the Government needs to be vigilant in this respect.

xii. Developing a Welsh language labour market

A national scheme is needed to identify jobs where the Welsh language is key or desirable and a broad language training programme to develop job-specific language skills within the workplace. This will have implications for government matters - the economy, administration, private and voluntary sectors. The education service and Welsh for Adults will be responsible for providing Welsh at work training, with an emphasis on oral or written skills as appropriate. A central body is needed to co-ordinate this scheme.

xiii. Urban growth

Dyfodol i'r laith believes that the Government needs to adopt the principle of language growth points beyond Cardiff. Cardiff itself is a successful example of language growth as a result of job creation. Aberystwyth is another example with its National Library employing 300 staff members. A language strategy is needed that will identify several towns for language growth, with a focus on developing these rather than spreading efforts over the whole of Wales.

Welsh towns can be distributed into three broad categories: (1) those such as Caernarfon and Llangefni which are still confidently Welsh-speaking and where Welsh is heard as the main language on the streets; (2) problematic towns such as Machynlleth and Ammanford where English is gradually gaining ground, and (3) weaker towns such as Llandeilo and Mold, but which contain a solid core of Welsh-speakers that can be built upon.

xiv. Job creation

Public sector jobs can be created (a) by relocating jobs, as the Assembly itself has done, and (b) Welsh jobs can be created by stipulating that an understanding of Welsh is a condition of work (e.g. by making it the language of internal operation in local government).

In order to create private sector jobs, an ATTRACTIVE PACKAGE needs to be created to attract businesses, and this would include:

- a. Attractive borrowing terms by a Welsh Community Development Bank, supported by the Government.
- b. An attractive grants package, with benefits for companies willing to increase their use of Welsh.
- c. Low business taxes and corporation tax, possibly for an initial term.

ch. One consideration could be to establish a Business Park for companies that operate principally through the medium of Welsh (e.g. similar to those seen in the Basque Country), with buildings to let at a very low cost.

d. A planning process that shows goodwill towards the language.

Question 3

How could the public sector support increased use of the Welsh language through its local economic impact?

v. Moving from Cardiff

Welsh organisations that involve the Welsh language and that have their main offices in Cardiff need to devolve. They might include S4C, WJEC, BBC, Welsh Government, the National Museum of Wales, Cadw, the Welsh Language Commissioner and the Welsh Arts Council. The media can be crucial in attracting young workers and an opportunity was lost when Cardiff was chosen as the production location for *Pobol y Cwm* instead of the Gwendraeth valley. Relocating in order to create centres in places such as Caernarfon would transform the economic future of those places.

vi. The education service

It is possible that the education service is the most successful sector when it comes to the distribution of Welsh-speaking workers. The growth of Welsh schools across Wales has secured a Welsh-speaking workforce in every county, in proportion to the population, and there is every indication that this will increase and become an important factor in the survival of the Welsh language as a living language within different communities.

vii. Administration in Welsh

Local authorities across Wales, apart from Gwynedd, use English as the language of administration. Welsh needs to be used as the default language in the more Welsh-speaking areas. This would give the language value, and inspire confidence in it that would extend beyond the workplace.

viii. Driving natural growth

Central planning has a crucial role. Locating organisations in an area introduces relatively senior jobs that lead to more spending. Providing administration and services to organisations create opportunities for jobs at different levels, and is likely to stimulate the local economy.

But the government can only achieve a certain amount. It can create the conditions, but at some point, we have to wait and hope for natural growth.

Some economists argue that emotional factors have a place in economic development, i.e. the idea that the attractiveness of a place in respect of its social life and standard of living in the broadest sense is just as important as financial benefits for attracting business. Put simply, a place needs to be attractive. Cardiff is attractive. We need to create counterpoints to Cardiff that are also attractive. We have suggested that this should start by enhancing the attraction of a town such as Caernarfon. Hopefully this will lead to further improvements— and a wider revival.

The Welsh Language and Economic Development

Cymdeithas yr Iaith (The Welsh Language Society) – Response to the work of the Task and Finish Group

I. Introduction

In our policy response to the Census results, the Welsh Language Society has recognised the importance of the economy and the need to strengthen it in order to reverse the decline in the number of Welsh speakers and Welsh communities.

As an organisation we do not believe in a capitalist economy, favouring an economy based on the needs of people and communities. We see the negative effects of the current system not only on language but on a range of inequalities, including poverty in Wales and worldwide. Ultimately, we believe that the current system needs to be overhauled to achieve a sustainable future for our language and communities.

A Living Manifesto

In our final Living manifesto, we call for a series of measures to strengthen the economy for the benefit of the language:

- The establishment of a network of Welsh-medium businesses that would offer support and leadership in terms of training and starting new Welsh-medium businesses. A Co-operative Federation of Welsh-medium Businesses in Wales should be established to take advantage of the enthusiasm and the activity that already exists in the language on-line, and to promote this being achieved.
- More support (financial and technical) should be given to the co-operative sector, with definite targets for job creation in those areas where the Welsh language is strongest.
- The Government should provide support for companies to move out of growth areas to other places within Wales, and as part of the support agreement, it should ensure that a percentage of the workforce have Welsh language communication skills.
- The Welsh Government, political parties, trades unions and national organisations should prepare an economic strategy that emphasises the devolution of jobs within Wales.
- The establishment of a Welsh Medium Labour Market – work is needed urgently to monitor the need for a Welsh medium workforce in sectors and locations across Wales as well as planning to meet the demand for a workforce with Welsh language skills, including an ambitious Welsh in the workplace training scheme.

- Apprenticeships should be created through the Welsh Medium Labour Market, and Welsh-medium skills training should be organised across Wales, specifically skills for the facilitation of enterprise and community enterprise.
- Changing the Menterau Iaith's terms of reference to be "Menterau Iaith a Gwaith" (Language and Work Initiatives) with a specific responsibility and budget to promote enterprise through the medium of Welsh and promote the use of Welsh within business. Review the remit of some mentrau to reflect examples of best practice in the field.
- Welsh Government, local authorities, the health service and other public services to prepare short term action plans as a starting point for developing and promoting the use of Welsh in the workplace.
- Support and collaboration with trades unions to protect jobs and working conditions in the public sector, and develop an understanding among the public of the importance of these jobs in the rural areas and the Welsh language areas in particular.
- Procurement policies of all publicly-funded bodies in Wales to give priority to companies from the area where the work is being done, and to companies from Wales over companies from further afield – in order to reduce the distance travelled and to ensure that jobs are created in our communities. Small and medium-sized enterprises should also be given more opportunities to receive tenders as well as larger companies.
- Public bodies, including Welsh Government, should follow the example of Gwynedd Council by moving towards operating internally through the medium of Welsh.
- Young people should be pulled more proactively into the agricultural community, including conditions on the single payment that would make it advantageous for older farmers to co-operate with young partners.
- The enforcement of strong and comprehensive Language Standards in order to increase the number of Welsh-medium jobs, and establish the right for the people of Wales to use the Welsh language across the public, private and voluntary sectors, thus normalising the language in every part of life. Through the standards, a clear right should be established for ordinary people, including the right to leisure activities like swimming lessons in Welsh, the right of workers to learn the language and use it in the workplace, and the right of patients to receive healthcare in the language.

- An action plan should be prepared to encourage the employers of Wales, including the public, private and third sectors, to promote the commercial value of using the Welsh language. Encourage the public to support businesses and services who promote the Welsh language and make an effort to use the language.
- Every local authority should conduct research at once to measure the flow and circulation of money in different areas. Conducting such research would lead to better understanding of how exactly their expenditure and their grants affect the well-being of our communities. For example, to what extent does the benefit of public expenditure flow out, rather than circulating in the community, in order to consider which body or company receives public money. In the same way, influential bodies, such as universities, hospitals and local authorities should conduct a detailed audit to ascertain to what extent their current policies, in terms of stocking, buying and contracting, supports the local economy, drawing up a strategy in order to make use of local producers and services. Where figures already exist, they should form the basis for immediate action.
- A new multi-media provider should be established that would widen the audience that listens, watches, and uses their Welsh, and provides a national Welsh-language network, taking advantage of technical convergence to offer a platform for area and community projects. More than a traditional one-way broadcaster, its purpose, without a doubt, would be to strengthen the Welsh language and its communities.

II. Specific Examples – opportunities for change

It is becoming apparent that procurement policy is a big problem for our communities; there are many instances of missed opportunities to keep funds within our communities for the benefit of the local economy.

(a) The National Eisteddfod

Food stalls on the National Eisteddfod field are an example of this as they tend to be provided by companies from outside Wales and, as a consequence, break the Eisteddfod's Welsh language rule in many cases. We also know that the National Eisteddfod has applied for capital funds to buy equipment – such as a large pavilion, a literary pavilion, toilets – that would ultimately save them money, but more importantly, these could be resources for many other events and would keep funds in Wales rather than go to companies outside Wales as is currently the case.

(b) Apprenticeships

Another important example is the lack of opportunities to create Welsh-medium apprenticeships in Wales. Over the last three years, of the 90,477 apprenticeships

financed by the Welsh Government, only 354 were Welsh-medium, less than 4 in every thousand apprenticeships.

(c) Employment / Labour Market Policies

Employment policies that are insufficiently robust lessen the use of the Welsh language in many situations. We see that public bodies can influence the private sector.

Currently, there is no sign of an effort to try to bridge the gap between the Welsh education strategy and the workplace. Torfaen and Merthyr Councils, Cardiff Bus, or the Health Service are examples of bodies which fail to achieve basic services in Welsh despite so much growth in Welsh-medium education. These organisations' problems stem from their employment policies and although a large number of pupils leave school fluent in Welsh, there is no way of ensuring that they continue to use their language skills. This is a mistake when one considers that organisations have a great need for bilingual staff members, but it also means that there are no opportunities for students to continue to use Welsh after leaving education. We see a great opportunity to resolve these problems through the new language standards.

(d) Internal Use

We see a great need to change attitudes and internal policies within many bodies. There are regular examples of businesses with policies to prevent or to discriminate against those who wish to speak Welsh amongst themselves.

The Welsh Language Commissioner's powers are limited in this respect, but it is clear that the business community needs to make an effort on a national level to make significant improvements in businesses' attitudes towards the use of Welsh in the workplace.

We also believe that the language policy of Gwynedd Council and others in terms of conducting internal administration through the medium of Welsh needs to be extended.

(e) Language Standards – an opportunity to strengthen the presence of Welsh within business

The proposed language standards are an opportunity to create an internal labour market and promote the use of Welsh amongst businesses. This group should recognise the importance of the standards in underpinning the position of the Welsh language within business, and the potential to broaden the impact of doing so by extending the scope of the Welsh Language Measure to the private sector as a whole.

We also believe that a network of Welsh-medium businesses should be established that would offer support and leadership in terms of training and starting new Welsh-medium businesses.

(f) Responsibility for the Welsh language within Government

We believe that consideration should be given to transferring responsibility for the Welsh language within Government to the Minister for the Economy or the First Minister in order to strengthen the link between the Government's economic policy and its effect on the language.

III. How could the use of the Welsh language and bilingualism support business growth and economic development?

We believe that the Welsh language has an innate value for the people and communities of Wales, and it is the aspirations and rights of those people and communities that justify safeguarding the Welsh language, not any economic benefits. Indeed, setting 'economic growth' as the principal aim, without ensuring that the growth is sustainable and mutual benefits, can be harmful not only to the language but also to people and communities – sustainable development should be the aim. That is what we have highlighted this in our response to the Sustainable Development Bill, emphasising that the effect of development on the Welsh language is part of the broader environmental impact worldwide.

From an economic perspective, the Welsh language is one of our main areas of expertise in Wales, among young people in particular. We believe that economic benefits will stem from making Welsh essential in more workplaces as it would create internal labour markets, and would bridge the gap between the Welsh-medium Education Strategy and the Strategy for the Welsh language. Our members spend a great deal of time discussing with various bodies, and it is evident that these do not take enough advantage of an increasing number of children's skills when they leave Welsh-medium schools. By creating more jobs where the Welsh language is essential, progression and a strong link between education and the workplace can be ensured.

Success in other countries should be studied in detailed, e.g. the Basque Country, where the growth of the language goes hand in hand with a strong economy. It should also be remembered that expertise relating to Wales isn't limited to safeguarding a national language which is under threat – there are many sectors where good practice can be shared with other countries and regions in Europe and beyond, and where we can sell our services to them.

The proposed language standards offer another opportunity to create business for Wales as the demand for Welsh-medium services creates more work for companies in Wales. The Welsh Government is in an ideal situation to achieve this. The opportunities that will follow these standards and the implications for international companies should be looked at as a way of ensuring that they reinvent in Wales by procuring language training and services.

The creative industries sector is one of 9 key sectors identified by the Government. Devolving broadcasting to Wales would ultimately bring economic advantages. We believe that there is a need to go further and employ the power of the creative industry to promote the use of the Welsh language. That is why our Living Manifesto suggests that a new multi-media broadcaster should be established that would strengthen the sector as well as promote the use of the Welsh language amongst young people.

Tourism is another key sector. Additional benefits could be secured for communities by strengthening the link between tourism and language and culture – developing a model similar to the ecotourism model, where visitors experience and respect the language, would encourage longer visits, local expenditure and would support other key sectors (e.g. agriculture) on a local level.

IV. How could economic development support increased use of the Welsh language?

Outward migration is one of the main factors that undermines the use of the language and the numbers that speak it. It must also be remembered that attracting more Welsh speakers who live outside Wales back to Wales could increase the numbers who speak the language here (and more rapidly than could be done through teaching the language to adults, for example). A statistical analysis shows that outward migration is the biggest factor that contributes to the annual decline in the number of people speaking the language, and that Welsh-speakers who move back here to live is the largest source of new Welsh-speakers in Wales each year.

Providing and safeguarding jobs is therefore vital for the prosperity of the Welsh language, particularly in Welsh-speaking communities. That is why we call for more support (technical and financial) for co-operative enterprises.

We have heard recently of some communities' problems in trying to establish wind farms for the benefit of the community. For example, Hermon and Llanaelhaearn communities have faced problems – including lack of support and high initial costs – in trying to start the energy projects that prevent communities from raising money and creating jobs in the area.

We also believe that there is a need to change the Mentrau Iaith's terms of reference to be Mentrau Iaith a Gwaith (Language and Work Initiatives) so that they can play an increasing role in this area, building and expanding on the commendable work that is currently done by some enterprises.

V. How could the public sector support increased use of the Welsh language through its local economic impact?

We have suggested many ways for the public sector to increase the use of Welsh through the language's effect on the local economy.

Budget

Every penny spent by public bodies has an effect in terms of language. Currently, a large part of that expenditure by Welsh public bodies goes without doubt to promote English, the world's strongest language.

Take one example that became evident following enquiries from the Welsh Language Society – apprenticeships. Our research showed that only 354 of the 90,477 apprenticeships financed by the Welsh Government were through the medium of Welsh over the last three years. And only 0.3% of expenditure on worked-based learning supported Welsh-medium training.

In the Living Manifesto, we have called for a review of the impact of the Welsh Government's budget on the language. We are glad that the Welsh Government has agreed to our recommendation in this respect, although we have concerns regarding the independence of the review and the willingness of the civil service to change.

There are many examples of events that are held by public bodies and sponsored by the Government where the Welsh language isn't in evidence but ought to be.

Procurement Policy

As outlined above, we believe that there is a need to strengthen the procurement policy to this end, as we note in our Living Manifesto. In this respect, establishing the Welsh language as an essential element within any contract gives companies from Wales an advantage and is also of benefit to the future of the language.

Therefore, legislative measures should be considered, in order to ensure that local communities gain greater benefit from public sector contracts.

VI. Examples of best practice for Welsh language employment

We believe that many employers could build on their good work, including Cyngor Gwynedd and many small companies that have their roots in the community. North Wales Police have also taken steps in the right direction.

Bilingualism in the Workplace

Gwyn Jones

The cost of translating a business's documentation into Welsh should be financed by WAGS.

The technical, design & quality of systems & products made in Welsh speaking areas should be given more coverage by the Welsh media. Schools in Welsh speaking areas should increase the number of Technology lessons & exhibit their achievements to the community. Their working items & designs should be given priority. WAGS should set up a special fund to facilitate this scheme. The art work of pupils especially A level should also be exhibited annually in the summer as is done in England. If this means a switch from canu to technology in some of our schools then so be it.

A culture of interest in practical engineering & DIY working models & systems in all Welsh schools must be encouraged as a matter of priority. These schools should also include the history of famous Welsh engineers & scientists.

The Economy and the Welsh Language

Christopher David

The hobby of preserving the Welsh Language has little place in business development. It may benefit the tourist industry in a small way, that's about it. In general though its counter productive, wasting intelligence, money, resources etc. And it upsets many of those considering investing in Wales. If Edwina Hart concentrated on hard core internal and international business development, she might actually achieve something. Though in my view she won't. We need a private public partnership with experienced business people driving policies and action, not an unqualified politician.

Benefits of throttling back the Welsh Language drive include - clarity and the environment, how many unread trees binned every year?

The end of the PC Welsh language nonsense in general, so much time wasted on things that concern, hobbyists, historians and a few tourists.

A crack down on the jobs for the pseudo intellectual boys and galls culture in the Welsh Language environ.

When will "Wales" learn the rest of the world by and large doesn't give a jot? Its there with Morris dancing- fun, interesting, historic but NOT important to the economic development of insular Wales.

Yes this is not evidence, you won't find any to support your cause anyway (but you will manipulate and make up), the whole thing is too juvenile to concentrate too much time to. But is common sense backed by collective experience.

Please wake up and concentrate on achievement will you.

Welsh Language & Economic Development Task and Finish Group

Eiry Thomas

Annwyl/ Dear Mrs Edwina Hart MBE CStJ AM, Elin Rhys and Group Members,

I'm grateful for this opportunity to put forward ideas and recommendations relating to links between the Welsh Language and Economic Development in order to foster a positive relationship.

I am an author and creator of bilingual educational content. My current initiatives includes books, classroom resources and a series of bilingual apps. The creation of the latter has been made possible thanks to the support of the Creative Industries Sector of the Welsh Government.

a) Regarding the use of the Welsh language and bilingualism to support business growth and economic development, I believe that the popularity of, and investment in Welsh-medium and bilingual education could and should reap rewards for both pupils and the Welsh economy. There is currently a drive to enhance numeracy and literacy across the curriculum with much discussion about encouraging programming skills at an appropriately early stage. I see this as an opportunity for collaboration between schools and the I.T. industry to reap short, medium and long-term benefits.

b) Economic development might support the increased use of the Welsh language through employing bilingualism as the norm that celebrates our national identity within a global economic community in a consumer-friendly fashion. To facilitate this, employees with improved bilingual literacy, numeracy, I.T. and programming skills would prove an advantage. Girls, in particular, need to be encouraged to disregard ICT as a subject more suited to boys.

c) If I may outline my personal experience relating to the public sector supporting the increased use of the Welsh language through local economic impact, it is this: I create my literacy and numeracy initiatives bilingually. The support of the Welsh Government has been crucial in terms of being able to afford the creation of bilingual apps. These need to be supplemented by books and classroom resources that I fund myself. There is huge potential for stimulating interest and engagement in both languages through well-researched and executed products in this way. The fact that my products have been assessed as having considerable commercial potential is a bonus in terms of the economy but I'm finding that time restraints restrict the time required to be both creative and a successful business person concurrently. Much time needs to be dedicated to the provision of all materials bilingually, and help with translation is expensive. The upkeep of content and costs relating to bilingual websites is also a factor. Help towards business-related translation would be greatly appreciated.

Tendering processes within the education system are complex and providers of content such as myself would benefit greatly by better insight into how the system works. I have a bilingual initiative on the Hwb platform already and realise that it will take time for lines of communication to be set up so that I might feel more involved.

I regard the opportunities offered by the melding of content between formal education and media education/ entertainment positive in terms of education per se and also in terms of engagement with the Welsh language. Mentors who might bring the strands together would be invaluable in this respect. Input by potentially interested parties as projects evolve could lead to targeted outcomes.

d) I'm pleased to have the opportunity to outline my initiatives as examples that offer Welsh language employment. In the short term, that involves myself, Iwan Rhys – translator, and work undertaken at the NGfL in 2012, alongside non-Welsh speaking collaborators, all based in Wales. Looking to the future, I hope that my work will stimulate enjoyment of and engagement with the language at an early age while improving their literacy and numeracy skills. This, in turn, could translate to better skills being employed in the workforce in future years. Websites that are informative, appealing and well constructed in terms of language is all important in order to attract business.

e) I market myself as a user of the Welsh language by all means possible. It is integral to my business and an example, I hope, of good practice.

f) Regarding the joint promotion of economic development and the Welsh language, I believe that a collaborative team approach at governmental level to consider businesses with the potential to make a global impact would pay dividends and help to introduce Wales to the world in terms of quality products and services. I have an initiative that is being received with incredibly positive responses that could benefit greatly by such a team. This might extend, with the appropriate thrust, to fun, educational theme parks as called for by pupils, teachers and parents. From experience, I'm finding the requirements of researching personnel, departments, grants on offer, tendering etc. time consuming, which can be frustrating. However, I'm indebted and truly grateful to the Creative Industries sector and Business in Focus for their assistance and encouragement along the way. I'm making moves to reach out globally and interest is being expressed internationally. I would like to make the most of the opportunities and to possibly help and encourage start-ups like myself in some capacity. Everything is so new at the outset and it takes resilience to find a way through. I would regard that as an example of making the most of existing skill sets.

SUMMARY

1) Issues relating to enhanced bilingual numeracy and literacy skills being achieved by means of engaging content of quality.

2) Issues relating to the introduction of programming skills into classrooms in collaboration with the I.T. Industry and for girls, especially, to be encouraged in terms of the uptake of the subject.

3) Bilingualism accepted as the norm that celebrates our national identity within a global market.

- 4) Support being of value when time restraints impinge on creative versus business activities, especially for start-up businesses. Help with translation of business-related content would help considerably.
- 5) Tendering process within the education field are complex/ difficult for providers of content to understand.
- 6) Benefits of collaboration between education and the media. Mentors who have experience of both would be helpful in terms of engagement with the Welsh language digitally and through entertainment. Early collaboration leading to targeted outcomes.
- 7) Outline of my start-up company's initial and future plans as an example of securing Welsh language employment.
- 8) Suggestion of a collaborative team approach at governmental level to consider businesses with the potential to make a global impact.
- 9) Assistance provided by the Creative Industries sector Business in Focus greatly appreciated.
- 10) Making the most of existing skill sets.

