



Llywodraeth Cymru
Welsh Government

Language, Work and Bilingual Services

The Welsh Government's
response to the Report of the
Working Group on the Welsh
Language and Local Government

October 2016

Mae'r ddogfen yma hefyd ar gael yn Gymraeg.
This document is also available in Welsh.

1. Introduction

Language, Work and Bilingual Services,¹ the Report of the Working Group on the Welsh Language and Local Government, was published following an oral statement in the Senedd on 14 June by the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government. In the statement, the Cabinet Secretary said:

*"I am announcing today's report for a period of engagement over the summer [...] I welcome the opportunity to listen to the views of local government and other stakeholders as we consider the conclusions of the report, and before publication of the Welsh Government response in the autumn. "*²

The Report was originally commissioned by the Minister for Public Services in the context of the Welsh Government's proposals at the time to merge the Local Authorities.

On the 5 May elections were held to the Assembly. Since then, the Welsh Ministers have published the programme for government, *Taking Wales Forward 2016-2021*, and made a number of important statements regarding the priorities of the Welsh Government for the Welsh language and for Local Government.³ In addition, on 23 June a referendum was held which asked whether the United Kingdom should remain a member of the European Union, with a majority vote in favour of leaving the EU. The Welsh Government's main priority is to protect the interests of Wales as the UK leaves the EU.

Taken together, these important changes provide the framework for the Welsh Government's response to the Report and recommendations of the Working Group. Most of the recommendations in the Report can be implemented as part of the Welsh Government's priorities for the Welsh language, Local Government reform and economic development.

Local Government Reform

The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government issued a written statement on 12 July in publishing the responses to the consultation on draft Local Government (Wales) Bill.⁴ The statement said:

"There was, however, no consensus on the future structure of local government. While the case for change is clear, and widely recognised, the responses do not provide a similar agreement on solutions to some key challenges. Over the summer I will look at all the options, and will consider all ideas put to me. "

Following these discussions, on 4 October, the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government made a statement setting a new direction for Local Government reform. The

¹<http://gov.wales/topics/localgovernment/language-work-and-bilingual-services/?skip=1&lang=en>

²<http://gov.wales/about/cabinet/cabinetstatements/2016-new/welshlanguagelocalgovernment/?skip=1&lang=en>

³<http://gov.wales/about/programme-for-government/?lang=en>

⁴<http://gov.wales/about/cabinet/cabinetstatements/2016-new/58422520/?skip=1&lang=en>

programme of Local Authority mergers as envisaged in the draft Bill will no longer be implemented and the Principal Authorities will continue in their current form. The intention is to increase the scope and depth of formal collaboration between Local Authorities at a regional level. There will be a period of further engagement with Local Government and other stakeholders on these proposals during the next few months.

The Welsh Language

Important statements were also made in the light of the aim of the new Welsh Government to achieve a million Welsh speakers by 2050.

On 12 July, the Minister for Lifelong Learning and the Welsh Language made an oral statement highlighting his priorities for the coming year, noting⁵

“It’s our responsibility as Government to set direction, but it is also essential that we all as a nation take ownership of the challenge.”

In that statement, the Minister announced plans to consult on a new strategy for the Welsh language and to review the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011 (the "2011 Measure"), with a view to introducing a Bill following the review:

“In his statement at the beginning of this Assembly, the First Minister said that the Welsh Government will seek to amend the Welsh language Measure. The Measure was passed at a time when the devolution settlement was different, so it is timely for us to review the Measure and that work will start during this year. It’s too early at present to set out the details of what will be in the new Bill, but I’m keen to look again at the Measure to ensure that the legislative basis for the Welsh language is appropriate, up to date and makes the process for imposing standards less bureaucratic.”

The Minister notes