Evidence to the Consultation on the Welsh Language and Economic Development

Gareth Iwan, Chief Executive, Y Ganolfan Cynllynio Iaith

Introduction

We warmly welcome this consultation. We believe that the future of the Welsh language depends to a very large extent on economic matters. The way that the Welsh language is viewed and used in relation to the economy, as well as the economic viability of Welsh-speaking communities and networks, is crucial to the future of the Welsh language. This has many aspects:

- the way that economic value is given to the Welsh language within economic activity,
 - in terms of staff language skills,
 - as a means of providing services,
 - as an integral part of the product, and
 - as a means of marketing and branding.
- the interrelation between this and language practices within organisations and businesses (and the wider society), e.g. in relation to:
 - the language of customer care,
 - the language of marketing, and Welsh as
 - the language of administration for 'business' purposes.
- the role of the economy in supporting sustainable Welsh communities and networks by:
 - securing sufficient and varied employment opportunities – particularly in north and west Wales, and by
 - increasing employment opportunities which state that Welsh is essential to the post and/or business model, and doing so across Wales.

Current overview

Despite the key role that economic matters have in the viability of the Welsh language, we maintain that scant attention has actually been given to this matter to date – beyond mere sloganizing. The need for research in this area is immense.

It is true that *Menter a Busnes*, as a body, has been crucial in highlighting enterprise within Welsh-speaking networks over the last few decades, and that it has also been successful in administering mainstream economic projects from a bilingual and bi-cultural perspective. Indeed, where there have been successes in terms of linking the Welsh language with economic successes, more often than not, it is the private sector and enterprising individuals that have led the way.

Apparently, a *Language and Economy Group* has been meeting under the auspices of the Government for many years. Unfortunately, we are not aware of any product that has emerged into the public arena as a result of those discussions. We are prepared to be enlightened on this matter.

With some exceptions in the north-west, the evidence that local authorities have taken steps to give due consideration to the link between language and economy in their areas is also extremely limited – even in the south-west. Similarly, regional and national strategists are extremely reticent of including Welsh language viability as a specific strategic objective within their plans. Substantial and significant reference to the Welsh language in economic strategic plans is rare, be it on a county-wide, regional or national level. We believe that this is an integral part of the current problem – the lack of understanding by policy officers at every level of what is meant in relation to language and economy.

The need for an informed discussion

It is easy, perhaps, to hold local and central government officers accountable for ignoring the language aspects of their work as economic development officers. It is doubtful that they ever received even a single day's training or guidance on this matter. How are they expected to develop an economic policy that provides a robust platform for strengthening the Welsh language if they haven't had any guidance in the subject? We believe that there is a great need for much more discussion and dialogue between professional language planners and economic development policy officers. This is the only way we can secure local and regional economic development strategies and plans that can actually strengthen the Welsh language and/or mitigate the impact of economic developments and trends on the language.

We believe that economic development officers should receive robust and detailed guidance about what exactly is meant when referring to the Welsh language in economic development. As a starting point, we suggest the following matters:

- That the Welsh language is a multi-faceted economic asset across Wales.
- That the Welsh language needs to be recognised and developed as a skill for work.
- That the Welsh language needs to be seriously considered as a medium for delivering services and customer care.
- That the Welsh language needs to be viewed as an integral part of the product in a range of different sectors.
- The need to develop businesses in a variety of sectors connected to language, e.g. retail, service industries, tourism, information technology, publishing and the media, health and care services, local government, agriculture, education etc.
- That the Welsh language has huge potential as a medium for marketing and branding.
- The need to promote private entrepreneurship and social enterprises among Welsh speakers and Welsh communities and networks.

Providing in-service training for economic development policy officers in respect of the above matters would be a good starting point to begin mainstreaming the Welsh language in earnest within economic development on all levels.

Only when planners and operators realise the potential of the language for creating economic growth can we begin to address the challenge of ensuring the viability of the Welsh language.

Some practical ideas

Briefly, we suggest some practical ideas below which could be considered when thinking about linking economic development with language planning in Wales:

- Consider establishing an economic development body to focus on the viability of the Welsh language. Such a body could be accountable for specific geographical areas and/or a Wales-wide horizontal function.
- Develop robust criteria to help policy officers assess the contribution of the Welsh language to the local economy and to assess the value (or not) of new economic developments to the viability of the Welsh language.
- Train economic development policy officers in the essentials of relevant language planning.
- Include the Welsh language in a more thorough and central way within policy objectives.
- Consider prescribing and promoting growth areas where specific value is given to developments which value the Welsh language (and provide appropriate support) in order to promote linguistic viability locally and regionally within travel to work catchment areas. The Menai Straits, Porthmadog, Aberystwyth and Carmarthen are some initial suggestions.
- Secure a much more prominent place for the Welsh language within careers services.
- Highlight the gap between local authority education outputs in respect of their role in teaching Welsh to pupils and the language requirements of posts that they themselves advertise.
- Conduct research and thorough development of the link between language and the economy.

Response to the call for views on the Welsh Language and Economic Development, as seen in Y Cymro, 7 June 2013

Medi James

- The following quotation comes from the website “Say Something in Welsh”. It is a perfect example of service in Welsh to a visitor. It is an example of a person who believes that it is completely possible to welcome a visitor to their business by greeting them in Welsh. This business person has to be aware of the importance of the language and is not daunted by it.

Welsh speaking pub in Aberystwyth

OK, well the pub doesn't actually speak Welsh, but the friendly proprietor does. Geraldine (gerryf) had a lovely experience there recently:

After looking around Aberystwyth today, my husband and I went for lunch in a pub called Y Ffarmers which is just outside Aberystwyth. We were immediately spoken to in Welsh by the owner. I was a bit slow with my responses at first but she just kept speaking Welsh in a very relaxed friendly way and after a while it just felt more natural and not odd at all. I told her in Welsh that I was learning Welsh and she said in Welsh that it was a good place to practice (in her pub). So, as well as fantastic food, we had a good workout for our Welsh. If you're in the area it's worth the trouble to get to it just because of the warm welcome, chance to ymarfer siarad Cymraeg and eat amazing food.

- Another example I have is of an employer in an office in Aberystwyth employing a young person from the local comprehensive school (Penglais School), not the local Welsh Medium Comprehensive School, to work as a secretary. Although this girl hadn't had Welsh medium secondary education, and came from a household where the Welsh language was not given any particular attention, she had been immersed in the Welsh language at her primary school. Her employer set strong but fair guidelines on the use of Welsh within the office i.e. to answer the phone bilingually, to start every conversation in Welsh with clients and to practice her 'refreshed' Welsh with the staff who were already Welsh-speaking. Within six weeks she was completely happy and had refamiliarised herself with speaking Welsh naturally and comfortably.

The myth that speaking Welsh emphatically and confidently builds barriers between people 'as we all speak English anyway' must be dispelled. Many more people are in favour of the Welsh language in Wales than there are against it.

Call for Evidence- David Ludlow

Summary

It is difficult to visualise how use of Welsh language could be increased in Economic Development except in tourism where there is a potential benefit as language is part of the culture of Wales & thus increased use (reflecting the requirements of customers) could offer a benefit.

In general economic development terms it is difficult to see where there would be any ROI as virtually all business in Wales is conducted in English (there may be some exceptions in areas where Welsh language is strong). Additional use may also have a negative impact on inward investment, particularly from USA.

With increasing pressures on public sector budgets diverting funds to increase use of Welsh language where there is no evidence of beneficial ROI would seem a retrograde step.

Comments on 'Welsh Language & Economic Development Task & Finish Group.

- a) How could the use of Welsh language & bilingualism support business growth & economic development?

There is not a single response as different sectors will, generally, operate in different ways. The tourism sector may generate a benefit as language is seen as an integral part of the culture of a country. However there is also a need to reflect on the perceptions of visitors, do they expect to be spoken to in English or another language, so an element of Welsh as a place setter could be beneficial and would not generate any negative impact or cost and could be encouraged. However for English speaking visitors there may be an element of negativity as they do not necessarily perceive Wales to be a different country etc. and assume they will be communicated with in English. The basics of the welcome should be in Welsh with an option to incorporate the language into other marketing initiatives with possibly expanded use by attraction and accommodation operators. However it should be noted, for example, that the largest potential growth area for tourism is China and current research suggests they want to be conversed with in their own language.

When considering other business sectors the needs of the customer have to be considered &, as they are unlikely to be Welsh speakers, even those based in Wales will most commonly use English as the language of business, communication with them needs to be in the language they expect & will understand. Hence the need to avoid putting additional costs (for no ROI) into businesses for translation, printing etc., particularly if their main customers are based outside Wales & may see the duplication as costs that may be included in the price they have to pay so look round for an alternative supplier. What may be practical is supporting labelling costs that states 'Made in Wales' in Welsh & English, possibly with a logo. This could raise a positive awareness of Wales as a business location.

I am aware that up until a couple of years ago there were potential inward investors asking if everybody spoke English so language could have an impact on inward investment decisions, particularly from the US where part of past location decisions were made on the basis of UK having a common language.

- b) How could economic development support increased use of the Welsh language?

Taking a hard, financial view of this question it is difficult to see how there could be a positive ROI related to developing the use of Welsh language in Economic Development. It is accepted that the language of business is English so to utilise Welsh on a client group who mainly do not speak the language and almost certainly do not use it in their everyday business would appear to be an unnecessary expense. Most public sector organisations are required to provide information in a bilingual format, and whilst there has been no research to verify the situation, one questions how much of the information provided to residents and business in Welsh simply ends up in a recycling bin, not having been opened or read as the recipients do not use Welsh in their everyday lives and almost certainly not with their clients. To insist that the public sector increases the use of Welsh in Economic Development would only increase costs for translation, printing and recycling for no positive benefit. It is a concern that no public sector body has asked its customers if they would wish to receive information in a single language format & what that language would be. Personal and business experience suggests there is a potential to save costs through not always providing bilingual information whilst recognising the need to provide that information in Welsh if requested. If this generated savings they could be used to assist Council's to provide more business support services than at present.

- c) How could the public sector support increase use of the Welsh language through its local economic impact?
- 1) Ask businesses which language they wish to be communicated in and, if this generates savings, use any savings to support the development and growth of businesses through greater marketing support (either direct to business or the promotion of Wales) or by strengthening public sector business support services.
 - 2) Subtle use of Welsh language in tourism promotion to reinforce the cultural aspects of a visit to Wales.

With regard to points d) I have no comments to make but with regard to point e) it is possible that in strongly Welsh speaking areas there will be examples but it would be difficult to quantify benefit if there is no control group in the same area. Point f) may again have relevance in strong Welsh speaking areas but in general it is difficult to see where the ROI would come from.

I would raise a concern that the general thrust of the 'Call for Evidence' which would appear to be based on the assumption that there is a benefit to be gained without the production of any research or evidence to support this.

In the section headed 'In doing so you may wish to consider' there is mention of;

Procurement policies – does this suggest that contracts will not be let to businesses that do not have a formal Welsh language policy or employ Welsh speakers

Employment policies- does this suggest that there is consideration that there will be a requirement on companies to employ a % of Welsh speakers?

Business support – generally as above

VIEWS ON THE WELSH LANGUAGE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

Clive James

1. Economic development of the Welsh-speaking areas

- Are the problems different in Welsh-speaking areas (or in urban Welsh communities) compared to other areas of Wales. E.g. south Pembrokeshire and Preseli?
- Perhaps the difference is the distance between Welsh-speaking areas and the market, therefore there is a need:
- To ensure the availability of a fast and effective broadband service in all parts of Wales
- To provide an appropriate road network for the 21st century and good local rail services (at least every hour)
- Dispel the planning myth, or eliminate planning obstacles, which inhibit the establishment of small businesses everywhere (note that houses get planning permission everywhere!)
- Within family businesses, often there are no sons or daughters who are interested in taking over. As a result, the business declines as the owner continues, and closes when the owner dies. Identifying these businesses is necessary and providing advice, e.g. recruit a partner that will take over in due course, the workforce to purchase the company, etc. E.g. Llanfrothen co-operative shop and post office opened in another building immediately after the 'front room' shop closed.
- Support children of families with self-employed parents, e.g. farmers, to establish businesses, in unused farm buildings for instance.
- Encourage businesses to grow beyond the threshold for "VAT registration", therefore being able to employ other people (VAT complexities scare many people)
- Ensure that efforts to support start-ups or business growth are introduced free from technical jargon by people who understand how to run small businesses, and quick responses given

2. The benefits of operating through the medium of Welsh

- Gain the support of those within the population who consider it important that businesses operate through the medium of Welsh
- Perhaps business people find that it is easier to operate through the medium of Welsh instead of through English, their second language
- Develop a network of connections with other small businesses locally

Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group

The Federation of Small Businesses Wales

The Federation of Small Businesses Wales welcomes the opportunity to present its views to the Welsh Government's Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group. FSB Wales is the authoritative voice of small businesses in Wales. With 10,000 members, a Welsh Policy Unit, two regional committees and twelve branch committees; FSB Wales is in constant contact with small businesses at a grassroots level. It undertakes a monthly online survey of its members as well as an annual membership survey on a wide range of issues and concerns facing small business.

This submission supplements the oral evidence to the Task and Finish Group given by Iestyn Davies on 22 May 2013.

Background

FSB Wales' most recent research on Welsh language issues was conducted with members in September 2012. (See attached presentation slides.) The research was not in depth but found:

- Approximately one quarter of Welsh businesses use the Welsh language; the majority, to communicate with customers and suppliers.
- Around a fifth of Welsh members would be interested in support to encourage the use of Welsh language within the business.
- Funding support is identified as the most beneficial type of support to aid this.
- Of those businesses that use Welsh, the main usages were marketing (37%), internal communication (33%) and advertising campaigns (33%). There may be some good examples of Welsh language employment among businesses that use the language for internal communications but we lack further detail.
- Likewise, with marketing, advertising and packaging, small businesses see some value in using the Welsh language in this way. Again, further detail is needed.
- In addition to funding support to encourage use of Welsh within business, respondents also identified the need for practical support and guidance. This is an area on which Welsh Government could focus.

Key issues

Welsh Language Standards

There is concern that the new proposed Welsh language standards might have an adverse effect on business. This is due to a lack of clarity on what will be expected from small businesses and the timescale of implementation in any areas that will affect small businesses.

Although the proposed standards cover only the Welsh Government, local government and national parks at present, further standards are expected to follow. Welsh Government could address concerns about the impact on business and avoid

a negative effect on economic development by taking a ‘think small first’ approach to regulation and expectations on language issues that affect small businesses.

FSB Wales would like to see a guidance document clarifying what is expected from small businesses, and any associated timescale for compliance, published alongside the agreed and finalised Welsh Language Standards. Staff from FSB Wales had begun work with the Welsh Language Commissioner on the implications for small businesses of the standards proposed previously.

Structural funds

Following the publication of the Welsh language standards as agreed under the 2011 Measure, FSB Wales believes there will be scope for EU structural funds to be used in ensuring small businesses have the capacity to deliver services to the standards set out by Welsh Government. This is particularly important in policy areas such as procurement, where increasing regulation could leave smaller firms at a competitive disadvantage. Small firms are more likely to be based locally. It is therefore vital that the development of the Welsh language under the 2011 Measure is undertaken in tandem with local economic development.

Co-ordinating research on the Welsh language across Welsh Government

FSB Wales understands that the Welsh Government Labour Market Intelligence Unit is commissioning research on Welsh language skill needs in certain sectors. While this approach towards building an evidence base is to be welcomed, there is a need to ensure that departments within Welsh Government are working together to best effect. For example, the sectors chosen have little correlation to the Welsh Government’s sector-based economic development strategy. It also appears to be taking place in isolation to the Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group’s work.

Any future research projects need to be fully integrated with the work of the Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group and must be completed in the context of the Welsh Government’s economic development strategy.

Future research

Evidence on the role that the Welsh language plays and could potentially play in economic development is limited at present. FSB Wales is in discussion with Dr Martin Rhisiart, University of South Wales, about further research on the value that Welsh language use provides to small businesses.

Tinopolis' Response to the Task and Finish Group on Welsh Language and Economic Development

Background:

Tinopolis is one of Britain's largest independent television companies. We work in all genres – factual, entertainment, sport, drama and digital media. Our programmes are broadcast across the world and we have a significant presence in the global media marketplace. In the USA we produce television programmes for all the top networks.

The Tinopolis group includes some of the most respected names in the television sector. Mentorn Media is the UK's most experienced factual producer. Sunset+Vine is the country's leading independent sports producer. Daybreak is a multi-award winning drama supplier and Pioneer Productions has a global reputation for ground-breaking specialist factual programming. In the USA, A. Smith and Co. is a market leader in factual entertainment and BASE Productions makes cutting-edge factual and factual entertainment programmes. More recently, Passion Distribution and Firecracker have joined the Group – two more highly successful companies which will strengthen Tinopolis' strategy to develop its creative and geographical reach.

We also provide multi-platform programme support, as well as digital resources for the corporate and learning sectors.

However, the company's roots are very important to us. Tinopolis Wales/Cymru is Britain's largest regional independent television company. The word Tinopolis is synonymous with Llanelli, and it is important to us that this unique identity and the company's Welshness are promoted in the name across the world.

A summary of the main points

- Tinopolis is a company which has deliberately chosen Welsh as the language of the workplace – the work brings considerable economic benefits to a disadvantaged area and also has economic benefits for Welsh speakers
- Young people are therefore able to remain in their local area by securing employment through the medium of Welsh, and speaking Welsh in the workplace also normalises the language outside work
- The Government should ensure that disadvantaged areas of rural Wales where the language is in decline have a greater opportunity to secure

procurement contracts – by insisting that economic, geographical and sociological considerations are given due importance

- Economic planning should go hand in hand with the language
- The language should not be viewed as a barrier to development as an international company – understanding the needs of bilingualism and different cultures can be a powerful marketing weapon across the world
- Businesses should receive financial assistance to produce bilingual signs etc. so that the language is entirely visible – this could add to the economic value of the tourist industry in Wales and also help to normalise the language.
- Bilingualism in Wales should define society and community. The Welsh language should not be seen as a barrier to a company's success, but rather as a tool to help it succeed.

- a) How could the use of the Welsh language and bilingualism support business growth and economic development?
- b) How could economic development support increased use of the Welsh language?
- c) How could the public sector support increased use of the Welsh language through its local economic impact?
- d) Examples of businesses that have benefited by marketing themselves as users of the Welsh Language

Tinopolis was established with public funding from S4C to provide new daily programming for the Channel. Our presence in West Wales was part of that contract. It was a deliberate decision to choose a location in great need of jobs and a boost for the Welsh language. Although the original contract has changed several times, as a company we have adhered to our initial deliberate ethos, and in doing so have created significant added value to S4C's funding by creating jobs and strengthening the economy in one of Wales' poorest towns. We have also created good quality opportunities and jobs through the medium of Welsh. This has enabled a number of local young people to remain in the area to work and raise a family. Our use of the Welsh language and the significant investment in the language have never been a barrier to the international development of the company.

Welsh is the language used in our Llanelli offices. This leads to the normalisation of the language for everyone working there. We provide bilingual services but give priority to Welsh as the company's language of operation.

This deliberate use of the Welsh language is not a barrier. There is a tendency in Wales to think that only public companies require the use of Welsh, but we have shown that Welsh is also valuable to a substantial private company. An important aspect of our brand across the world is that Tinopolis is a Welsh language company, and this helps to make us different and stand out from the rest.

One of the most important steps the Government could take when considering economic development and the language is to insist that procurement contracts include linguistic considerations. This would improve the opportunities for companies in more Welsh-speaking areas to procure work – especially as these are some of the most deprived areas where there is a serious shortage of work. Linguistic advantage could therefore be important for disadvantaged groups in Wales and also lead to the normalisation of Welsh as a living language in the workplace.

Has the public sector throughout Wales failed to consider ways of normalising the Welsh language? Is too much emphasis placed on the need to translate procurement requirements or documents from English into Welsh purely as a box-ticking exercise rather than ensuring that Welsh is a central consideration, especially in the former language strongholds which are now devoid of industry and work? Economic development of this nature could also increase the use of Welsh.

Tinopolis is an important international company, but the company's roots are in Carmarthenshire and the use of the Welsh language is important to us when marketing across the world. The Welsh language is given prominence on the company's business cards and correspondence and helps to make us different. It defines us in a unique way and creates an important identity for the company.

In Wales we are guilty of viewing English as the important language and Welsh as a regional minority language. But other countries are used to bilingualism and the need to be sensitive to different cultures. This has been particularly evident in the United States, where our ability to demonstrate that we understand minority needs has added to our appeal, despite the fact that English is the principal language spoken there. This identity forms a vital part of the company's marketing and its increasing success.

e) Examples of best practice for Welsh language employment

Normalisation of the language in the workplace undoubtedly leads to normalisation of the language in the lives of staff outside the company too. We have a very deliberate policy of promoting the use of Welsh by making the language the day-to-day language of the workplace. There is no doubt that a number of young staff members would choose to converse in English if they weren't working for a company with a Welsh language policy. As a consequence, these young people come to see

the personal economic benefit of the Welsh language. They have good jobs, and one of the requirements is their ability to speak Welsh. We have noticed that the Welsh language then becomes a way of life for them outside the workplace too – the language spoken with partners, or when deciding to pass on the language to their children because of its economic value.

Not everyone who comes to work for Tinopolis in Llanelli is able to speak Welsh. But as Welsh is the language of our business, especially when producing programmes for S4C, the language of the workplace is also Welsh. As a company, we invest in Welsh lessons for staff unable to speak the language, and pay for Welsh improvement courses in the workplace for less confident Welsh-speaking staff members. Non-Welsh speaking staff members are encouraged at all times to speak Welsh, and soon develop the confidence to speak the language to studio guests and others.

Consequently, the language becomes something entirely natural. But it is also much more than that. We are providing a new skill for individuals which means, should they ever leave Tinopolis to work for another company or on a freelance basis, they have an additional skill which may lead to greater opportunities.

It is public money which pays for S4C. By operating in this manner with regards to the Welsh language, S4C not only provides economic benefits for Carmarthenshire, but also immeasurable linguistic benefit.

f) Suggestions that facilitate the joint promotion of economic development and the Welsh language

One of the most important steps would be for the Government and Councils to see economic and linguistic development working hand in hand – not by providing dull documents, but by making the language a relevant condition. Procurement contracts have a right to insist that economic, geographical and sociological considerations are important. Demonstrating the importance of the language could also give small companies a better chance – and isn't Wales renowned for its tradition of entrepreneurial small companies? These companies are in danger of being hindered by procurement requirements which work against the Welsh and in favour of large multinational companies.

Bilingualism in Wales should define society and community. Welsh should not be seen as a hindrance to a company's success, but rather as a tool to help it succeed. The largest private supermarkets in Wales have seen the commercial benefits of having Welsh signs, and this helps to normalise the language. A company like John Lewis – and it is important to remember in this context that John Lewis is one of the most successful large shops – has embraced the Welsh language. They have shown respect for the language by using correct and easy-to-understand Welsh signs on the shop floor and in the back offices. They ensure that they employ staff who can speak Welsh (again providing economic benefit for individuals in Wales) and participate enthusiastically in Welsh language events, e.g. partnerships with Literature Wales when holding activities in the shop. This is part of their deliberate strategy to be a part of the community – leading to economic benefits for the company.

Grants should be made available so that all companies in Wales can have bilingual signs and provide Welsh lessons for staff. Economic benefit should be the obvious rationale for the grants, as well as the benefit of normalising the Welsh language. A prominent use of Welsh would also be a strong marketing tool for the tourist industry – and make Wales an attractive country, different from any other.

There is no doubt, however, that the biggest contribution the Government could make is to ensure that economic planning goes hand in hand with the language in its former strongholds. This would safeguard rural Wales and also help to keep the language alive. Wales is too small to have its jobs and economic benefits centralised in Cardiff. Rural Wales desperately needs economic activity, and it is important to ensure that procurement contracts offer a deliberate advantage to such areas. Using public money already in the hands of the Government for economic planning in rural Wales could help to keep young people and families in those areas, keep schools open and provide work for teachers, and create new small economies to provide the facilities needed, e.g. small shops and businesses. It would make entrepreneurship easier. It would enable serious steps to be taken to try to prevent the language from losing further ground by bringing the language and the economy together. Most importantly, it would make Wales a fairer country for everyone.

Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group

John Roston, Welsh Music Foundation

Background to Welsh Music Foundation.

Welsh Music Foundation is a not-for profit company core funded by Welsh Government (EST). WMF is the the Music Industry Development agency for Wales. Established in 2000 its mission statement is :

Welsh Music Foundation assists, develops and advocates for a sustainable music sector in Wales, working with any Wales based music enterprise or practitioner, regardless of genre or language, that has - or is developing - a commercial focus to its activities.

The wider aim is an innovative Welsh music economy that creates and sustains jobs; retains, exploits and exports its IP, reinvests into Wales and attracts further inward investment in Welsh talent and enterprise

Evidence to Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group.

Summary

This submission evidences that :

1. Welsh Music Foundation's work through its Welsh Language Strategy to support and develop the Welsh Language Music Sector in Wales has been a huge success for the sector in achieving sustainable growth, the creation of jobs and creation and safeguarding of businesses. That the strategy is not core-funded by EST. That policy should be adopted to core-fund that strategy through EST recognising its economic worth and potential.
2. That the market has changed for the music industry and that presents great opportunities for those working in the Welsh language to work internationally. That WMF's work through their new Cerdd Cymru Music Wales partnership with Arts Council Wales should be resourced to develop those opportunities for welsh language music businesses and artists with aspirations to achieve the 'Canadian Model'.
3. That music clusters in Wales should be created or supported through a wider creative cluster strategy with Welsh language music businesses integral as it would present new opportunities for those businesses in Wales and the UK.

Narrative

When Welsh Music Foundation was established in 2000 it didn't offer any support to the Welsh Language Music Industry. After lobbying, and then financial support was offered from the Welsh Language Board, a Welsh Language Officer position was co-funded in WMF. The success of that position is evidenced by KPIs from the Welsh language officer. The data of the number of enquiries received and support given to Welsh language music businesses are :

2009/10 298

2010/11 582

2011/12 631

2012/13 748

It's evident that WMF's work in the Welsh language sector is achieving sustainable growth. This funding, however, comes to an end of its three years term in 2014. Welsh Music Foundation would welcome a more joined-up approach to offer both specialist business and strategic support to the Welsh Language Music Industry through a continued policy of economic development and recognition that this sector needs specialised business support.

The music industry has changed. Where once a song – the heart of the music industry - needed to be physically manufactured, manufacturing is now an option, a bonus or a premium commodity, rather than a necessity. Digital technologies enable those close to the song - artists, musicians and associated music businesses - to become global at the push of a button. For those working in music in the Welsh Language, this is an exciting new opportunity. It opens the doors to a world where English is not a first language. Where language in music is not a consideration. Where 'World' music is, instead, any music produced in a country's mother tongue.

For the Welsh Language Music Industry, that means the market is no longer Wales. Nor does it now require the huge expense associated with entering a new market. Welsh Government already offers some business support to businesses wanting to work overseas. The Overseas Business Development Fund is an example of good practice which also supports, and works, for the music sector. However, Welsh Government's support in helping identify key people in international markets is lacking when it comes to music. What is needed is specialist support, funded by Welsh Government and provided through the Welsh Music Foundation's new international partnership with Wales Arts International – Cerdd Cymru Music Wales. This support would help Wales based music businesses to identify and strategise in choosing international markets; and would offer extended support, through CCMW, in building relationship with key business individuals in those priority markets, to mirror the good practice that WAI and British Council have in identifying key individuals associated with the arts and their practice internationally. It would also

then bring Welsh Government's economic development support for music businesses in line with the support available to musicians and artists through Wales Arts international, to deliver the best opportunities, particularly when partnerships can be made between artist excursions and business missions.

Offering specialist support to Welsh Language musicians and music businesses in this way would lead to growth for existing businesses, and stimulate the creative music economy in Wales to develop with both Wales facing and international aspirations. This good practice has been established with huge success in Canada. Canada has seen year-on-year growth in the music sector; creation of new Canadian music businesses; increased retention of rights within Canada and exploitation of those rights internationally; strong sustainable public-private partnerships; growth of the use of French in Quebec (where it's the first language) and in the country more broadly; and new initiatives, such as the Polaris Music Prize, the music export initiative Canadian Blast, touring funds and more, all which have international reach.

A policy of supporting the Welsh language music sector should also be a part of any wider policy of support for creative industry clusters in Wales. There's much evidence on the benefit of business clusters, but far too little happening to support, initiate or advocate creative clusters in Wales, of which Welsh language music businesses could and should be an integral part. Not only would this recognise that the Welsh Language Sector shares many similarities with the wider music sector, it would also reinforce that it has its own specialisms; opportunities and obstacles. Being part of a wider music cluster, especially one working in English which often engages, in the first instance, with England, would help create opportunities for the sector to work in England, where applications and understanding of those specialisms could be applied across the UK music (and other) industries. Like all strong clusters, it would assist with inward investment from UK bodies, and help present Wales and Welsh language music to (often) London based, centralised organisations. All such presence and new networks would lead to increased opportunities for establishing or maintaining sustainable businesses and to economic growth within the music (and associated) sectors from Wales.

The Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group

Response Elwyn Jones, Chief Executive, Welsh Books Council

As the body responsible for developing and promoting the publishing industry in Wales, the link between the Welsh language and economic development is central to the work of the Books Council and to the future of the industry.

The Council was established in 1961 with the initial aim of providing Welsh language reading material for children, and over the years its responsibilities have expanded to cover all the requirements of the publishing industry in both languages.

As well as offering specialist services for the publishing industry in areas such as editing, design, promotion and information services (which in themselves strengthen the infrastructure of the book market and professionalise the industry), the Council administers grants that are channelled through the publishers. The Council also runs a self-sufficient Distribution Centre which has an annual turnover of approximately £4m (gross) and distributes books to independent bookshops, retail chains, supermarkets and tourist sites. The annual turnover for Welsh material is approximately £2.3m (gross).

The effort to maintain the number of books sold is supported by a small team of school representatives and officers who regularly visit shops, schools and libraries, to display material and take orders. The Council also organises generic promotion campaigns including advertising campaigns for print and television as well as book supplements such as Llyfrau'r Haf and Gwledd y Nadolig (Summer and Christmas Supplements).

Although reading material in Welsh, as a minority language, depends greatly on public grants, we would also emphasise that the grants distributed to the publishers are based on a funding model which is linked to securing sales. It can be seen, therefore, that the sale of books is essential for the future of publishers, booksellers and the Books Council alike.

We estimate that approximately 1,000 people are employed within the publishing industry in Wales, as publishers, printers, booksellers, self-employed individuals who work within editing and design, as well as organisers of literary festivals. It could therefore be estimated that around 50% of these individuals are dependent on the Welsh language book trade.

Several people have referred to the structure of the Council as an appropriate one for promoting small Welsh industries with the Books Council, as the central body, distributing small grants, offering specialist services and maintaining a central distribution system to promote the whole industry. This is a service that only a central, national body can offer and it is viewed as a means of supporting and promoting the industry.

We believe that this success is highlighted by the results of the review by Beaufort Research in 2012 into patterns of reading and buying Welsh books (this review will be published in the near future) that show an increase in the number of Welsh book readers in comparison with figures for 2003 and 2006. We feel that expanding the pool of Welsh readers is a direct result of the Council's policy and Government investment to broaden the range of reading material by investing in new authors as well as experienced ones.

Furthermore, book sales continued through the Distribution Centre (which has Welsh and English books) during the last financial year despite the challenging economic climate. Sales analysis indicated that the turnover of the main Welsh bookshops increased by 1% compared to a decrease of approximately 6% throughout Britain. Welsh books for children saw the largest increase.

A great many of the Council's main partners, whether publishers or booksellers, are located in rural, Welsh-speaking areas, and they are often seen as natural language centres within their communities. The Welsh bookshops are also important selling points for music, cards and crafts, and they contribute enormously to success in these areas.

Internet sales are a challenge for high street shops throughout Britain and the Council has developed a plan to offer commission to independent bookshops as the readers buy books (either printed books or e-books) through the Council's central website, gwales.com – thus increasing traffic on the website. This again is seen as a national structure that offers practical support to local businesses.

As part of the Council's central organisation, the public sector, through the schools and libraries, are able to order books from our School Officers, and the orders are then channelled through the local shops. The majority of these orders are now received electronically.

The majority of the Council's staff are required to speak Welsh. Where some specialist skills are needed, it has been possible for the Council to secure support for those workers to attend intensive courses. One head of department was appointed to her post on condition that she would learn Welsh – and she did so during a sabbatical period of three months.

We hope that some local businesses, whether publishers, printers or booksellers, respond to this review. Please feel free to contact us if we can be of any further assistance.

Gwyn Roberts

How could the use of the Welsh language and bilingualism support business growth and economic development?

At a micro level, use of the Welsh language supports business growth & development in two ways:

- a) It encourages customer focus. Any provider of services to Welsh consumers should be aware that some consumers will prefer to engage through the medium of Welsh. The exercise of understanding consumer preferences and analysing the ability of the organisation to meet those expectations is a fundamental precondition to successful marketing. Those principles can then be used when considering other aspects of product / service design and expansion to new markets.
- b) The European market (and indeed other areas of the globe) is characterised by linguistic fragmentation. A business which has designed itself to operate bilingually will already have addressed the issues (such as service design, sales & customer support, etc) which would need to be considered when targeting a new market.

In summary, operating bilingually is not a precondition for a business to be successful in Wales; but it is an indicator that a company may be managed thoughtfully and with a good understanding of customer needs.

At a macro level, in the creative industries (as well as other sectors such as food), there is a consumer trend towards appreciation of authenticity and particularity. Tolerance of foreign language TV shows, for example, has increased with the success of drama from Scandinavia, France, etc. The Welsh language can be promoted within the “Wales brand” as a differentiator and identity underpinning specific output by businesses.

b) How could economic development support increased use of the Welsh language?

Economic development is critical to provide employment opportunities which will encourage people, particularly young people, to stay in their communities and in Wales generally, rather than migrate elsewhere. This issue is particularly acute for those communities which have a large proportion of Welsh speakers.

Secondly, economic development in sectors which draw on the traditional strengths of, or which are well represented by, Welsh speakers (for example animation, performing arts, broadcasting and media production, etc) will reinforce those sectors as stable providers of employment.

c) How could the public sector support increased use of the Welsh language through its local economic impact?

The public sector could seek, over a suitable period of time allowing for adjustment & training, to ensure that customer-facing activities are provided bilingually. This would send a signal to the labour market that Welsh language skills are valuable.

Secondly, in procurement exercises, the public sector could place more emphasis on the ability of tenderers to support transactions in the Welsh language. This would have a broader benefit of increasing the Welsh economy's share of total Welsh public sector expenditure on commercial services.

f) Suggestions that facilitate the joint promotion of economic development and the Welsh Language

Linguistic experts agree that the future of the Welsh language is inextricably linked with its status as a natural and living language in the community – which means that the condition of Welsh in its “heartlands”, those communities where it is still spoken by a significant majority, is critical.

A joint approach to economic development & the language would prioritise generating quality employment in those areas – for example, they could be singled out as “special economic zones”, and parts of the public sector, such as shared service centres, could be located / relocated in those areas. It would also look at how well those communities are integrated with markets – in other words, it would consider transport links, broadband access and other drivers of cost with the specific objective of ensuring that Welsh language communities are not at a relative disadvantage as potential locations for investment and job creation.

Economic support (repayable finance etc) could also be allocated using guidelines which address more specifically the potential impact on the language of a given sector or indeed project. Note that I would not advocate “minority rights” approaches as used in the USA, South Africa, etc as these are too likely to result in market distortion and misallocation of public funds.

Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group - Call for Evidence –

Terry Ballard Submission on behalf of RWE UK Summary

RWE is a major investor in Wales and makes a significant contribution to the Welsh Economy both directly as an employer and indirectly in its procurement of goods and services.

We recognise the cultural and historic value of the Welsh language and have actively supported the National Eisteddfod. RWE in the UK has to compete with other opportunities across Europe for limited investment funds in the present economic climate. We are not persuaded that the Welsh language will currently act as an incentive to invest in Wales. However it is our view that a stable regulatory, planning and political climate could attract further investment throughout Wales. Where this investment is in Welsh-speaking communities, the local economic impact would support them and the continuing viability of the Welsh language.

Comments

This response is on behalf of the RWE companies currently active in Wales. This includes RWE Generation SE, which pools RWE's generation entities and engineering expertise across Europe, RWE npower renewables, one of the UK's leading renewable energy developers and RWE npower, the UK energy retail business who supply a number customers in Wales, most notably TATA and Welsh Water (Dwr Cymru)

Over the past few years, the RWE group has made investments of around £3bn in Wales. This includes a state of the art 2GW CCGT plant in Wales, 750MW of offshore wind capacity in Gwynt Y Mor, Rhyl Flats and 150MW of onshore wind capacity. Further onshore wind capacity is currently in the planning and/or construction phases. In addition RWE owns and operates the Aberthaw power station which, through support for the Welsh Coal industry, contributes approximately £75m to the local economy.

We have also been active participants in a number of schemes in Wales to deliver energy efficiency measures to vulnerable customers.

As a result of these initiatives RWE employs over 500 people within Wales. These are based at many locations throughout Wales including Pembroke, Aberthaw, Baglan, LLanidloes, Mostyn, Angelsey and Dolgarrog. We have developed a Wind Turbine Technician Apprenticeship scheme which will create highly-skilled, long-term opportunities, and is delivered through a small network of local colleges in north and south Wales. We also have craft apprenticeship schemes at our two fossil fuelled power stations whose skills range across mechanical and electrical disciplines.

In addition a significant number of employment opportunities have been created in infrastructure such as port facilities and indirectly by our contractors ranging from small catering firms to large steel fabrication companies.

We recognise the cultural and historic value of the Welsh language and its importance to a significant proportion of the people living in Wales. In recognition of this we supported the National Eisteddfod of Wales in **2012** when it was held near to our power station at Aberthaw. As a Pan-European company with limited investment funds, any opportunity to invest in Wales has to compete with other opportunities throughout Europe. The level of investment attracted to Wales will depend on the level of confidence in the country's regulatory, planning and political backdrop. The Welsh Government can help by:

- Providing additional support and resources to local planning authorities to manage energy planning applications in a timely and efficient manner.
- Ensuring a consistent application of Welsh Energy Policy throughout Wales and that a full consultation takes place before any proposed changes to planning standards.
- Encourage a pragmatic application of the Industrial Emissions Directive by National Resources Wales,
- Ensuring that any requirements under the Welsh Language provisions are implemented in a proportionate manner.

We are not persuaded that the Welsh Language and bilingualism will currently support business growth and economic development or act as an incentive to attract investment to Wales for larger companies such as ourselves. It could be argued that any regulations that result in over prescriptive requirements for the use of the Welsh language may encourage potential investors in large scale projects to go elsewhere particularly when English is seen as the international language of business.

However we do support the view that a stable climate that encourages investment in Wales would deliver high quality jobs and with this, increased local employment opportunities, thereby resulting in an increased use of the Welsh language through its local impact.

As an illustration of the economic benefits of investment, RWE has recently been granted planning permission to construct a wind farm at Mynydd y Gwair, Swansea. Independent studies have estimated that construction of the wind farm could potentially generate up to £12 million in Wales with £8.5 million of this being invested in South and West Wales.

During construction, the project could generate up to 104 full time equivalent (FTE) jobs each year in Wales. During its operation, the project could also create a further £12 million for the South and West Wales region and support 19 Welsh jobs.

We would expect similar advantages would accrue if such a project was to be undertaken in a predominately Welsh speaking area.

Investment of this type, particularly in more rural areas of Wales can provide a wide range of employment opportunities across the skill spectrum. This will encourage cohesive local communities, which if they are Welsh-speaking, will support the use of

the Welsh language. Providing good quality, highly skilled jobs will also lead to employment opportunities for university-educated young people to return to Welsh speaking communities thus maintaining their language skills and ensuring that the Welsh language and culture is valued and strengthened.

The result will be thriving, sustainable Welsh speaking communities which would provide the impetus for growth and development of the language throughout Wales.

Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group

Name Witheld

Summary

The increasing anti English attitude as promoted needs to be changed if the whole of Wales is not going to go the way Gwynedd has gone. Minutes from a council meeting clearly stating that pressure was put on a third party to apply pressure to a private company to use only Welsh and then the chairperson stating: **The Chair expressed his disappointment with the company's response, and he emphasised that they should be humiliated for disrespecting the Welsh language.** Any inward investor seeing these minutes would immediately start looking elsewhere and this is only one example because of the word restrictions, then there is the thought of what goes on behind closed doors if this is just an example of council minutes in the public domain.

Welsh Language and Economic Development

To develop and deliver a strategy for jointly promoting the Welsh language and economic development is a contradiction in that the facts show that compulsory Welsh in **Gwynedd and Anglesey** has put off inward investment compared to the rest of the UK, dropped the standard of English education, made it difficult if not impossible to recruit senior staff and according to a press article increasing the number of businesses wanting to move out if they could afford it. Compared to the 1980's when Wales was doing well against North East England, now we have fallen well behind them and it can only be because of the hard line Welsh Language policies and the way they are interpreted.

In Gwynedd the Welsh Language policy has increased anti English attitudes, marginalizing the English speaking majority and gives youngsters no future unless their Welsh is good enough for the public sector or they leave Wales. Fact - you can't even recruit senior hospital staff. Fact - RAF Valley pays for their children to go to private schools because the MOD say our schools are sub-standard. Bi-lingual teaching for under eights does not exist in Gwynedd. Parents and grandparents like me save the Welsh education system by teaching our children English but still the educational standards are falling behind the rest of the world according to statistics and the bad things done in our schools have been intellectually justified.

There are a large number of small business owners who are approaching retirement age and fewer new businesses replacing them. Does the whole of Wales really want to become like Gwynedd? Give businesses what they want including freedom of choice.

Just one experience I had: When no translation facilities were provided at a public business meeting and I complained; I was told in no uncertain circumstances that if I had my business in France then I would have to learn French, if I don't want to learn Welsh then get my business out of Wales.

FACT: Everything the Welsh Assembly Government touches is a mess because too many Politicians with no real life experiences. Instead of asking for ideas how to help development, you have to add the Welsh Language which excludes a lot of business innovators and rubs non-Welsh speakers up the wrong way. Your self-centered attitude is killing real hope for our children's future and the sad fact is you don't want to even discuss it.

Wales needs freedom of choice and this freedom must be extended to all parents to be able to choose Welsh or English medium education for their children, and free of state dogma and compulsion.

Economic Development and the lowering standards of English Language do not go together and Wales will only go down further compared to the rest of the world. Welsh education is crumbling and is producing generation after a generation of children with hardly any literacy or for that matter numeracy (Welsh children's educational performance is now worse than any other part of the UK and worst in the entire EU).

You need to think how to save Wales from inevitable and perhaps perpetual demise into a third world status, Wales needs to be seen that it is open for business.

Welsh language measures have created a Ruling Elite drawn from the Welsh Nationalist element that represents a fraction of the Welsh population. These people have taken a disproportionate level of public jobs by simply imposing the Welsh language as an essential job requirement and again we can find no mandate in the hands of the governing political party or satisfactory grounds to justify this situation and one which is unprecedented on international level.

One Gwynedd council meeting minutes clear shows the attitude of those in charge, I think it's illegal – certainly unethical – and also a breach of standards but Gwynedd Council have a different set of standards and any rational person considering inward investment would look at this and run a mile. The way Wales is going it's Gwynedd today – Wales tomorrow:

http://www.gwynedd.gov.uk/ADNPwyllgorau/2012%20hyd%20at%20fis%20Mai/Is-Bwyllgor%20laith/2012-03-06/english/04_01_Minutes%20of%20the%20last%20meeting.pdf

(vi) Referring to the complaint that Padarn Bus Company displayed the words "Gwynedd Hospital" on the front of their buses, the Equality and Language Officer explained that the hospital had been asked to contact the company since the bus route in question was not under contract to this Council. This had happened, but it did not seem that the hospital would be taking the matter further in light of the company's response that visitors would not be aware of Ysbyty Gwynedd's name. Members noted that they did not accept the company's argument since "Ysbyty Gwynedd" was the hospital's official name. The Equality and Language Officer agreed to report back further on this. **The Chair expressed his disappointment**

with the company's response, and he emphasised that they should be humiliated for disrespecting the Welsh language.

Because of threats to others who have spoken out in the past and the threats in the council minutes above I request that my details are kept secret for fear of reprisals.

Welsh language and economic development

John Nicholson – Bio-Power

Summary:

1. The Welsh language does not in any way help economic development. It does just the opposite...
 - a) it puts a huge burden of cost upon local government through the cost of translating and publishing documents in two languages
 - b) it discourages skilled and professional people from coming to work in Wales, therefore depriving us from high levels of public and professional service
 - c) it discourages inward investment, so much needed to create jobs and real wealth.
2. Nothing should ever prevent any two people from communicating with each other in any shared language of their choice – including both Welsh and English.
3. People living in Wales should not be at any disadvantage in terms of accessing available resources or services because the language they chose to speak.
4. Throwing huge sums of public money into Welsh language schemes is simply trying to force life into a dead language. The fact is that everyone understands and can communicate in English, and English is increasingly a language shared throughout the world. The Welsh language can only be a quaint historic anomaly, and it will never take a commanding communication role in our future development.
5. There should not be any pressure put upon people to use Welsh. It should be entirely a matter of individual choice.
6. It should always be remembered that every person cannot change two fundamental things, namely where they were born and who their parents are. It is therefore ridiculous to prejudice people on the basis of their birthplace or their family upbringing.
7. Our task should be to develop integrated cohesive communities, and not to divide people into two distinct groups, 'local born & bred Welsh' and 'English in-migrant' etc.

I have operated several businesses in most areas of Wales. It is very clear to me how different the attitude to the Welsh language is in different areas of Wales. I have also served as a local councillor and witnessed the extent of prejudice operated against those members of the community who are not Welsh speakers. I have also found on many occasions deliberate action to frustrate business conducted in

English or by people who are known not to communicate in Welsh. All of these things do great harm to the local economy and the overall creation of wealth.

It will be interesting to read any claims made in response to this consultation that the Welsh language can bring economic benefit. Whilst the provision of translation and similar services in Welsh most certainly will provide employment and economic benefit to a small number of people, the overall effect of this is to put a burden of cost upon the wider community.

I challenge every submission claiming that the Welsh language brings economic benefit to prove that the use of Welsh increases overall long term wealth, and is not simply a drain upon resources.

My view is that the Welsh government should stop all funding to support or promote the Welsh language. People should be able to speak in what ever language they want to, and for the majority by far this will be English. All primary schools should operate primarily in English so that children are given a proper grounding in English, and are able to compete in the UK wide employment market. Support should be focused upon developing and strengthening solid creative businesses that provide products and services that meet expressed needs.

It is a myth that simply creating jobs will increase economic growth and create wealth. In order to achieve growth jobs must be economically productive. Continually digging up a road and re-laying the surface may employ lots of people, but it will not create economic growth unless it serves to efficiently repair a faulty road and at an affordable cost. Likewise translating texts from English into Welsh and vice versa does not create any economic wealth. It is a drain upon resources that should be better used in addressing real needs.

The best way to keep the Welsh Language 'alive' (in other words more widely used), is to ensure that there are plenty of economically beneficial jobs in Welsh speaking areas. This will help to prevent existing Welsh speakers from leaving the area to find better paid or more meaningful jobs outside the area.

Sooner or later the people of Wales will have to face a big decision, 'What is most important? a) to secure economic growth leading to greater wealth for all of Wales, OR b) to continue spending public money trying to force people to use the Welsh language'. The sooner this decision is faced the better.

If under the new powers granted to the Welsh Assembly Wales strives to become more independent and self sufficient then all resources should be directed to projects that will provide a guaranteed positive outcome in terms of economic benefit. Dreams of an all Welsh Language speaking nation don't come into this category.

A Press under Pressure?

A submission by Dalen Newydd Ltd. to the Task and Finish Group on the Welsh Language and Economic Development

19 June 2013

1. The position of the Welsh-medium press and its future are subjects very relevant in any consideration of the Welsh Language and Economic Development.
2. The Government's decision regarding Y Byd, February 2008, remains a disappointment and a mystery. Three members of Dalen Newydd Ltd. were shareholders in Dyddiol Ltd. but were already working on an alternative and parallel scheme aimed at filling another gap in Welsh journalism. The intention was to publish a chain of give-away Welsh-language papers, starting in Anglesey and the old county of Caernarfon.
3. The fact remains, a newspaper – a real newspaper made of paper – is something solid. A language community of half a million should be able to support three or four daily papers. But what is to be done when two English papers in Wales, the Western Mail and the Daily Post, are facing difficulties, the result partly of an economic recession and partly of a serious fall in circulation coupled with the challenge of another technology?
4. The sobering 2011 statistics seem to indicate that stabilisation must be the priority in any Strategy for the Welsh language. In fostering a sense of 'possessing' a language, and thus its stabilising as part of everyday life, no actor can be more important than literacy and regular reading. This is why, over a large area of Wales, the contribution of papurau bro (community newspapers) since the early 1970s has been crucial. These, without any doubt, have been Wales' greatest cultural success in the latter years of the 20th century, they have been an anchor to the Welsh language in the face of many destabilizing influences.
5. The aim of Dalen Newydd was, and will continue to be if circumstances prove favourable, to publish two local weekly Commercial papers, Tarian Arfon and Tarian Mon. We would emphasise that these would be local newspapers, not papurau bro; they would be on a par with the Holyhead & Anglesey Mail or the Caernarfon Herald, not with Llais Ogwan or Papur Menai. 32-page pilot copies were produced, for use in a survey of advertising sources in both areas. Distribution would be free, through contract, aiming at a circulation of 30,000 (17,500, Arfon; 12,500 Mon). Tarian Arfon would serve the old county of Caernarfon, being parts of the present counties of Gwynedd and Conwy; Tarian Mon the whole of Anglesey. The foundation would be the audience created by papurau bro; we would build on this, working towards what would be, to all intents, a weekly National Welsh-language press with a wide audience, existing in the form of a series of local versions.

6. The conclusion on 'The Bianchi Report' (2008) cannot be ignored: 'The Welsh printed news sector is fragmentary, poor and too incomplete to satisfy even the most basic demands of the modern reader for information about the Society in which he lives. ... There is no Welsh-language print medium for news properly so called.'

7. With the exception of public notices, there is no National Welsh fund of advertising. WAG notices, with those of local authorities and some other public bodies, are essential to the Survival of the daily and weekly English-language press in Wales today. This was clearly demonstrated in the valuable report of the Cardiff School of Journalism, The Regional and Local Media in Wales (2006).

8. The other choice would be a direct grant, as is made available in some Welsh-Language Publications through the Welsh Books Council, but on a much higher scale. The working-part will be aware of the difficulties involved. In Dalen Newydd we have consistently stressed that we did not wish to depend on grants, something different in principle from accepting public notices as custom. The Welsh-language papers, exactly like the English papers, would need to offer a circulation giving value for money to all advertisers, private and public alike. Dalen Newydd would turn every stone to obtain Commercial advertising, and we have pioneered by visiting some 500 leading Business in Anglesey and Caernarfonshire.

9. We should like to think that Tarian Mon and Tarian Arfon could initiate a chain of weekly Welsh-language papers covering the greater part of Wales and offering a large circulation (1000,000 as a possible target). Looking forward, one possibility might be twice-weekly Publications (perhaps once for sale and once free), and who knows but that a way might lead from there towards the aim of a daily press – an aim which, willynilly, sooner or later, must be achieved.

10. We would not discount the possibility of an understanding with another Group of company if that were seen to be a way of Building a large circulation either for general advertising or (more appropriately perhaps) for National public notices only. (As for local Commercial advertising and public notices, the two groups would operate independently, and would be editorially quite independent.) One option would be co-operation between (a.) Taruannau Mon-Arfon, with more intense coverage witting a limited area, and (b) another free paper with a 'thinner' all Wales coverage. But owing to the factor already mentioned, the lack of Welsh National pool of commercially advertising, it appears that (b) also would need some sort of local focus – the capital city, perhaps? The Strategy- as that seems to be our keyword – would be to start at the two poles, Gwynedd-Glamorgan, and work in due course towards an all-Wales coverage. (Cardiff itself, being the capital, should have at least on Welsh-language daily. But this is another story.)

11. We hope that the Group finds here something relevant to its inquiry, and we should be glad to participate in any subsequent discussion.

Summary

The press in an industry crucial to the future of any language. Today the Welsh language and the printed press are both in crisis,. Dalen Newydd Ltd. is working on a possibility which may help both, The aim is to build up a chain of free weekly news sheets which would eventually cover the greater part of Wales. They would be different in style and content from the monthly community papers (papurau bro) and would, it is hoped, compensate in part for the failure to create a Welsh-medium daily press. They would depend on advertising, and having carried out a survey of 500 businesses in Anglesey and the old county of Caernarfon, we are fully aware of the challenges in this field. How could the Welsh Government help? By a regular supply of public notices, something which already appears essential to the survival of the English-language press in Wales. A recommendation to this end by the Task and Finish Group would be a step in the right direction.

Call for Evidence - Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group

John R Walker – AccData

After nearly 30 years in Gwynedd, most of that time in business on my own account, I have no doubt whatsoever that the application of Welsh language compulsion and Council policy has been nothing short of the 'kiss of death' for business development in Gwynedd and Anglesey, and that the numerous identifiable problems associated with it are now spreading to the rest of Wales following the adoption of compulsory Welsh in schools and then the Cwricwlwm Cymreig. This has effectively now made Wales a no-go area for the highly mobile highly skilled UK-based workforce (with children) usually needed specifically for new investments and business development. Foreign workers who learn English as a foreign language to set up business in the UK do not expect to have their time, effort, and money rewarded by having their L2 English treated as a second class language in Wales. This has all been aggravated by the aggressive and often illegal actions of Welsh language campaigners who have directly disrupted businesses and made Wales an unattractive place to invest. An aggressive and irrational promotion campaign by the public sector in general and by the Welsh Language Board then the Office of the Welsh Language Commissioner in particular, coupled with their support for individuals and the Welsh language against the rights of employers to run their businesses as they see fit, has also reduced inward investment and has certainly cost many existing jobs as management choose locations where they are free to run their businesses in English without duress. The proposed Welsh Language Standards are duress. For the vast majority of businesses the Welsh language offers no advantages and many disadvantages. Even at the heart of the Fro a recent survey of businesses in Gwynedd carried out by Gwynedd Council reveals that more than 4 times as many respondents feel the Welsh language has a negative effect on business development than those who feel it has a positive effect.

It is not possible to hold a legitimate public facing survey of attitudes to the Welsh language in any frame of reference due to the climate of fear which leaves respondents with genuine points to make being left open to being described as 'anti Welsh language' or 'anti Welsh' from which irrational position comes the fear of retribution which may take many forms from internet trolling, restriction of trade, intimidation and victimisation of individuals and their families including children, through to death threats and actual instances of violence and criminal damage to property. When it comes to issues surrounding the Welsh language the majority of law-abiding citizens and businesses have simply been intimidated into silence leaving the field open for the minority, but vociferous, Welsh language lobby to monopolise what has been for 30+ years a one-sided 'debate'. In order to receive a free and fair response any survey or consultation about attitudes to the Welsh language must be totally anonymised and securely confidential. It must therefore be carried out by an independent 3rd party unconnected with the Welsh language promotion industry, which clearly includes the WAG. Surveys must not be accompanied or preceded by one-sided propaganda. Surveys must not offer biased introductions, present leading questions, or presume a demos in favour as presented in the pre-amble to this consultation, and most others I have seen over the

years. This consultation, therefore, has the appearance from the outset of lacking legitimacy.

When presented with a moderately anonymous option in a recent Gwynedd Council business Survey (http://www.gwynedd.gov.uk/upload/public/attachments/1163/Gwynedd_Business_Survey_1st_Half_201213_Full_Results_January_2013_Final.pdf) we find from Figures 19 and 20 on pp36-37 that 4.2 times as many respondents feel the Welsh language has a negative effect (32.1%) on business development compared with those who feel it has a positive effect (7.7%). An initial response may be that 60.2% of respondents are therefore ambivalent but this is unlikely since those who choose to identify their businesses are extremely unlikely to admit they have any 'negative views' if they are seeking assistance from this Council with its long-standing record of positive discrimination towards users of the Welsh language and 'compulsory bilingualism', that is to say the systematic removal of the option for people to live their lives entirely in English if they so choose by failing to operate a language preference scheme for communications. It is also well known that many businesses operating from a fixed IP address can be identified fairly easily. The results are therefore still likely to understate the true proportion of businesses for which the Welsh language impacts negatively.

Amongst my business associates in Gwynedd I would estimate that about 80% find the Welsh language to be a significantly negative factor, although very few will risk saying so outside the circle of colleagues they can trust. The ones who would disagree tend to rely on the Welsh language as part of their business model – they are typically translators, engaged in Welsh media or culture, or have contracts with the public sector which absolutely require their use of the Welsh language. Indeed some of these businesses appear to exist only to service the public sector. It is interesting but some of these L1 Welsh business people, who I have got to know very well over more than a decade in many cases, have also expressed their concerns to me privately about the negative impact that Welsh language compulsion and discrimination is having on the economy and social fabric locally and Regionally. They are at pains to point out that the 'Welsh language promotion industry' and the unlawful activities of the minority do not represent them. Indeed, they have proved to be amongst my most loyal long-term customers even though my own view that the Welsh language should be a matter of personal choice in all situations is well known to them. This suggests that the problems arising from the Welsh language are mostly 'institutional' in origin.

From what appears to be the English language majority of business owners many are, like me, too close to retirement to make leaving Wales a viable financial option but that is precisely what I would like to do and what the majority of those who remain who have expressed an opinion to me would also like to do. A recent survey by the ONS showed that over 30% of small business owners currently want to leave Wales. You can probably regard that as a best-case scenario! Around 30% of small business owners in North Wales are approaching retirement – many set up their businesses before the worst excesses of Welsh language policy became evident. In Gwynedd, I would say nearer to 80% of L1 English small business owners now want to leave Wales and that is the future the WAG is currently legislating towards since language policy in Gwynedd is increasingly being used as a model to drag Wales

down to the same level of economic collapse. Reap what you sow! I have lost count of the businesses and other economically active, often business-critical, people who have left Wales for England or beyond. Skilled staff who leave are becoming more difficult to replace. Compulsory Welsh in school, and Gwynedd Council's particular version of social engineering in schools, has been the main reason cited for leaving. Some have left to access better health care. Some have taken 5-figure losses in preference to staying.

In a world where ambitious parents will move 'across town' to be in the catchment area of a better school, it is almost inconceivable that any well-briefed parent would willingly move their children into Welsh schools – the damage caused by moving in and out of non-English medium schooling is adequately documented. It is fully recognised by the MoD who pay for private education in 5 North Wales LEAs through the Day School Allowance (North Wales) to prevent damage to service children by moving in and out of EM education. Exactly the same problem exists for the highly mobile technical and managerial staff necessary for business development and the creation of new sites, but no help is available for them unless their employer is prepared to subsidise English medium education in a private EM school, even if suitable places are available which is not always the case. In many cases compulsory Welsh in school is now a deal-breaker for the recruitment of key staff to live and work in Wales. In the past a company setting up in Gwynedd would typically inform their incoming staff that English medium education was available in Conwy LEA, and advise them to buy a house in a suitable catchment area, but this is arguably no longer the case as so-called English medium schools become functionally English medium with significant Welsh and gradually become Welsh medium schools. Statistics are available, unfortunately not widely enough, which show that Welsh medium schools are under-performing their English medium equivalents (when adjusted for social factors) by several percentage points. The campaign of organised dis-information about the benefits of Welsh-medium and bi-lingual education is now being exposed and is becoming more widely known outside Wales. So, from the point of view of education alone Wales is no longer seen to be part of the UK and it is suffering accordingly with both UK and overseas based companies effectively black-listing the Region for new developments. Existing businesses are leaving Wales for the same reasons though the recession has made it much easier to come up with alternative explanations.

My preferred solution for Welsh language policy in business is the same as my solution in all situations. If Wales is to re-build its economy (and its declining public services) it is essential that all forms of Welsh language and bi-lingual compulsion are abandoned immediately along with all forms of language based discrimination be they unfair positive discriminations or negative discriminations with the same functional outcomes as racial discrimination. You must start by removing compulsory Welsh from all levels of education. The second most useful change would be to introduce a language preference scheme where businesses and individuals can specify whether they want all communications (including so-called bulk mailings and statutory forms) in English only, Welsh only, or in both languages. Unfair subsidies to 'Welsh language' businesses must also stop – it is a major source of friction in the business sector.

David Wyn Williams

Procurement policies

Sounds like homework! To put it simply, the Welsh language is a prize. It is only available to businesses that have the time and the enthusiasm to take advantage of it;

"This offer is only available to businesses to want to make money in Wales"

Employment policies/practices

All interviews by public organisations should be conducted through the medium of Welsh.

Absolute priority for the language. If there aren't any people that can interview in Newport (including the County's Human Resources) it is time they worked somewhere else.

Commercially, it is completely up to small businesses, why interfere? (See above)

If they want to exploit, then support and advise as much as possible (and that is my field of expertise).

Support for businesses (financial and advisory)

Prepared to deliver this for fair travelling expenses and you can have an initial discount!

Although the advice I got from the Assembly specialist was £40 an hour.

Planning

I intend to steer a new Federation for Welsh businesses – see 'Iaith y Gymdeithas' (The Language of Society) on Facebook (100+ members)

(I am in the middle of completing an MA in Practical Creative Media at Aberystwyth University so I have many thousands more words written already on the subject, tell me if you would like to see these essays written so far, although many of my ideas can already be seen on my blog:

<http://golwg360.com/blog/dai-lingual>)

- a) How could the use of the Welsh language and bilingualism support business growth and economic development?

In the same way that Ireland uses the differences in the life and culture of the Emerald Isle to market the country internationally, emphasising differences in our country can attract further international interest and investment.

Bilingualism should be embedded in our internal and external marketing as a country. After all, this is the only one of the Celtic regions (including Cornwall and the Isle of Man) where the language is prospering. What does this show us about our culture? That we are co-operative, communal and put a great of emphasis on culture – qualities that should be highlighted and a matter of pride.

We must remember that multilingualism is common all over the world. To some extent, it is only the old Europe that expects to live like monoglots: England, France

and Germany. Everywhere else is multilingual, and note that France and Germany share borders, therefore their languages also mix to some extent.

The lack of Welsh words in English is the topic of a conversation between me and Gareth Glyn in our film “Glyn, Wyn a Phen Gwyn” which has reached the short list in the Cardiff Mini Film Festival this weekend. This is an obvious area where another language is an advantage – are we of the opinion that subtitles are a weakness in drama series’ from Scandinavia?

b) How could economic development support increased use of the Welsh language?

I am currently working on a project that highlights the Welsh language on a website for folk music followers all over the world: the proto-websites are www.youtube.com/panwalesmusiccymru and www.panwalescymru.wordpress.com and they reflect the advantages of our culture and language.

Also, I am the author of the Welsh tweet that has been retweeted most often as far as I know:

“RT os ydych chi’n deall y neges yma” (re-tweet if you understand this message) received almost 700 retweets from my account www.twitter.com/cardiffirinj; and many extra followers as a result. I believe that it is vitally important to highlight our language and culture in the year of www.womex.com and therefore, I work continuously towards that aim, since economic development is the basis of everything:

That was the reason that the language was lost in the valleys when heavy industry arrived.

And that is the basis for the wide interest in the language in Cardiff now that the Assembly has arrived. The local people who are most passionate about the language in my experience of working in education in the area since 2008 are the families of Ely and Trowbridge, the city’s most disadvantaged areas, where there is no secure future for children unless they learn Welsh and therefore gain skills and other work.

We must start from the premise that Wales is the country, Welsh is the language, therefore we are translating for the non-Welsh speakers/ immigrants, not for the Welsh people themselves. Everything else will follow from that.

I have already been asked to establish a Federation of Co-operative Welsh-medium Businesses who have historically and traditionally worked through the medium of Welsh – businesses such as Siop y Pethe and y Llew Du in Aberystwyth have always used Welsh and have managed to run businesses that pay the bills. Only

recently have they had to restructure in order to ensure a future that is just as successful, and that is why we need a federation to co-ordinate and lead on this by using other examples. I believe that the support of the Assembly will be needed to realise this and I am prepared to meet in order to discuss the matter if required.

c) How could the public sector support increased use of the Welsh language through its local economic impact?

I am not very happy with this wording to be honest – is it a translation from English? Anyway -

The public sector must lead on the language, because without definite examples of the language's successes, 'Jones & Jones & Sons local business' will not be interested in investing in what they currently see as a bit of a Trojan horse that undermines their business.

I have complained twice to Vale of Glamorgan Council about the lack of Welsh road signs in my village, to no avail.

And I do not understand because I am trying to create work for them, and therefore pay and all for a Welsh speaker I would like to think, as it is the Welsh-speakers who understand whether a sign is correct or not. That is, we must be more selfish. Answer the phone in Welsh, demand that commercial companies who sell over the phone find Welsh-speakers to communicate with you, and all of a sudden, there will be more work for those who leave Ysgol Gyfun Cwmtwrch.

If every complaint about the absence of the Welsh language is translated into work, it wouldn't be possible for you to be mugged in Welsh in Caernarfon any more. And however much fun that may surely be, I believe everyone would like to work through the medium of Welsh.

ch) Examples of best practice for Welsh language employment

Not Mudiad Meithrin (Welsh Nursery Organisation) anymore unfortunately, they still employ Welsh people who do not want to learn the language.

Apart from the traditions of education and farming, the language is decline and we need to face up to this immediately.

Like Fair Trade, we need a culture that wants to reward local enterprise, and honestly, what is more local than the language (and a language is not discriminatory either, incomers can learn if they wish.)

These are the businesses where I enjoy a good Welsh service / who employ Welsh-speakers
SWALEC

Llew Du Aberystwyth
Llew Du Talybont
Y Lolfa
Coleg Cymru
Aberystwyth University
Dylanwad Wines
Morgans Butchers
Gwesty Cymru
Baravin
Telesgop
Siop Inc
BBC Radio Cymru
Ffigar Sports

A large number of the businesses who use the hashtag #yagym (it was I who last administered the account for the Welsh Hour this week, every Wednesday evening at 8.00pm.

d) Examples of businesses who have benefited from marketing themselves as businesses who use the Welsh language

This is my speciality. Every client I have worked with has benefited because I have consulted with them about their language needs:

Aberystwyth Toy Shop, Pier St
Uni Day Centre, Cardiff University
Izmir, Broad St, Barry
Y Lolfa
Wales University Press
Radio Ceredigion

This follows the example of Glengettie, Castell Howell Foods, and what better example than the water on the snooker and on Friends: Ty Nant. Surely Welsh Water from the Stream of the House would not have arrived there in the same way.

dd) Suggestions for facilitating the work of promoting economic development alongside the Welsh language

A website to promote Welsh traditional cultures, a federation of genuinely Welsh-medium businesses. Get in touch!

Response to Call for Evidence: Use of the Welsh language

David Lermon, ICAEW

ICAEW welcomes the opportunity to comment on the call for evidence statement by the Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group on 16 April 2013.

Background

ICAEW is a world-leading professional accountancy body. We operate under a Royal Charter, working in the public interest. ICAEW's regulation of its members, in particular its responsibilities in respect of auditors, is overseen by the UK Financial Reporting Council. We provide leadership and practical support to over 141,000 member chartered accountants in more than 160 countries, working with governments, regulators and industry in order to ensure that the highest standards are maintained.

ICAEW members operate across a wide range of areas in business, practice and the public sector. They provide financial expertise and guidance based on the highest professional, technical and ethical standards. They are trained to provide clarity and apply rigour, and so help create long-term sustainable economic value.

ICAEW, an active member of Commerce Cymru (formerly Business Wales) and the Council for Economic Renewal, has 3,000 members in Wales. We work closely with the Welsh Government in a number of different ways.

ICAEW has more than 20,000 members working outside the UK. The ICAEW qualification is recognised around the world as a prestigious professional business qualification. Members are entitled to the description chartered accountant and to the designatory letters ACA or FCA. Examinations for the qualification can be taken in a wide range of countries across the globe including China, Russia, Malaysia and Pakistan: however, papers are always set and marked in the English language.

Summary

We do not believe that promoting the Welsh language should be a priority for economic development policy and are not convinced that the Welsh language and bilingualism has a major role to play in supporting business growth and economic development. We believe it is essential to encourage Welsh business to be more, not less, outward looking.

Detailed Response

In this response we concentrate on the first three questions posed in your call for evidence, as we are unable to comment on the final three.

- a) *How could the use of the Welsh language and bilingualism support business growth and economic development?*

We are not sure that it can. There needs to be a recognition that, while operating bilingually can bring some benefits in specific markets – perhaps particularly in terms

of retaining wealth within specific communities by encouraging income to be spent locally and, possibly, through the impact on intra-Wales tourism - there are also additional costs associated with doing business bilingually, particularly in a world where English is increasingly seen as an acceptable *lingua franca*. Even in tourism, it is possible that too strong an emphasis on the Welsh language could detract from the visitor experience.

Moreover, given that 78% of the Welsh population do not speak Welsh, we would be concerned that any increased emphasis in terms of public policy on the importance of Welsh language fluency as a key skill within the workplace could increase barriers to employment and career progression for a majority of the Welsh labour force.

b) How could economic development support increased use of the Welsh language?

We do not believe that it could or should. Given the huge challenges facing the Welsh economy in terms of employment and competitiveness, we doubt whether supporting the increased use of the Welsh language should be a priority of economic development policy in Wales.

More generally, we believe that it is essential for the Welsh Government to safeguard the competitiveness of Welsh businesses and from this perspective would argue that what is essential is for Welsh businesses (particularly in terms of manufacturing and business-to-business services) to be more, not less, outward looking.

We do not accept that there are significant problems in terms of the willingness or otherwise of businesses to do business through the medium of Welsh. Unlike the services of the local Council or of the Local Health Board, consumers who feel their bank or building society does not give sufficient weight to the Welsh language can go elsewhere, and the Government must not try to impose something which the market does not value. For many Welsh businesses (particularly those which are outward looking) the Welsh language is of relatively minor importance¹.

c) How could the public sector support increased use of the Welsh language through its local economic impact?

Again, we doubt whether it could or should try to do so. While we support the encouragement and promotion of the use of the Welsh language in the private sector on a voluntary basis, and would endorse interventions such as Awards or kitemarks which recognise good practice on the part of individual businesses in terms of providing a bilingual service, we do not believe the public sector should be seeking to use stronger policy instruments (such as legislation or procurement policy) to force

¹ This is underlined by the Future Skills Wales, 2003, which showed that employers rated Welsh language skills as one of the two least important generic skills (Generic Skills Survey, page 21) and that only 6% of all residents interviewed spoke Welsh as the first-language in the home (Ibid., page 73). More recently, the 2011 UK Employer Skills Survey found that skills gaps related to the Welsh language were reported as needing to be addressed by only a small minority of employers (rating as less critical than any other identified skills with the exception of foreign language skills) (UK Commission's Employer Skills Survey 2011: Wales Results, page 58)

or incentivise businesses (and employers more generally) to use Welsh where they prefer not to do so.

We would argue that in a country where 78% of the population do not speak Welsh it is inevitable that English will in very many cases continue to be the default language of the workplace and of businesses. Indeed, we would note that in many enterprises outside the UK with workforces with different mother tongues (even where none of these is English), English is the default language. We also doubt whether there is a real problem at present. The Welsh Language Board's Welsh Language Use Surveys suggests that less than 15% of respondents in the private sector and less than 5% of respondents in the public sector thought that their employers were not supportive of the use of Welsh in the workplace.

Response to the consultation "Welsh and economic development" by the Language Technologies Unit, Canolfan Bedwyr, Bangor University.

How can the use of the Welsh language and bilingualism help businesses grow and support economic development?

Summary

- Technologies that support human language are essential in the products and success of some of the largest companies in the Information Technology and Communication sector.
- Canolfan Bedwyr's Language Technologies Unit (LTU) have expertise in these technologies especially with regard to the Welsh language.
- Successes in Knowledge Transfer Partnerships (KTP) and Scholarships (KESS) in assisting businesses in Wales.
- Translation Industry in Wales have not taken full advantage of computer assisted translation technologies, or expanded to other languages. Therefore translation agencies and companies outside Wales are out-competing most Welsh language service providers.
- The models used to provide financial assistance to publishers have helped the industry in Wales to flourish.
- The popularity of e-books, apps, and electronic games shows the need to continue to innovate. Otherwise the publishing industry will become restricted and irrelevant.
- We believe that the Welsh Government should give priority to supporting research, development and innovation to the speech and language technologies sector in Wales.
- Welsh and bilingualism offer opportunities in a multilingual worldwide markets.
- As a bilingual country, Wales has advantages and skills of interest to industries which require linguistic and multilingual expertise.

Full response

We refer in particular to the Speech and Language Technologies Sector (SALT), the Translation Industry and the Publishing Industry in Wales.

As a bilingual country, Wales has advantages and skills of interest to industries which require linguistic and multilingual expertise.

1. Speech and Language Technologies

The speech and language technologies is the area within Information Technology and Communication that deals with human languages. Recently there has been great interest in this area regarding text and audio analysis, understanding opinion and sentiment, machine translation, digitizing, speech recognition, text to speech and writing aids.

These technologies are essential components in the services and success of some of the largest companies in the Information Technology and Communication sector today. As the software and services provided by these businesses extend across the world and increasingly to our work and our day to day lives, it is essential now that these technologies support multilingualism.

Expertise has been developed in Wales, mainly in Canolfan Bedwyr's Language Technologies Unit, Bangor University, in order to address these technologies for the Welsh language. The LTU have assisted companies in Wales to benefit on a number of opportunities through knowledge transfer schemes, e.g. Knowledge Transfer Partnerships (KTP) and Knowledge Exchange Scholarships (KESS and ATM) . The Unit has also supported partnerships between local businesses and international companies such as Microsoft, so as to provide and maintain the best Welsh language expertise and capacity these companies need for their investments in the Welsh market.

Providing speech and language technology resources is therefore of great importance in economic terms, that fulfils the needs of a domestic market and offers opportunities to a world-wide multilingual market.

We believe that the Welsh Government should give priority to supporting research and innovation for the speech and language technologies sector in Wales, and support small local businesses in gaining expertise in this area.

2. The Translation Industry

The translation industry is worth billions of pounds worldwide, and in recent years a small but prosperous translation industry has flourished in Wales that provides good employment often in rural areas where professional jobs are limited.

However the industry is still small and fragmented, and has not fully adopted computer aided translation technologies nor sufficiently competitive in increasing their shares of the global market. Translation agencies from outside Wales are able to compete successfully for Welsh/English translating contracts, with profits therefore flowing out of Wales. The industry hasn't expanded either to other languages, or to situations which need to translate a large number of languages at the same time.

We believe that the Welsh Government should support the Welsh translation industry in Wales. We also believe that there is need for the public Welsh sector to procure translation services from companies in Wales so as to help them develop and compete in a wider multilingual market. This way supporting bilingualism in Wales is seen as a commercial opportunity rather than as an economic burden.

3. The Publishing Industry

The publishing industry has shown how to sustain small publishing businesses, distribution, book shops and Welsh language authors in some of the poorest areas of Wales. The model that targets subsidies in the form of publishing grants has helped the industry to flourish, and we believe this is a successful model to emulate in other creative sectors.

The popularity of e-books, apps, electronic games etc shows the need to continuously innovate. The support given to the sector must be, in regards of training and subsidies, flexible to react to new media.

Otherwise an industry which is restricted to traditional print books will become more and more old fashioned and irrelevant.

This is especially true when translating from Welsh and selling to other markets. The Chinese market has a huge demand for fiction, especially for children. Therefore it was recently attempted to sell translations of the 'Cyfres Rwdlan' books to China. In time there probably will be opportunities to create games or e-books versions of these stories.

If these kind of enterprises succeed, it will provide a significant boost to the publishing and creative industries in Wales, with foreign royalty payments supporting economic activities of Welsh businesses.

For further information see the following:

SALT Cymru End of Project Report (Jones, Prys et al. 2008)

http://www.saltcymru.org/english/SALT%20Cymru%20_HE%2006%20KEP%201002_%20Project%20Closure%20Report.pdf

Gwell Offer Cyfieithu ar gyfer y Diwydiant Cyfieithu yng Nghymru (Prys, Prys &

Jones, 2009) [http://www.catcymru.org/wordpress/wp-](http://www.catcymru.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/PDFGwell%20offer%20technoleg%20cyfieithu%20ar%20gyfer%20y%20Diwydiant%20Cyfieithu%20yng%20Nghymru.pdf)

[content/uploads/PDFGwell%20offer%20technoleg%20cyfieithu%20ar%20gyfer%20y%20Diwydiant%20Cyfieithu%20yng%20Nghymru.pdf](http://www.catcymru.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/PDFGwell%20offer%20technoleg%20cyfieithu%20ar%20gyfer%20y%20Diwydiant%20Cyfieithu%20yng%20Nghymru.pdf)

Evidence to the House of Commons, Select Welsh Affairs Committee : Globalisation and Its Impact on Wales: Second Report of Session 1, Volume 2 By Great Britain.

Parliament. House of Commons. Welsh Affairs Committee (2008-09)

<http://www.publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm200809/cmselect/cmwelaf/184/184i.pdf>

(<http://goo.gl/Nzg3E>)

The Welsh Language and Economic Development

UCAC the union that protects Wales' teachers and lecturers

UCAC welcomes this opportunity to respond to the consultation on the Welsh Language and Economic Development.

UCAC represents 5,000 teachers, school leaders and lecturers in further education and higher education in every part of Wales.

As a result of the need to respond to a host of other consultations during the same period, we haven't had time to prepare a detailed response for the Task and Finish Group, and we apologise. We would be very willing to give further evidence in future if doing so would be of assistance to the Group.

Nevertheless, we would like to draw the Group's attention to the importance of:

- Providing plenty of post-14 and post-16 Welsh-medium courses (particularly, but not limited to, occupational subjects) in schools and Further Education Colleges to ensure that people reach the workforce with a combination of appropriate skills for specific workplaces, and bilingual skills including the confidence to address matters and people in both languages. Although there is a pressure on the Further Education sector to provide more Welsh/bilingual courses, the number of courses and their proportion remains very small. There may be a need to consider how the new post-16 funding system could be better utilised to create incentives for providing Welsh language courses.
- For the same reasons as above, providing an adequate delivery of Welsh medium/bilingual apprenticeships, and Higher Education courses.
- Without a doubt, having a bilingual workforce can be an advantage for companies – it is a way of fostering relationships with customers and communities; if the skills exist within the workforce, it is worth marketing them.
- Planning workforces; particularly when the Government has a role in determining the number of courses or apprenticeships in specific subjects, it is important that this is based on an analysis of the need for bilingual workers.
- Procurement policies – when any public body invites tenders for a contract, there should be tendering criteria at work to make it a requirement that the competing companies: are adequately aware of the bilingual context or the ability to deliver bilingually – according to need. Way too often, we see companies securing contracts for work in Wales (including Welsh Government contracts) that have no idea how to manage a bilingual situation, or who believe they can provide (e.g. by employing translators), and fail miserably. This has a double negative effect (i) the service provided does not meet the requirements (ii) the work has gone to a company outside Wales, when it could have contributed to the local economy, creating local jobs, if the criteria had asked for expertise/understanding in relation to the Welsh language/bilingualism.

Response to Call for Evidence: Use of the Welsh language

Katy Chamberlain – Business in Focus

At Business in Focus we welcome the opportunity to contribute our experience to the Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group's call for evidence.

Background

Business in Focus has been delivering support to businesses in Wales for more than twenty years, through the provision of business advice to both new and existing businesses. With our partners, we currently deliver the Welsh Government's Business Start Up support programme in South Wales. We also lead the consortium of companies which delivers the Welsh Government's Business Wales One Stop Shop service to existing businesses across Wales. In addition we provide accommodation to more than 220 small businesses across South Wales.

Our experience

In our response, we will focus two questions.

How could the use of the Welsh language and bilingualism support business growth and economic development?

Under our contracts, and drawing specifically on our work under the Start Up service, we deliver advice, training and practical assistance to individuals seeking to start their own business. The aim of the service is to enable people to work, earn a living and use their talents to their own benefit and ultimately that of the Welsh Economy. This may simply be by supporting themselves and their families, or may result in their developing a business which will grow and create jobs for others.

The people who approach the service vary considerably in their levels of experience and confidence. Some have been away from the world of work for some time. We offer all clients under the service the opportunity to receive assistance in either Welsh or English.

Some key statistics are:

- Of the businesses we helped to start trade in the financial year ended 31 March 2013 14% had owners with some Welsh language ability.
- 10% of the enquiries we received in the financial year ended 31 March 2013 were from clients with Welsh language ability (2012: 9%)
- Of the enquiries received from those with Welsh language ability 21% have gone on to start their business against an average of 16% for non-Welsh speakers.

In our experience, the ability to engage through the medium of Welsh is important in ensuring not simply that the service is available to all, but that it is truly welcoming and provides genuine support in a manner which builds confidence in the user.

In 2010 we undertook workshops with a selection of our clients and other stakeholders in support of our commitment to equality, to gain an understanding of their requirements from the service. Their feedback was that the promotion of the availability of the service in Welsh is important. Our stakeholders told us that while take up may be slow, it enables people (particularly those with Welsh as their first language) to receive assistance who simply would not have taken this up had English been the only option

Examples of best practice for Welsh language employment

As an employer serving a wide range of businesses and individuals across South Wales, it is important that our workforce, both clients facing and otherwise reflect the diversity of Wales. A particular example is our recruitment practices, where we advertise in Welsh, use Welsh language agencies, and where required conduct assessment centre exercises in Welsh.

We also promote and encourage the learning of the Welsh language among our employees.

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to respond to this call for evidence. Please do not hesitate to contact me if there is anything further we can do.

Task and Finish Group:

The Welsh Language and Economic Development - Evidence of S4C

Introduction

S4C welcomes the opportunity to respond to the Task and Finish Group's consultation on the relationship between the Welsh language and economic development. Specifically, our response considers the following questions in the consultation, in the context of the provision of S4C services and our policies:

- a) How could use of the Welsh language and bilingualism help businesses to grow and support economic development?
- b) How could economic development increase the use of the Welsh language?
- c) How could the public sector increase the use of the Welsh language through its effect on the local economy?

This paper also considers:

- d) good practice in terms of employing Welsh speakers
- e) examples of independent producers, who have been commissioned by S4C, and thus have benefited from marketing themselves as being users of the Welsh language.

Where relevant, considering questions (a) – (e) above, the paper also discusses:

- S4C Policies
- S4C employment practices
- Support, both in financial and advisory form, provided by S4C to independent producers and to other businesses.
- S4C's intention to consider relocating some of its services and staff resources to other areas in Wales

Background

S4C is the only Welsh language television channel in the world. It has served the whole of Wales since 1982, reflecting the life of the nation and its communities. It is a comprehensive public service, offering a full range of programmes, including news and current affairs, documentaries, drama, entertainment, sport, education and children's programmes.

S4C appreciates its special role in providing Welsh language programmes and content of high quality for its audiences - be they fluent Welsh speakers, less fluent, learners or prospective learners - and they are improved through the provision of subtitles and red button services across all platforms.

S4C is a publisher-broadcaster, which operates by commissioning independent producers – mainly from Wales – to create most of its

programmes. The BBC also provides 10 hours of content per week for S4C by statute – this includes the News service, the long-running soap opera *Pobol y Cwm*, and some of the sports provision.

S4C Governance

As a public service – rather than a national broadcaster – S4C appreciates its operational and editorial independence. It is the duty of the S4C Authority, by statute, to provide the S4C service. Appointments to the Authority are made by the Secretary of State in the Department for Culture, Media and Sport, but the Welsh Government and the Wales Office are also consulted now as part of the appointments process. Following a public consultation, a new Operational Agreement between the S4C Authority and the BBC Trust is in force, which guarantees the operational and editorial independence of S4C, and which also provides appropriate accountability to the BBC Trust for the way in which funding from the licence fee is used. Since April this year, the majority of S4C funding comes from the Licence Fee, through the BBC Trust, within the terms of the Operational Agreement. The BBC Trustee in Wales is also a member of the S4C Authority.

Finance for S4C

The UK Government's responsibility for S4C finance dates back to the start of the channel in 1982, and although the source of funding and the mechanism has varied over the last thirty years, the statutory provisions have always outlined the financial requirement to enable S4C to provide a Welsh language service of high quality.

By means of the Public Bodies Act 2011, the previous guaranteed statutory funding formula was revoked and superseded by a statutory *duty* upon the Secretary of State to ensure "sufficient funding". In 2010, the grant to S4C from the DCMS was £101m but following the UK Government's Comprehensive Spending Review, a cut of 24% was made in the S4C budget over a period of four years – which in real terms is equivalent to a 36% reduction. In 2011 the grant had reduced to £90m and then to £83m in 2012. In 2013, the grant was reduced further to £6.7m following the agreement with the BBC Trust to finance most of S4C's funding from the Licence Fee.

The element of funding from the DCMS of approximately £6.7m in 2013/14 was guaranteed until March 2015 only. Also, further cuts of 1% in 2013/14 and 2% in 2014/15 were announced in the 2012 Autumn Statement, with further cuts announced in the UK 2013 Budget Statement of 1.06% in 2013/14 and 1.09% in 2014/15. A further Spending review for the 2015/16 financial year is expected to be announced in June 2013 and it is likely to further affect the income received by public bodies funded by the DCMS.

For the remainder of the period of the current BBC Charter, up to March 2017, it was agreed that the BBC would contribute the following funding from the licence fee to S4C:

2013-14: £76.3m, 2014-15: £76m, 2015-16: £75.25m and 2016-17: £74.5m

The Agreement provides for further incremental cuts of approximately 1% in the level of funding from this source in the 2015-16 and 2016-17 financial years.

Following the reduction in its funding model, and changes to it, S4C has already had to make difficult decisions in order to achieve savings. These include two cycles of job losses and a reduction of 25% in staff, which has reduced the average cost of its content per hour from £16,374 in 2009 to £11,743 in 2012, and the decision to terminate the high definition service Clirlun in December 2012, saving £1.5m per year.

Such decisions have been made with the aim of ensuring the best possible value for money, minimising the effect savings will have on the audience of S4C and content on the screen. That is not likely to be the case with reductions to our funding in future, as any further reductions in funding would reduce our content budget.

- a) How could use of the Welsh language and bilingualism help businesses to grow and support economic development?

Due to the channel's model as a publisher-broadcaster, the majority of S4C's funding is transferred to the private sector. This has led to an independent production sector that is strong, innovative and of global standard, and which has grown alongside S4C since its inception in 1982.

Since that period, S4C has attracted £2.2 billion of external investment into Wales, for the benefit of the local economy. The Hargreaves Review of the Creative Industries in Wales concluded that *"without S4C, it is quite possible Wales would have no independent television companies at all"*.

In 2012 over 60 independent companies received commissions from S4C to provide programmes in the Welsh language, expenditure that was worth £63m. A recent analysis by Arad Research, based on the Keynes multiplier effect premise indicates:

- That initial expenditure of £63.7m by S4C on programmes and content in 2012 purchased from independent companies in Wales created an additional economic effect of £60.5m and an overall economic effect of £124.3m on the creative industries in Wales
- That every pound spent on content purchased from independent companies in Wales creates an overall economic effect of almost £2 (£1.95) on the creative industries in Wales

A report by DTZ and WERU, also in 2010, estimated, based on S4C's gross expenditure or output in 2010:

- That S4C's expenditure created total employment within the Welsh economy of 2,111 full-time equivalent posts, most of these being posts in

which the Welsh language is used. Of these, 1,226 posts had been created in sectors related to the creative industries

- That S4C's expenditure had stimulated further expenditure of £88m for the Welsh economy.

- b) How could economic development increase the use of the Welsh language?

S4C's main function is to create programmes and content in the Welsh language and, of necessity, the staff of the independent companies commissioned by the channel use the Welsh language in their workplaces. A number of the companies are based in areas where Welsh is the day to day language of the community and the presence of the companies creates posts which allow people to work in their home area through the medium of Welsh.

S4C raises income from advertising as a source of additional funding, and a number of the advertisers that advertise in Welsh on the channel has increased substantially over the last year. In 2011, 22 companies/bodies advertised on S4C in the Welsh language, but this increased to 47 companies during 2013, an increase of 114%. 34% of these companies, 16 of the 47 were small or medium sized (SMEs), established in Wales. It is significant that they made a commercial decision to advertise through the medium of Welsh in order to promote their businesses and create growth. In this context, it is important to note that, in general, advertising on television is heavily influenced by the advertising market in London, with approximately 90% of S4C's advertising revenue still being created by agencies based there.

S4C increasingly fulfils an innovative and pioneering role in the digital world in Wales and works in increasing creative ways to reach and serve Welsh audiences. S4C also hopes that its investment in digital projects being created by companies in Wales is helping those companies to compete internationally by taking advantage of digital products on international platforms.

Over the last year, S4C has been developing on-line digital content and has established a Digital Fund, worth £1m over the next 4 years. Its purpose is to support new creative services and goods across digital platforms with the intention of strengthening the output of S4C and producing commercial income.

In May, S4C released Cyw a'r Wyddor and Gwylltio, two new educational apps that have been welcomed by experts in the field. Also, during the same month, App yr Urdd was released to coincide with Eisteddfod yr Urdd 2013 that was held in Pembrokeshire. This was a joint venture between S4C and the Urdd to assist visitors to make the most of the experience of visiting the Eisteddfod field.

During the festival, the app was downloaded 9000 times. The Gwylltio app, which is for children and young people aged 7-13 years, is full of facts and

information about the natural world and coincides with a new series that starts on S4C in June. S4C is a broadcasting partner for the LIFE education scheme in Loughor, Swansea. This is a scheme to improve the literacy skills of pupils by using new technology and S4C has been sharing digital expertise and content, as well as encouraging pupils to watch and create apps through the medium of Welsh.

Effect of S4C Productions on the Economy

A number of S4C's most popular drama series were produced on location, in areas across Wales, bringing significant economic benefits to these areas. For example, the Teulu drama series was produced in the Aberaeron area, and a permanent site has been established in Menai Bridge for the popular series, Rownd a Rownd.

Also, S4C believes that 'back to back' joint-production is one possible way of making progress in a challenging economic period. This can give the creative industries a substantial boost and bring finance from international companies to communities in Wales – such as with the detective series that will be screened shortly, Y Gwyll/Hinterland that was filmed in Ceredigion – and create content that can be sold in international markets. Y Gwyll, S4C's first detective series for over 20 years, is a partnership between Fiction Factory, All3Media, Tinopolis and S4C and the production was filmed in Welsh and in English (Hinterland). It will be broadcast on S4C in the autumn, on BBC Four in 2014 and BBC Cymru Wales has also purchased two episodes. Also, the series has been sold to a company from Denmark that produces The Killing and Borgen. This partnership, back-to-back model is an important one for S4C as we look beyond Wales again – and in terms of the language. It is the Welsh version that will be broadcast first, and there will be a lot of Welsh in the English version to reflect the community that lives in Ceredigion.

S4C uses commercial funding to invest in international productions and content which bring economic benefits back to Wales. Also, the Welsh Government already has the power to support Welsh companies as they aim internationally and we welcome the support offered by the Economy, Science and Transport department to production companies to attend international television markets and increase the presence of content from Wales internationally.

- c) How could the public sector increase the use of the Welsh language through its effect on the local economy?

At the end of May, S4C and the Welsh Arts Council announced a new partnership with a memorandum of understanding between the two bodies. The intention is to co-operate effectively and proactively for the benefit of the audience and to support the arts in Wales in the present economic climate. The first element announced as part of the collaboration is Y Labordy, namely an ambitious script-writing scheme that will offer an opportunity for four special individuals to explore and develop drama writing skills for television,

film, the theatre and radio in Welsh. Creative Skillset Wales and the Film Agency for Wales are also sponsoring the scheme.

Through projects of this kind, and by sharing ideas, knowledge, expertise and research, we hope to support the best creative talents in Wales, making Wales a more energetic and inclusive country. The understanding will also mean that investments from S4C and Welsh Arts Council funds will reach a wider audience and create a more robust economic effect.

Also, a number of S4C's schemes and projects jointly with public bodies create economic benefits by creating opportunities for the audience to work and live their lives through the medium of Welsh. Examples of this include the Chwe Nofel series, on which we worked with the Welsh Books Council, or Y Plas, on which we collaborated with a number of organizations to create a new history programme that will be broadcast in September, live from Llanerchaeron House (a stately home owned by the National Trust). Also, the twitter feed Ti, Fi a Cyw gives parents an opportunity to learn Welsh with their children whilst Cariad@Iaith 2013 concentrated on a group of Welsh learners from across Britain.

d) good practice in terms of employing Welsh speakers

S4C employs 133 full-time staff, including 97 fluent Welsh speakers and 11 learners. Access to Welsh courses are provided and also language improvement courses for experienced speakers. All communications for staff within S4C are conducted bilingually, including information e-mails and content placed on SBEC, the S4C staff intranet.

S4C has a wide range of policies in order to promote use of the Welsh language and also in order to harmonise standards, for example in the production of programmes. These include S4C's programme guidelines and Welsh language guidelines for programmes.

In our Language Scheme, approved by the Welsh Language Board, and which is now regulated by the Welsh Language Commissioner, S4C as a public body has adopted the principle that it will, in its dealings with the public in Wales, treat the Welsh and English languages on the basis of equality. This Scheme sets out how S4C will give effect to that principle when discussing with the public in Wales. Our standard practice will be to ensure that our services are available to the public in Welsh. S4C will ask other companies and organizations dealing with the public in the name of S4C to comply with our Language Scheme. We also encourage our independent producers to operate schemes of their own or to comply with the spirit of the S4C Language Scheme in providing services to S4C.

S4C invests extensively in training schemes for the industry. Cyfle was established in 1986 to train people to work through the medium of Welsh in technical areas for the industry, in response to the creation of S4C. It operates as a training company for Wales' Creative Media Industries, and has training centres in Caernarfon and Cardiff. S4C has been in partnership with

Creative Skillset Cymru (the Sector Skills Council or the creative industries in the United Kingdom) since its inception in 2002, and members of S4C staff attend meetings of the organization's Consultative Board. S4C has encouraged Creative Skillset Cymru to make the most extensive use possible of the Welsh language in implementing its schemes and policies. Also, as a condition of the S4C Commissioning Code of Practice, independent producers provide an analysis of the skills and training needs to the framework body (namely Creative Skillset Cymru) which is responsible for noting and collating data regarding training needs in Wales.

S4C has also contributed to and supported a number of additional training campaigns, with the intention of promoting use of the Welsh language within the industry and on the screen. For example, S4C has launched a scheme to develop new Welsh authors and directors to make two short films in partnership with the It's My Shout project, that will be broadcast on the channel. Also, following a competition on Y Lle, five short films on the theme 'first love' were produced and shown in Ffresh, Welsh Students' Moving Image Festival.

- d) examples of independent producers, who have been commissioned by S4C, and thus have benefited from marketing themselves as being users of the Welsh language.

All the programmes commissioned from the independent producers in Wales by S4C have been in the Welsh language. The companies employ Welsh speakers and also, the companies themselves, by spending and hiring services in their areas, create an additional economic effect to S4C's investment. There is also evidence from the companies of the contribution of their staff to local life in their areas, taking part in a wide range of local activities in the Welsh language.

Producers established in North Wales, such as Rondo and Cwmni Da, offer jobs that are considered to be of high standard and provide salaries that are, on average, higher than what is offered by most employers in their local areas. This also prevents the depopulation that happens in rural areas in Wales, by keeping young people in their home areas instead of them leaving in order to find work. Companies such as Tinopolis and Telesgôp also offer work in disadvantaged urban areas including Llanelli and Swansea.

Therefore, as well as our response to this consultation, we would encourage you to contact TAC (Independent Welsh Producers) and the individual companies for more specific examples of their economic effect and contribution, as local businesses, in the context of the economic effect of the Welsh Language.

Relocation of S4C: feasibility study

In October 2012, S4C announced plans to conduct a feasibility study into relocating parts of S4C's work outside Cardiff. At the time, Ian Jones, the Channel's Chief Executive, said he was determined to ensure that the

economic benefits of S4C were shared across Wales where possible, in order to try to create work and training opportunities in an area or areas outside Cardiff.

Since the announcement, a project team has been working on the feasibility study, and among the criteria for the work is the possible effect of any relocation plan on the language, culture and economy of those areas in question. In February, as part of the feasibility study, expressions of interest were invited from organizations, movements and areas across Wales.

The 2011 Census indicated that the numbers speaking Welsh across Wales had fallen overall. Although some areas showed a small increase, there is great concern regarding the drop in some areas where the Welsh language has traditionally been at its strongest.

S4C has considered the results and implications of the 2011 Census and is weighing up whether relocating parts of S4C's work and activities outside Cardiff could be of benefit to S4C and to the future of the Welsh language in its heartlands.

Comments on The Welsh Hour by Huw Marshall

The Welsh Hour was established in November 2012. I had the idea after seeing a tweet from a friend in Yorkshire with the hashtag #yorkshirehour.

It is a simple enough idea, an hour of Twitter every week between 8 and 9 on Wednesday evenings. All individuals/organisations/businesses have to do is tweet a message mentioning their business/product/event through the medium of Welsh, adding the hashtag #yagym.

Today, in as little as eight months, nearly 1,800 follow the account.

Normally the hour creates about 500 tweets, including responses and retweets, reaching around 70,000 through more than 100 accounts.

The Hour has created a new network of small businesses that see the benefit of operating through the medium of Welsh. Businesses have personally told me that they have increased their number of followers, sales and awareness of the fact that they offer services through the medium of Welsh.

Following demand from the Welsh Hour community, #seshbusnes was established in Aberystwyth through tweeting. 20 followers of the Hour from every part of Wales came together to socialise , share experiences and to get simple sessions on:

- A) the use of social networks from Lliwiol company.
- B) the advantages of marketing in the Welsh language by a marketing officer from S4C
- C) how to integrate e-commerce within a Tinopolis Interactive website

We intend to hold a #seshbusnes event at the National Eisteddfod in association with Business Wales and another event, including the pop-up market, in Cardiff during November.

In #seshbusnes at Aberystwyth, I stated that I would be giving up the work of managing the Hour myself. I have given tweet account details to half a dozen of the Hour's most ardent followers. The community now manages the Hour and takes turns to administer it. Since then it has gone from strength to strength.

The next step will be to build a website where the community can advertise themselves in a more permanent way.

This is an example of a good, simple and cost free idea which has raised awareness of the commercial value of operating through the medium of Welsh.

Call for evidence - Task & Finish Group on Welsh Language and Economic Development

Welsh Language Commissioner Meri Huws

The Welsh Language Commissioner welcomes the opportunity to respond to the call for evidence examining the link between the Welsh language and Economic Development. We write to make some representations which will form the basis of our presentation to the Group on 17 July.

The principal aim of the Welsh Language Commissioner, an independent body established under the Welsh Language Measure (Wales) 2011, is to promote and facilitate the use of Welsh. This entails raising awareness of the official status of the Welsh language in Wales and imposing standards on organizations. This, in turn, will lead to the establishment of rights for Welsh speakers.

Two principles will underpin the work:

- In Wales, the Welsh language should be treated no less favourably than the English language
- Persons in Wales should be able to live their lives through the medium of the Welsh language if they choose to do so

In due course, secondary legislation will introduce new powers allowing the setting and imposing of standards on organizations. Until then, the Commissioner will continue to inspect statutory Welsh language schemes through the powers inherited under the Welsh Language Act 1993.

One of the Commissioner's priorities is to scrutinise policy developments with regard to the Welsh language. Therefore, the Commissioner's main role is to provide comments in accordance with this remit, acting as an independent advocate on behalf of Welsh speakers in Wales who might be affected by this consultation. Such an approach is advocated to avoid any potential compromise of the Commissioner's regulatory functions and should the Commissioner wish to conduct a formal review of individual bodies' performance or the Welsh Government's performance in accordance with the provisions made in the Measure.

Under the provisions of the Welsh Language Measure (Wales) 2011, the Commissioner is also responsible for promoting and facilitating the use of Welsh. In relation to this work, we support private sector businesses in developing their use of Welsh with a team of officers working with small, medium and large enterprises throughout Wales and beyond.

Initial observations

The importance of the economy in terms of community sustainability is recognised and with the Census 2011 results showing a decline in the number of Welsh speakers it is vital that the link between the economy and the viability of Welsh-speaking communities is recognised and discussed. We therefore welcome the Government's continuing efforts to examine this important subject but note the need

for further significant work. The Commissioner will scrutinise this area in more detail in future through the Observatory's activities.

In relation to our work with businesses, *A Living Language: A Language for Living* asks the Commissioner to:

"promote the voluntary use of Welsh by the private sector – and encourage the uptake of those services by Welsh speakers."

To fulfil that, the Commissioner works directly with businesses to help them produce Welsh Language Policies and develop a business infrastructure allowing them to develop their use of Welsh. We also work with the CBI, the Federation of Small Businesses, Chambers of Commerce and other umbrella groups to normalise the Welsh language within the business community and also to introduce it to new audiences in a strategic manner. The Commissioner also influences national, regional and local policy in terms of economic development and support schemes in skills and language training which helps to develop and maintain Welsh language or bilingual workplaces.

The work undertaken by the Commissioner's Private Sector Team focuses on increasing the use of Welsh within businesses, normalising its status and providing the Welsh language with a visible platform on the High Street and creating Welsh language or bilingual workplaces where Welsh language skills are developed by employers. To achieve this, steps must be taken to ensure that the Welsh language is a core consideration within local, regional and national business support regimes and we examine this in more detail below.

We have sought to answer the questions identified in your Call for Evidence below:

How could the use of Welsh and bilingualism help businesses to grow and support economic development?

Whilst it is possible to ask questions such as the above, the Group should recognise its complex nature. In seeking to measure the 'economic value' of the Welsh language, consideration should be given to the factors which contribute to actual economic 'benefit'. In dealing with businesses, we are told, on a continuous basis, that the Welsh language is important to them in terms of providing good customer care, expressing a Welsh identity and gaining customer loyalty/good will. Fundamentally, it could be said that all of these factors contribute towards increasing company profit but that there is a need for better dialogue with businesses in order to highlight this relationship between the use of Welsh and increased turnover. Without examining this relationship further, it will be difficult to persuade employers to recognise the economic benefit.

A question on general attitudes towards the use of Welsh in business was asked in Language Use Surveys from 2004-06. At that time, those individuals working in the sector held the following views regarding their employers:

- 36.7% supported the use of Welsh in the majority of aspects of the business, both formal and informal.

- 23.4% supported the use of Welsh in an informal capacity but not involving formal business affairs.
- 13.9% did not support the use of Welsh.
- 16.2% stated none of these.
- 9.8% did not know.

This shows that there is a willingness to use the Welsh language but that more work needs to be done for employers to view the Welsh language as a formal and necessary business consideration. The Group should consider how the Government and other partners can contribute towards ensuring that the Welsh language becomes a horizontal business consideration for businesses in the same way as environmental or sustainability issues are treated.

Examples of good practice in employing Welsh speakers

i) The Welsh language as a Skill

The Government has already accepted recommendations involving the Welsh language as a skill in relation to a review of Skills Policies and the Welsh Language in February 2011 by the Wales Employment and Skills Board. The Board's terms of reference included the need "to advise on the adequacy and appropriateness of the supply of skills – including the Welsh language – to the present and future economy". They were also asked to "consider the evidence on the demand for Welsh Language skills in the workplace. What are the Welsh language skills needs of employers? How can these needs best be met?"

The report states that the systems currently in place do not provide an adequate mechanism for identifying the Welsh language skills needs of the present and future economy and makes a number of useful recommendations. We suggest that the Working Group considers the recommendations made by the Employment and Skills Board in terms of the call for evidence as it provides clear guidance on the Welsh language and skills. It is also aligned to the commitment made in *A Living Language: A Language for Living* to:

"Improve labour market intelligence with regard to the demand for staff who have Welsh language skills, on a regional and sectoral level, and to disseminate the information through appropriate channels."

Data on the Welsh-medium labour market will be useful in terms of discussing Language and the Economy but it will also act as a measuring tool for assessing success. Action point 50 of *A Living Language: A Language for Living* on research and data is also relevant in this context. In terms of developing Welsh language skills and training, the Welsh Government has already conducted a Survey of Welsh Language Skills Needs in the Workplace and recommendations will need to be implemented in due course.

ii) Bilingual Workplaces

Welsh language and bilingual workplaces create linguistic landscapes where Welsh speakers can use and improve their linguistic skills. The action points found in *A Living Language: A Language for Living* (26-30) emphasise the need to strengthen the Welsh language within workplaces through guidance, operational standards,

promoting recognition of the Welsh language as a skill and creating opportunities for people to learn Welsh in the workplace.

In addition to the above, further work needs to be undertaken to i) increase organisations' understanding of the importance of bilingual workplaces and ii) help businesses to plan bilingual workplaces by developing the language skills of their staff. From our engagement with businesses, it may be gathered that the majority of private sector employers do not consider the Welsh language as a consideration in planning the workplace. More often than not, it is considered an attribute rather than a skill and employers fail to give it any consideration when employing or training staff.

Examples of businesses who have benefited from marketing themselves as those which use the Welsh language

There are case studies which have already been featured in reports on this subject. However, it would also be beneficial to receive evidence from businesses or social enterprises which operate either i) organically through the medium of Welsh or ii) implement commercial schemes for the benefit of the Welsh language. These exist and their contribution towards the linguistic viability of communities needs to be recorded and recognised.

How could the public sector increase the use of Welsh through its impact on the local economy?

Economic policies can have a direct impact on the wellbeing of the Welsh language. It is therefore important for the Welsh language to be mainstreamed continuously within strategies and action plans on a national, regional and local level. The Commissioner has already responded, and is responding, to consultations in this regard including a response to the Government's national strategy on Regeneration: 'Vibrant and Viable Places'. References to the Welsh language are few and far between in this important document. Steps must be taken to ensure that the Welsh language is given its proper place in such documents, along with any follow-up action plans. The same is true of the Welsh Government's seven Regeneration Areas. The Welsh language should be given horizontal consideration within each regeneration area and this should be reflected in their individual Strategic Frameworks. Furthermore, some of these regeneration areas contain communities where over 70% of the population speaks Welsh. Has the Government taken the opportunity to identify unique and innovative opportunities to develop economic regeneration plans where the Welsh language plays a fundamental role within the proposed plan for these areas?

At a local level, individual Local Authority Local Regeneration Strategies also provide opportunities to consider operating in favour of the Welsh language on a local basis and steps should be taken to ensure that the Welsh language is an active consideration within these strategies.

The same principle of mainstreaming the Welsh language is also true in terms of the Economy Department's Sector Panels and also the Government's business support service: Business Wales. The service provides information, advice and guidance to people starting or growing their business. These individuals are currently directed to

the Commissioner's Private Sector Team if they wish to receive support to develop their use of Welsh within their business. Whilst we welcome this purposeful direction, we would also ask if the Welsh language needs to be mainstreamed further to the Government's business support services. Do the business establishment courses for example refer to the Welsh language and the need to consider it in establishing a business? Does the marketing advice provide information on bilingual design?

Business Wales employs Equality and Diversity Consultants and Environmental Consultants to help businesses produce Equality and Environmental Policies. This kind of provision does not currently exist in terms of the Welsh language and we ask if there is a need to consider the most effective approaches to introducing prospective businesses and growth businesses to the Commissioner's Language Policy template. By ensuring that the Welsh language is introduced at an early stage as businesses are established, that would contribute to normalising the Welsh language within the Business Wales support culture.

Suggestions for facilitating the promotion of economic development and the Welsh language together

Procurement Policies

Under the Welsh Language Act 1993, Welsh Language Schemes are committed to the inclusion of language conditions in public agreements. This means that there is an increasing expectation on contractors to meet the linguistic requirements found in public agreements. It may be inferred that such conditions have made private contractors more aware of the need to use the Welsh language in their activities as well as increasing Welsh language provision but more work needs to be done to mainstream the Welsh language in Government and public body procurement support structures.

During the tenure of the Welsh Language Board, a Procurement Guide was published which provided guidance to the public sector on how to include linguistic conditions in agreements. The Guide looked in particular at conditions which were relevant to the agreement in question, avoiding a 'box ticking' exercise of noting that a company implemented a Welsh Language Policy. The principles found in this Guide continue to be relevant to the Welsh language and contracting.

In terms of contracting and the Welsh language, it is important to note that section 48 of the Welsh Language Measure (Wales) 2011 gives the Commissioner the right to give a compliance notice to contractors directly. When the Standards regime is brought into force, this will allow the Commissioner to address the above matters by:

- i. Ensuring that organizations include linguistic conditions in public agreements, and
- ii. Ensuring that contractors are subject to standards directly.

Awarding Grants

As above, it is possible to set conditions involving the Welsh language when awarding public grants. Those requirements, however, must differ according to

individual circumstances. The Commissioner has produced a Guide on Awarding Grants, Loans and Sponsorship which provides organisations with guidance on how to set linguistic conditions in this context and steps should be taken to ensure that this Guidance is mainstreamed within Government and public body structures for awarding grants, loans and sponsorship.

Schedule 5(5) of the Welsh Language Measure 2011 refers to 'Persons providing services to the public who receive public money amounting to £400,000 or more in a financial year'. Organisations falling into this category are subject to inclusion in Schedule 6 of the Measure, through an order made by the Welsh Ministers. By doing this, and in specific circumstances, the Commissioner will be able to make these organisations subject to compliance with standards.

The Planning Regime and the Welsh Language

The planning regime may facilitate appropriate economic development by planning it in suitable situations and ensuring that consideration is given to local requirements and needs. The regime should contribute to the development of Welsh speaking communities by facilitating economic development sites which are sustainable and have a positive impact on the Welsh language. The planning regime as it stands does not serve the purpose of protecting the Welsh language and there is a strong consensus that TAN20, published in 2000, does not provide sufficient guidance to local authorities on how and when to assess the impact of planning policies and applications on the Welsh language. The knock-on effect of that is that local authority approaches to considering the Welsh language are inconsistent and insufficient. The Commissioner has already been in contact with the Government on the above matter.

We also note that it is possible to set conditions regarding planning applications and in some cases, (e.g. Signage and Information Notices), enforcement steps may be taken to ensure that they are bilingual. We therefore believe that further investigation is needed to what can be achieved within Planning Policy Wales requirements, looking specifically at the use of linguistic conditions regarding businesses' use of Welsh on new signage. The visible use of Welsh on public signage maintains the status of the Welsh language and contributes towards its viability. How will the Welsh Government therefore use its powers in terms of planning to promote the wider use of Welsh - e.g. on business signs in Wales?

Task and Finish Group on Welsh Language and Economic Development

Response of Mentrau Iaith Cymru

Mentrau Iaith Cymru is a national organisation which supports the work of the 22 Welsh Language Initiatives across Wales. The Welsh Language Initiatives are local, community-based organisations who work for the benefit of the Welsh language. We run a variety of projects focussing on children and families, young people, economic development, community development, heritage and culture. Further information about the Initiatives and links to their individual websites are available on www.mentrauiath.org

We welcome the opportunity to submit comments to the Task and Finish Group on the Welsh language and Economic Development.

We respond to the specific questions asked by the Group below.

a) How can using the Welsh language and bilingualism help businesses to grow and support economic development?

Customer Care

Both large and small businesses benefit from providing bilingual services in Wales: by respecting their customers' language choice businesses develop a strong customer care relationship with their service users. Research by Beaufort Research on behalf of Consumer Voice Wales testifies to this: "[Out of over 700 people] nearly three quarters (73%) of them said that they would be more likely to buy again from a business or recommend a business which had provided them with a full service in Welsh."

Inclusive and Responsible Corporate Image

Related to customer care is Welsh and bilingual corporate image. Bilingual branding and communication is key in attracting customers who speak Welsh. We believe that we need to combine bilingual branding and marketing with high quality Welsh language services and meaningful action to meet the needs of Welsh speakers.

Support

We believe that strong support is needed for large and small businesses in all parts of Wales, including those not subject to the Welsh Language Measure 2011. This support should include:

- Re-establishing the free translation service (Link Line)
- A bilingual signs and badges campaign for staff who speak Welsh: we need to raise awareness of these resources
- Practical support to develop Welsh language schemes and increase Welsh medium services

In addition to all this we believe that Initiatives and businesses across Wales are able to create Welsh medium posts which do not currently exist by identifying

economic opportunities which are unique to their own local areas, e.g. outdoors, tourism, heritage and green energy.

b) How can economic development increase the use of the Welsh language?

Our Welsh Medium Labour Market Plan explains our vision for increasing the economic value of the Welsh language. We would like to refer the group to this plan specifically.

Briefly, we believe:

- That the Welsh language should become an essential skill for work across sectors - by increasing the use of it and creating new jobs, economic development can be supported.
- By increasing those jobs where the Welsh language is an essential skill there is more use, more demand for services and more learning.
- That a better economic foothold needs to be created for Welsh speakers in Wales. The Welsh language is not currently given sufficient consideration as a skill for historical reasons. This limits the use of the Welsh language due to a lack of services and leads to an unsustainable outward migration of young Welsh speakers.
- That economic opportunities relevant to areas where there are high numbers of Welsh speakers need to be identified, encouraging Welsh speakers to own them, e.g. outdoors, tourism, green energy.

c) How can the public sector increase use of the Welsh language through its impact on the local economy?

We believe that the Welsh language must be central to a policy in the public sector not only to improve services but to create jobs where Welsh is an essential skill. In Wales we now face a situation where there is an increasing demand for Welsh medium services on the one hand but on the other hand we have an outward migration of hundreds of young Welsh speakers every year due to a lack of employment.

Developments in the public sector, especially in human resources and recruitment, are key to tackling this situation. Gwynedd Council's Welsh language policy could be considered in this context. Apart from Gwynedd no Local Authority uses Welsh administratively based on an internal language policy. It seems that the influence of the Council's Welsh language policy and the Welsh medium employment opportunities which this creates is partly responsible for sustaining the Welsh language in the Caernarfon area by increasing the demand for Welsh speaking employees.

d) Examples of good practice in the employment of Welsh speaking workers

In Penrhyndeudraeth, Traveline Cymru employs bilingual workers to work on one site and respond to calls in English and Welsh. Rather than considering Welsh speaking and non-Welsh speaking services and employees separately, the

employer has seen bilingualism as a skill which avoids the need for two call centres.

Carmarthenshire County Council has established a call centre which receives all the Council's calls as a first point of contact, and all members of staff must be bilingual to deal with the calls. As in the above example, this then creates a bilingual/Welsh medium workforce.

Dealing with English and Welsh equally is key in these examples of good practice: rather than considering providing Welsh services in addition to English medium services (and establishing a second call centre to deal with Welsh calls) the employers have met the need for English and Welsh services by recruiting bilingual workers, and a high quality bilingual service which is also cost-effective is a natural product of this.

e) Examples of business which have benefitted from marketing themselves as those who use the Welsh language

Examples of good practice include:

- Portmeirion
- Blas ar Fwyd (Llanrwst)
- Pellenig (Outdoors Company)
- Harbourmaster (Aberaeron)
- Fflam Eryri (Eglwysbach)
- Y Castell (Caernarfon)
- Cwrw Llyn (Rhydyclafdy, Llyn Peninsular)
- Siop Siocled (Denbigh)
- Swayne Johnson Solicitors (Rhuthin and Denbigh)
- Aballu (Wrexham)

In the context of tourism, research work as part of the STEAM report (2009) explains how bilingual branding is beneficial for businesses: "In a world of global brands and creeping homogenisation distinctiveness is increasingly hard to find and can be a powerful marketing tool which is advantageous when competing with the rest of the UK and mainland Europe. North Wales has a unique linguistic and cultural heritage which enriches local communities and which could be more effectively utilised to add value to the visitor experience. Bilingualism is an added dimension with bilingual skills in the workplace increasingly recognised to be a valuable asset."

As well as marketing themselves as businesses who use the Welsh language, we believe that all businesses need to combine Welsh and bilingual branding with meaningful Welsh language provision (e.g. by employing staff who can speak Welsh and encouraging them to use Welsh in the workplace and with customers). We would also like to see the Welsh language becoming central to corporate social responsibility in Wales, encouraging businesses to consider the impact of all aspects of their work on the Welsh language locally.

f) Suggestions for facilitating the work of promoting economic development and the Welsh language together

We believe that Welsh Language Initiatives, along with other organisations which promote the Welsh language, are key in supporting Welsh medium jobs and other jobs through our work. The Welsh Language Initiatives employ 300 full-time workers throughout Wales and they also employ part-time, casual and freelance staff. Welsh Language Initiatives also recognise the need to develop and promote entrepreneurship locally to support businesses and provide opportunities for people to work through the medium of Welsh to support the Welsh language locally - there are examples of such projects run by the Initiatives which promote entrepreneurship (e.g. the Menter Bro Dinefwr Mentero project, Menter Iaith Conwy EgNi project and others).

Mentrau Iaith Cymru would like to see economic development happening hand in hand with the aim of creating a bilingual Wales. We believe that we can help develop the economy by seeing the Welsh language as a skill which creates work opportunities, and which enables people to get jobs and work through the medium of Welsh. In addition, we believe that new posts can be created for Welsh speakers in areas which have not been fully developed.

Our vision for promoting the Welsh language and the economy together is explained in our Welsh Medium Labour Market Plan. We ask the group to consider the suggestions made in the paper.

Welsh Language Standards

CBI Wales response

The CBI believes the most effective way for the private sector to deliver Welsh language services is on a voluntary, demand-led basis. Many businesses in Wales provide a range of Welsh language services voluntarily, despite low usage levels. The Commissioner needs to set out a strategy for the private provision of Welsh language Standards. The CBI needs clarification on which parts of the private sector will be required to provide services, what services they will be required to provide, how they will be expected to provide them and when compliance be required. We look forward to working closely with the Commissioner and the Welsh Government to achieve a workable solution. August 2012

Introduction

CBI Wales welcomes this opportunity to respond to the Welsh Language Commissioner's (the 'Commissioner') consultation on Welsh language standards (the 'Standards'). The CBI is the UK's leading business organisation, representing some 240,000 businesses that together employ about a third of the private sector workforce. In Wales we represent the country's biggest employers, including 75% of anchor companies and a range of growth SMEs. The CBI is the main business organisation working with the Welsh Government to deliver a more competitive business environment.

Challenging economic climate

For the private sector to drive economic recovery Wales must be an attractive place to build a business and create jobs. In this economic climate, all government policies must be measured against their capacity to support private sector growth and make Wales a more attractive place to do business.

A strong and thriving Welsh private sector is in everyone's interest. A successful economy is necessary to underpin the health, education and social justice aspirations of the Welsh Government.

Give the economic climate, Welsh language Standards must be implemented in a way that does not limit consumer choice, make Wales a less attractive place to do business or damage the wider business community's positive approach to the language.

Business provides demand-led services

CBI member companies operate throughout many parts of Wales- rural and urban, traditional Welsh-speaking areas and industrial anglicised areas. Members generally have a positive attitude towards the language and are open to see it extended in business where there is sufficient demand from employees and customers. Many businesses in Wales have, in different ways, increasingly chosen to build the Welsh language into their marketing and customer relations-on a voluntary basis.

Key recommendations

The CBI makes the following key recommendations to the Commissioner and Welsh Government:

- Growth and jobs must be our top priority: Given the progress that could be made voluntarily, it is the wrong time to be introducing additional regulation on businesses operating in Wales
- The voluntary approach is working: Business in Wales already provides a range of demand-led services achieved through a voluntary approach
- Genuine dialogue is needed: The Commissioner should conduct a regulatory impact assessment on all draft Standards and consult business on the merits of those draft Standards. The private sector role in delivering Standards must also be clarified. Business needs certainty and clarity and to know 'what,' 'how' and 'when' in order to plan for any such requirements

Growth and jobs: the top priority

A strong and thriving private sector is critical to the future prosperity of Wales. A successful economy is necessary to underpin the health, education and social justice aspirations of the Welsh Government, including the health of the Welsh language. Business supports the goals of the Welsh Government's Welsh language strategy: A Living Language: a Language for Living. Creating a more bilingual Wales is a long-term aim. Reaching this aim can most effectively be achieved through education, support and encouragement and recognising that some companies, especially smaller ones, will need more active government support than others.

Welsh companies are exposed to globalisation

Wales is a small market for most businesses, with a small and not particularly affluent (relative GDP per head is low) population of three million. Businesses, which have aspirations to grow, therefore have to serve markets outside Wales – in the UK and around the world. Welsh companies therefore will compete vigorously with competitors based in other parts of the UK and overseas on a daily basis. Against this background, the nature of the business environment in which the business chooses to locate is of critical importance.

This is a challenging period for all private sector employees in Wales. Many of Wales' largest companies are in a global race for survival; as a result, they are implementing efficiencies and are looking to new markets to sell their goods or services. At such a time the Welsh Government and Commissioner need to ensure the evidence-base upon which all policy decisions are taken reflects current economic realities and due consideration is given to decisions that will directly impact different parts of the private sector.

The technical, capacity, administration and management costs of complying with legislation in the absence of sufficient demand/financial return is something many businesses in Wales cannot do, especially in this tough economic climate.

Recommendations

The CBI makes the following recommendations to the Commissioner and Welsh Government:

- The current weak state of the Welsh economy cannot be overlooked when determining the scale and pace of implementing Welsh Language Standards.

The voluntary approach is working

CBI members have long supported the adoption and development of the Welsh language in the private sector when it is done on a voluntary and demand-led basis.

As the CBI stated in our response to the Welsh language Legislative Competency Order, private sector Welsh language services could be improved without the need for legal compulsion.

Some telecommunication companies, bus and train operators and utility companies are already providing a variety of bilingual services. The Welsh Language Measure (the 'Measure') will likely change the perception of the language from a positive statement of a commitment to Wales to a compliance issue- the costs of which tend to be managed and minimised.

Demand is the main barrier to service growth

The main barrier to the extension of Welsh language services in the private sector continues to be the low level of usage. We recommend the Welsh Government and the Welsh Language Commissioner use their resources to make an attractive business case for using Welsh. This includes working with Welsh companies to boost the use of Welsh by consumers and giving the skills and training to individuals to have the confidence to use the Welsh language in a formal setting. If done effectively, greater use would encourage the more companies to provide Welsh language services.

The majority of the private sector remains outside the scope of the Measure. As a result, it will be important for the Commissioner to continue to support the Investing in Welsh kite mark scheme. This voluntary accreditation approach, with the appropriate marketing, has the potential to gain wider private sector support than the companies the covered by the Measure. It should be twinned with a publicity campaign to increase consumer demand and work to understand why Welsh speakers are reluctant to use the Welsh language in official capacities. This approach has the potential to deliver increased use of the language across the private sector.

Recommendations

The CBI makes the following recommendations to the Commissioner and Welsh Government:

- The voluntary extension of Welsh language services must continue to be supported and encouraged.
- Government must continue to consider innovative ways to increase consumer demand for services.

Genuine dialogue is needed

Mandatory language Standards have been imposed by few other countries. As a result, the true implications for the Welsh economy and the use of Welsh are difficult to determine. We are disappointed therefore that the consultation document does not appear to be consulting businesses on the whether the draft standards/activities identified are reasonable or proportionate. A consultation on the appropriateness of each Standard and Activity needs to take place before further progress can be made.

A simple compliance framework is needed

The compliance framework, as set out in the consultation document, is currently too complex. The document lists 66 Standards and 72 activities, which companies must provide bilingually should they fall under the regulation of the Measure. We question

whether such a complicated approach is in accordance with the Principles of Better Regulation and Hampton Principles. The CBI is not aware of a regulatory impact assessment having been carried out on these draft proposals. The Commissioner should focus on outcomes and give the private sector the flexibility to implement the framework in the most effective way for their industry. The Commissioner should work with the private sector to bring forward a simpler and more effective compliance framework, with an emphasis on voluntary action.

Timeframes and definitions must be specified

The consultation document does little to provide the certainty Welsh companies need on key issues like timeframes and definitions. The Commissioner should make clear that the implementation of the Standards in the private sector is a long term process based on consultation and consensus. A road map that supports companies, as they gradually work towards full compliance, should be drawn up in partnership with impacted companies.

Reasonableness test

We are pleased the Measure includes a reasonableness and proportionality test. Logically, the Commissioner should consider this test when drawing up draft Standards and activities. Failing to do so, would create unnecessary cost and delay by increasing the chance of an organisation appealing the Commissioner's decision. We would like clarification from the Commissioner and the Welsh Government whether these Standards and activities are in accordance with the reasonableness provisions within the Welsh Language Legislative Competence Order and the Welsh Language Measure.

A complex, fast changing marketplace

A consequence of greater choice for the consumer is a more complex network of public services. Private companies now provide a range of formerly public services and some markets- such as telecommunications- have diversified with new technologies allowing for many new services and new ways of communicating with a service provider. This is a fast moving and complex sector.

A level playing field across Wales is required

The Welsh Government has suggested that the implementation of service Standards could be different in and between sectors and vary in different parts of Wales. This, they have argued, would enable companies to proportionately provide levels of Welsh language public services, according to their locality. We believe such an approach can work under a voluntary system. However, it is not feasible to propose different statutory duties on companies competing to provide the same services. Under statutory scheme, competition rules would not allow such a bespoke approach. A statutory code must provide a level playing field between companies within affected sectors to ensure principles of fair competition are respected.

Regulation must not reduce consumer choice

Furthermore, there are a growing number of niche energy suppliers that provide utilities to small groups of consumers. The choice of a 'green energy' utility supplier for example is available in Wales. We would not want to see the unintended result of the Welsh language becoming a de facto barrier to these smaller utility companies

operating in Wales. We also would not wish for this to become a disincentive for newer, niche companies in other sectors as this would be to the detriment of the Welsh economy.

Clarity needed for the telecommunication services sector

We are unsure exactly what companies/activities the Welsh Government intended to cover by including 'telecommunications services' within the Measure. At its heart, telecommunication is the assisted transmission of signals over a distance for the purpose of communication. Such a definition could include a wide range of products and services provided to the public by the private sector. We would like the Commissioner to share her working definition of the sector with the CBI.

Services to the public

We note that the consultation will impose Standards to those companies 'providing services to the public who receive public money'. We believe the clause intends to cover private companies providing public services and not private companies that receive public money.

The number and type of companies providing "services to the public" captured by the £400k clause is currently not known. As a result, it is difficult to accurately state the impact/cost this new statutory requirement will have. The effect of this on companies is a prolonged period of uncertainty, which is not ideal given current market conditions.

It would be beneficial for the Commissioner or the Welsh Government to discuss with business what companies they are seeking to prioritise under this clause. The CBI believes the clause is intended to cover Assembly Sponsored Public Bodies (ASPBs) and organisations like the Wales Millennium Centre, who provide a public service and receive the majority of their funding from the public sector. We do not believe the clause intends to capture, for example, manufacturers in receipt of government grant funding. We would welcome clarification from the Commissioner.

Treating Welsh language "no less favourably" than English

We note the consultation requires affected companies to treat Welsh 'no less favourably' than English within the Standards. As there is no definition of 'no less favourably' it is not clear what compliance will mean in practice. We would welcome the Commissioner's view on this issue.

Government support

Given the unprecedented step being taken by the Welsh Government in legislating to mandate the provision of bilingual services, the Welsh Government and the Commissioner should consider reviewing the range of support provided to small and large businesses to implement Welsh language services.

The Welsh Government could reduce the cost of compliance for companies by offering advice and guidance on how Welsh language services could be introduced most effectively. Offering basic translation support for things like signage would be welcome. The Commissioner could also consider validating Welsh language translation services so that companies can be sure of the quality of the work being done. A significant number of companies impacted by legislation will be using the Welsh language for the first time. Helping to demystify the process for these companies would be very welcome.

Recommendations

The CBI makes the following recommendations to the Commissioner:

- The private sector needs to be properly consulted on the merits of the standards/activities with the aim of developing a simpler compliance framework
- The Commissioner must provide the private sector with clearer guidance on timeframes and definitions.
- The Commissioner should ensure all Standards and activities pass the reasonableness and proportionality test before being proposed.
- The Commissioner needs to outline how the Standards are going to be implemented in a complex market in a way that does not limit consumer choice or impose undue burdens on business
- The Commissioner should clarify what her priorities are for the telecommunications sector.
- The Commissioner should make clear what type of companies fall within the Measure definition of 'providing services to the public who receive public money' (schedule 5(5))
- The Commissioner should make clear her definition of treating Welsh language "no less favourably" than English (p9).
- The Commissioner and Welsh Government should make clear their commitment to provide more support to companies that provide bilingual services.

Conclusion

To achieve the best outcome for the Welsh language we recommend the Commissioner eschews a legalistic approach in favour of a relationship based on mutual support and guidance, underpinned by a voluntary approach.

The CBI strongly hopes that all parties involved handle the implementation of the Standards in such a way that the continued goodwill of the vast majority of the private sector, which is outside the scope of the Measure, is preserved.

We look forward to working with the Commissioner and Welsh Government to get a workable Welsh language strategy for the private sector, which is clearly demand-led, operating in a voluntary basis and which promotes not hinders economic growth.

The Economy and the Welsh Language

Menter a Busnes and the Welsh Language - Alun Jones

(this introduction may contribute to questions (d) an example of good practice in the employment of Welsh speakers and (e) an example of a business which has benefitted from marketing themselves as a business which uses the Welsh language)

Background

Menter a Busnes was established in 1989 with the aim of increasing the numbers of Welsh speakers who use business start-up services and to ensure that Welsh speakers make the best possible contribution to the Welsh economy. Previous research showed that less Welsh speakers than other groups used mainstream business services, and further research showed that Welsh speakers tended to be less enterprising in business and careers than other groups, and that this was hampering the development of the economy especially in rural areas and areas where there were a high number of Welsh speakers.

Several projects were set up in the early days working specifically with Welsh speakers, e.g. Cwysi (farming families), Gorwelion (Welsh speaking pupils, students and parents), MSc Entrepreneurship (Welsh-medium), Business Networking projects and others.

In time, the situation improved as regards the economic activity of Welsh speakers and research was beginning to show that they had caught up with other groups as regards venturing into business and general entrepreneurial behaviour. During the early years targeting Welsh speakers, Menter a Business developed expertise in new, innovative and creative projects, and successful project management. With a reduction in core funding from the Government (or Government agencies), there was a need to redefine the Company's *raison d'être*, and it was decided that we would do so by actively contributing to the economy. That is, Menter a Busnes would act entrepreneurially itself as well as helping others to do so. It also saw that the challenges facing some sectors, e.g. the agricultural industry, were the same whatever language they spoke, and we have worked bilingually with farming families since 1997. Commercial and advisory services were provided and a number of innovative projects were also developed which did not only target Welsh speakers, but targeted wider groups (including Welsh speakers). An example of this is Ffatri Fenter. European funding was secured for the project and following a period of research and planning money was secured for a national project targeting young people 16 - 30 years of age to encourage and support them to trial a business. As it was Menter a Busnes who managed the project, with understanding and experience in ways of working with the Welsh culture, a higher percentage of Welsh speakers were attracted as clients for the project.

The company's expertise in targeting Welsh speakers remains today. Offering a quality high service for Welsh speakers continues to be one of the company's main values, and one of its unique selling points, and this is certainly advantageous when competing for work.

Current Policy

The company's main language of communication is Welsh, reflecting its core mission of promoting enterprise and commercial confidence amongst Welsh speakers. By doing so, Menter a Busnes sees the Welsh language as a central and key feature of its own identity and recognises the practical and economic value of maintaining that Welsh identity in the future.

Internal communication

The company's internal communication language is mainly Welsh, which includes formal and informal spoken communication and all written communication including e-mails, reports etc. However, as the company has grown and provided more mainstream services and 'inherited' some non-Welsh speaking workers through TUPE processes, we now provide bilingual intranet content; also any e-mails directed to all staff are bilingual. We provide instantaneous translation equipment in full staff meetings.

Service delivery

In view of the company's core mission of promoting enterprise amongst Welsh speakers, the company's services are provided in Welsh as a priority but services to individuals are provided bilingually or based on their individual language choice as appropriate.

However, there may be occasions where the company's services are aimed at the public in general or at a specific bilingual audience. In those cases relevant services are provided bilingually, maintaining the same standards in both languages.

Priority is given to the Welsh language in all bilingual arrangements.

All the company's general direct contact with the public in Wales - written, and in public meetings - will be in Welsh, unless it is aimed at a specific bilingual audience where the contact will be bilingual with priority given to the Welsh language.

The company's contact with individuals - on the phone or in non-public meetings - will be in the individual's chosen language, either English or Welsh. Menter a Busnes staff are responsible for providing that preferred language.

The Current Situation

Menter a Busnes has not received any core funding for many years now, and there is increasing pressure to secure income when managing large-scale projects and undertaking commercial work. The place of the Welsh language currently remains strong in the company, but the feeling is that it is increasingly under siege:

- Pressure resulting from the way in which the Government awards tenders. The tendency is to group several related projects together and ask providers to tender for it all. When Menter a Busnes has been delivering a project and wants to

tender for a follow-up project, it has to consider tendering for a group of projects, either on its own, or as part of a consortium. This means, if we are awarded the projects, we are forced to take on a number of staff from other organisations under TUPE regulations, some of them usually non-Welsh speakers. An example of this is the Business Wales tender.

- Being part of a consortium delivering services means there is a risk of diluting the Welsh language policy. Efforts are made to persuade some partners of the importance of the language. On saying that I would say that we are gaining some ground here - and having Menter a Busnes as part of the consortium improves the bilingualism of the service as a whole.
- Pressure from some Government departments refusing to accept Welsh invoices and other documents, for example. This is contrary to their policy of course - but it still happens.
- Comments from Government staff and advisors on Menter a Business's policy of recruiting Welsh speakers. The ESiW project was an example where we had to argue for having Welsh speakers and find indirect ways of ensuring that we recruit Welsh speakers for the posts.
- Practical pressure sometimes resulting from difficulties in recruiting the necessary skills from a fairly limited labour market of Welsh speakers.

In summary

Despite the difficulties and threats noted above, Menter a Busnes is an example of a successful business which also uses the Welsh language. Between 2003 and 2013 the company's turnover has increased 350% and staff numbers have increased from 35 to 85 (and 50 others work free-lance or contractually). The vast majority of the company's employees are bilingual with 6 enthusiastic learners and 3 non-Welsh speakers.

Response to consultation questions

In response to the linguistic-economy consultation the comments below are a collection of comments agreed by the senior management team.

Although Menter a Busnes contributes to policy development in areas relevant to the company's work, and also carries out some research work in those areas, I would like to stress that Menter a Busnes is essentially a service delivery business. The company is a practitioner which operates based on a quarter a century of trying to contribute to economic development in Wales. Therefore although the evidence or comments are quite anecdotal - I would hope that they have some credibility based on working face-to-face with businesses on a daily basis for many years.

- a. How can using the Welsh language and bilingualism help businesses to grow and support economic development?**

- b. How can economic development increase the use of the Welsh language?**
- c. How can the public sector increase use of the Welsh language through its impact on the local economy?**
- d. Examples of good practice in the employment of Welsh speaking workers**
- e. Examples of businesses who have benefitted from marketing themselves as those who use the Welsh language**
- f. Suggestions for facilitating the work of promoting economic development and the Welsh language together**

a. How can using the Welsh language and bilingualism help businesses to grow and support economic development?

- Menter a Busnes aims to be one of the *'Leading Welsh economic development companies which excels by being bilingual and creative'*. There is a great deal of emphasis within the company on protecting the standard of services offered and we get work mainly through competitive tendering based on previous success. The company places a great deal of emphasis on meeting ambitious targets and giving customers the best possible service. Menter a Busnes sees the Welsh language as an integral part of the standard of service offered and not as something separate. We believe that other companies can benefit commercially by considering bilingualism as an integral part of the quality of service, trying to ensure that a bilingual service is synonymous with quality.
- As a company we have three unique selling points and the ability to provide a fully bilingual service is one of them. This could also be a consideration for companies in other areas e.g. is there a company in the health sector with an unique selling point of delivering a bilingual service etc? The use of the language enables companies to provide a unique or different service or product and stand out from competitors.
- The support which we provide aims to help the economic performance of those businesses which we are trying to help. The effect on the Welshness of those businesses, and the use made by them of the Welsh language is secondary in reality. However, it is clear officers who can speak Welsh are more likely to have a positive influence on the bilingualism of the companies whom we help. Therefore it is extremely important that Welsh Government business support services (whoever gets the contract to deliver it) are able to influence companies during key periods e.g. when the business is being established, when the business is preparing marketing material and campaigns, when the business is expanding etc *"intervention points for business support."*
- The use of the Welsh language allows companies to provide a comprehensive service for customers in Wales. When we consider that 20% of the population speaks Welsh it is a basic business principle to be able to deal with customers in their preferred language. Bilingualism shows respect for customer needs and is a cornerstone of good customer care - which is an essential part of the success of any business. This can also lead to customer loyalty - opting to support businesses who use Welsh. Similarly it can ensure the loyalty of local staff - who

are more likely to remain with the business offering stability in the staff team - which is also essential before anyone considers growing the business.

- Some Welsh events and festivals can have a very positive effect on local and national economies e.g. the Urdd Eisteddfod and National Eisteddfod - which commission regular research to assess the financial value and economic impact. There are also smaller cultural events such as Gŵyl Gerdd Dant, Eisteddfod Powys, local rock festivals etc. When we consider all these activities as a whole they make a major contribution to the Welsh economy. But perhaps more could be done - see (f).
- Of course some businesses are based on the Welsh language and culture. The Scoping Study commissioned by the linguistic-economic group and completed by Martin Rhisiart refers to those sectors where there is the best chance for growth and these include:
 1. Television, radio and film
 2. Publishing, books, magazines, records
 3. Libraries and Museums
 4. Education
 5. Agri-food
 6. Health and Social
 7. Public Administration
 8. Leisure and Tourism and the Environment
 9. Financial and Business

There are already numerous examples of successful businesses in some of these sectors, which employ many people and which make a very important contribution to the economy in Wales, but I would agree with the results of the study that there is potential for further growth within many of these sectors. But perhaps more could be done - see (f).

- When we consider in more detail the contribution made by one of the sectors noted above, namely tourism, the relationship with the Welsh language can be unclear and even controversial (i.e. does attracting visitors increase the number of incomers? etc). On the other hand it also offers an opportunity to develop a unique 'product'. There is increasing curiosity in culture and heritage and there are businesses which offer elements of this to customers e.g. local tour guides. A company such as *Y Gorau o Gymru* (first winner of the Gorsedd y Dreigiau competition) focuses on the Welsh language within the business. They now employ 6 people and are an example of a young and contemporary business showing how technology can allow the establishment of national/international businesses in very rural locations (www.ygorauogymru.co.uk). There are also examples of schemes which combine local food and drink with Welsh culture as part of the whole holiday experience, and again this can strengthen the contribution which tourism makes to the local economy e.g. Cwrw Llŷn (www.cwrwlllyn.com).
- Companies which recognise the different language and culture can have a better understanding of the importance of culture in foreign markets. Business advice

on developing foreign markets always notes that understanding a country's culture is essential in establishing a successful export relationship. A country's culture is based on a number of factors including social organisations, language, education, religion, history, arts and many other things. Do Welsh businesses use their understanding of culture to increase export?

- Use of the Welsh language in some sectors could lead to specific opportunities in Wales e.g. Welsh helpline - if a company has recognised the need to provide a bilingual service they will usually set up a helpline service within a call centre located in Wales, rather than in England or abroad. Similarly policy developments have led to developing the translation sector in Wales which is a major employer. But how many of these companies would be able to add another one or two languages as part of their service?

b. How can economic development increase the use of the Welsh language?

- Encouragement and support is needed to develop local businesses in all parts of Wales and national and regional policies can play a part in this. There is a tendency to develop policies in a vacuum with no consideration given to the direct or indirect effect this could have on the Welsh language. For this reason policy development should be considered holistically across sectors, in particular as regards economic development, planning, education, tourism, the arts and purchasing. Indeed purchasing, tendering and grant allocation policies are in a position to have a major influence on the use made of the Welsh language and the linguistic landscape.
- Special consideration must be given to investing in the heartlands to develop businesses which are compatible with local needs. Improving the infrastructure, roads, IT etc is part of the picture, but we also need to increase young people's confidence in the language and its (economic) value and convince them that successful businesses can be established in more rural areas. It is logical to think that local businesses would try to trade in the long term and also be more likely to make natural use of the Welsh language within their businesses.
- The Welsh language and culture should be a more prominent part of marketing campaigns to sell Wales, e.g. leisure venues - tourism, business locations. This would help raise awareness of the language and culture.
- Visual use of the language not only within workplaces but also when packaging products helps to create the customer's curiosity and promotes the use of the language. Some companies may need support with translation, bilingual packaging and marketing etc.
- We need to ensure that business support providers are not only able to provide a bilingual service but that they are proactive in trying to secure this. Menter a Busnes is an example in the field of economic development but similar companies are needed in all areas. All types of support providers are in a position to be able to convince people of the benefits of using the Welsh

language. Some companies will of course need support to allow this to happen, e.g. help with recruitment policies, improving linguistic skills, producing marketing materials etc.

- Menter a Busnes's ability to provide a bilingual service is taken as read and this helps us to win tenders and other work. Welsh workplaces must be protected and promoted. In the introduction we mention that the company feels under siege at times in this respect. *A Living Language: A Language for Living* notes that using the language outside education is the greatest challenge for the Welsh language, and I would think that social use and use in the workplace are the two main opportunities to tackle this. Therefore it is crucial that people have more opportunities to use the language in the workplace - and that they are aware of which companies offer those opportunities. Once again some companies would certainly need support with policies and implementation to help them become a Welsh workplace.
- We need to ensure that businesses are able to operate effectively through the medium of Welsh. Natural use of information technology is one consideration and the ability to communicate with other businesses and with public bodies across Wales is essential if we are serious about promoting Welsh workplaces.
- Menter a Busnes is part of a consortium which provides the 'Business Wales' service and it was noted in the winning tender that at least a third of staff speak Welsh. Most of these are within Menter a Busnes at the moment but expertise, linguistic skills and other skills can be shared across the consortium. Menter a Busnes is able to help other partners to better understand how to provide for Welsh speakers. Unless we protect the Welsh workplace within the company it will all be seriously weakened and we have seen this happen with other companies over the years when they have compromised on the company's linguistic skills.

c. How can the public sector increase use of the Welsh language through its impact on the local economy?

- Lead by example would be the best way!
- Offer support for local/native businesses. This could be in the form of resources or favourable terms, e.g. business locations (of the customer's choice) or favourable taxation (linked to staff employment possibly?)
- A deliberate attempt to attract talent back to areas which have lost a high percentage of young people, e.g. a Local Authority could work with local businesses to partially sponsor students in sectors with an economic potential in the county.
- Promote career opportunities in linguistic heartlands. Some years ago now Menter a Busnes ran a tracking scheme called *Llwybro* for the Welsh Government - recording the details of all 16 year old pupils in Wales and keeping in contact with them - detailing opportunities within the economy in Wales. There are tens of thousands of records of this database - which still exists somewhere

in Welsh Government. We need to re-establish a similar process to try to attract talent back to Wales and back to the heartlands. Technological developments and the use of social media can certainly facilitate the process and make it more effective now.

- Decentralise more public body staff; the allocation of jobs helps in more rural areas.
- Develop planning policies which consider the language.
- Ensure that any grants include conditions relating to the Welsh language.
- Prepare affordable homes policies which meet the area's needs.
- Support use of the language outside education especially socially and within workplaces.
- Better assess the linguistic ability of staff and prospective staff. There is inconsistency in public body provision as this does not happen.
- Ensure that people can contribute in meetings in their preferred language.

f. Suggestions on how to facilitate developments which would promote economic development and the Welsh language together

Menter a Busnes is convinced that the economic potential of the Welsh language is not being realised at present. Similarly its economic development could contribute more towards increasing use of the Welsh language.

We believe that there are a several different elements where it could contribute positively towards increasing the contribution of the Welsh language towards the economy in Wales. These include:

- Policy developments (across departments) - nationally and regionally
- Developing emotional and psychological confidence, self-confidence and pride in using the Welsh language
- Specific help for business to help them operate as bilingual businesses and as Welsh workplaces
- Specific measures on tracking career paths and attracting native talent back to Wales and the linguistic heartlands
- **Deliberate attempt to facilitate linguistic-economic developments which would not happen otherwise, or which would not happen quickly enough** (we will expand on this point below)

The linguistic-economic discussion group established in 2004 led by Andrew Davies, the Minister for Economic Development and Transport, has learnt many lessons on the relationship between language and the economy, and this review will certainly provide further understanding.

The linguistic-economic discussion group ended in 2011. There was a feeling for some time that the group had achieved what it could within its original function. The frustration felt by some of us at the time was that the group did not have any powers or resources to stimulate or drive further action in this area. Menter a Busnes was responsible for providing administrative support for the linguistic-economic group.

Towards the end of the group's life a paper was commissioned by Adam Price entitled *Gwerth* outlining the possible direction for developing the linguistic-economic area. Essentially the paper suggested that an entity was needed to consider policy issues and other issues and that a separate entity was also needed to stimulate activity. It is fair to say that the paper had a luke-warm reception from members of the group at the time, but I feel that some of the recommendations relating to its model have real merits - and would answer some of the points noted above at least.

The main point which we would agree with is the need for what Adam calls "a laboratory of ideas, a hatchery and accelerator". The weakness of the *Gwerth* paper is perhaps that it does not expand sufficiently on how this can be achieved. We have something similar in mind when we talk of deliberate intervention as referred to above. We believe that individuals and companies who could develop new businesses could be identified where the language would play a central role, businesses which could make an important contribution to the Welsh economy and businesses which would also make a contribution to increasing the use of the Welsh language.

We believe that these businesses could come from the public sector, the private sector and the third sector.

When considering successful linguistic-economic businesses in all of these sectors, our experience suggests that there are some common elements:

- Individual/Leader with strong convictions and who leads by example (it is also helpful to have others within the same company/organisation who have the same strong beliefs)
- That Welsh language values become part of the company's values - and that they are shared and adopted by the whole team
- That there is a desire within the individual and company to achieve more in relation to the language and the economy.

When these elements come together there is an opportunity to realise the potential which the language and economy can make to each other.

We would be very aware of companies and organisations who fall into this category but who perhaps have failed to fulfil their potential for different reasons e.g.:

- Focusing on the main business and no consideration as to what the linguistic dimension could add to the business
- Focusing on the linguistic/cultural dimension with no consideration given to the economic potential
- Lack of resources, whether staff, time or funding, to pursue identified opportunities
- Lack of skills, contacts or partners to realise new schemes.

Experienced business facilitators/mentors working in depth with companies would be able to provide the deliberate intervention needed to realise the opportunities.

Task and Finish Group on Welsh Language and Economic Development

Call for Evidence - Cwmni Theatr Arad Goch

I only became aware of this task and finish group's work very recently - a sign, perhaps, that the creative industries for young people, beyond the mass media, are not included when discussing economic issues. I know that the closing date for comments has passed but I send you some comments below in the hope that they will still prove useful.

Background

Cwmni Theatr Arad Goch is a production company with its headquarters in Aberystwyth.

Arad Goch specialises in creating contemporary and challenging theatre for young audiences, children and families. The company produces work on a small and medium scale for its different audiences and for different locations: the productions are performed in theatres, art centres, community centres or schools across Wales. The company works closely with arts organisations and community groups across Wales promoting its work.

Arad Goch has a history of working successfully with other bodies and organisations; this contributes to funding the work, to its development and to its credibility for new audiences. During the year the company has worked with Urdd Gobaith Cymru, Llenyddiaeth Cymru and the National Library of Wales to create new productions. As well as partners in Wales, Arad Goch works widely at an international level. The company has performed in many foreign counties in Europe, America and Asia; Arad Goch was recently invited to perform in the Veliky Novgorod Festival in Russia and next year it will be performing in South Korea. Arad Goch runs the *AGOR DRYSAU-OPENING DOORS Wales International Festival of Performing Arts for Young Audiences* which is held every other year in Aberystwyth and other towns in Wales; some of the best world performances are invited to Wales; it also acts as a shop window to promote work from Wales internationally as festival and theatre directors are invited from other countries. The company has co-produced with producers from Ireland, Japan and Australia.

In 2008 a new purpose-built centre was opened for the company in Aberystwyth town centre with practice and performing spaces, production and administrative resources, archives, video production and music resources. The centre is used widely by the company itself, by other artists, both professional and amateur, by members of the community and by businesses and other organisations. In addition to this centre the company owns one industrial unit for 'hard' resources, touring equipment, a workshop, and set, props, and costumes storerooms.

The company has several inclusive schemes for young people including drama clubs, video courses and dance workshops. The centre's resources are used to encourage and enable young people to develop their ideas and their own work.

The centre is also used to offer opportunities for other professional artists: in 2011 a new Resident Artist scheme was started, where three young artists are invited to use the centre and its resources, as well as the knowledge and experience of Arad Goch staff, to create new work to display in the centre.

Arad Goch runs many international schemes, the most important of which is AGOR DRYSAU – OPENING DOORS Wales International Festival of Performing Arts for Young Audiences which is held every other year. The aim of the festival is three-fold: (i) enable Welsh young audiences to see some of the best productions in the world; (ii) contribute to the professional development of theatre practitioners in Wales and enable them to consider their work within a wider geographical, linguistically and cultural context and (iii) act as a shop window for work produced in Wales to export it to other countries. The company has a wide network of links with international producers and artists.

Arad Goch's total audience and participant numbers in 2011-12 was 24578. The corresponding figure in 2010-12 was 23623; the corresponding figure 4 years earlier, 2007-8, was 18179.

a) How can using the Welsh language and bilingualism help businesses to grow and support economic development?

Cwmni Theatr Arad Goch operates solely through the medium of Welsh. Welsh is the company's operational language. All the company's productions are created in Welsh and some of them are translated into English to ensure that young non-Welsh speaking audiences have access to Welsh theatre.

The company has aimed to develop new markets for theatre in the Welsh language and visited specific non-theatre locations way before the term 'site-specific' became popular. One of the main factors in this respect is the company's history of working with local organisations - some of them voluntary organisations, others organisations funded to promote the Welsh language, such as the Welsh language initiatives.

It is interesting to note that the Welsh language theatre companies which toured communities in the 80s relies to a large extent on local volunteers to promote professional theatrical events. Although this still happens, it now happens to a less extent perhaps due to career demands. Therefore the Welsh language initiatives are essential in promoting cultural events.

b) How can economic development increase use of the Welsh language?

c) How can the public sector increase use of the Welsh language through its impact on the local economy?

Arad Goch Centre

When establishing Canolfan Arad Goch in 2008 (with a substantial grant of over £3 million from several sources) the aim was to develop a Welsh centre for the performing arts for young audiences - the only purpose-built centre of its kind. In addition to providing excellent production resources for the company itself, opportunities and resources are provided for other professional artists and for the 'community', especially young people.

The main focus is on the Welsh language as an operational and creative language - aiming to give status and credibility to creative activities through the medium of Welsh.

The company now has a policy of inviting 3 residential artists working through the medium of Welsh to use the centre for free. The three artists, who change periodically, contribute to the centre's dialogue and activities whilst the company mentors them in promotional and professional development skills, showing them how to work practically and creatively with young people and how to develop wider audiences for their work.

Many creative activities are organised for young people in the centre. Several important factors are involved of course, including enabling young people to use the Welsh language, or working and enjoying in a Welsh atmosphere outside education; the activities include drama clubs, film, video and sound recording workshops and art work and graffiti.

The centre is also used by groups of students studying theatre and the arts in English at university - many of them have been isolated from the culture and bilingualism which surrounds them. After having an opportunity to work in a Welsh speaking creative environment with members of Arad Goch, many of them start using a little bit of Welsh and some go on to learn the language for professional reasons. Providing a Welsh workplace, therefore, attracts positive interest; this is also true of some young people who come to the centre who have turned their backs on formal secondary education through the medium of Welsh but who have re-engaged with the language as a result of the creative and positive atmosphere around them.

Evidence from Gari Wyn Jones, Ceir Cymru, Bethel, Gwynedd and Glasfryn, Conwy

What is your policy?

Our policy (which is not written on paper!) is simple. Every aspect of the business is administered and managed through the medium of Welsh. We wouldn't employ anyone non-Welsh speaking – just one out of 15 of the staff would ruin the natural linguistic “hwyl” and ethos of the workplace. We expect our sellers and advisers to answer the phone and greet customers in Welsh, whether they are Welsh speaking or not. We ensure that it is done politely and pleasantly. We have a policy of trying to help learners to use Welsh as around 80% of people in our business catchment area understand Welsh and at least 70% speak it naturally. We produce our bills in Welsh, but strangely only a few of the mechanics/ technicians will produce them. Its difficult to get them to write a bill in Welsh.

While we buy a lot of supplies from English companies we also provide the opportunity to Welsh companies to offer competitive prices for their goods.

Why use Welsh?

Bilingualism raises the standard and status of the business in the eyes of our “preferred customers”- that is customers with money to spend! The social fun that can be had using two languages with customers is key. To enjoy all aspects of business is paramount and improves the morale of customers, staff and suppliers.

Business conscience is important. If our children are to continue to receive education through Welsh then the Assembly and businesses of all types need to convince all sectors of society that we have a duty to preserve and use our greatest treasure as a nation and society – i.e. the Welsh Language. There is a need to promote the idea of business conscience and the fun and the profits that can come with it. This is the answer to the fourth bullet point in terms of companies that do not use Welsh.

Using Welsh in business improves product quality and supply as it acts as a “packaging ” on goods - it gives a shine and the status to what is being sold.

The expensive clothing boutiques in major European cities frequently use three languages on their labels. I saw a shop in Paris recently that used 5 languages (!) on its label

What difference?

The use of Welsh increases the status of the business - it shows that the love of money is not the only motivating factor for business leaders. Over the years, thousands of English people have bought cars from us and were amazed and taken by our use of Welsh. Many even jealous of this and reflect on their loss with

sentences like "I wish I would have learnt Welsh at school / I wish I could speak Welsh".

Using Welsh also provides 'academic respect' to business. In our case, it is one of our main keys to success.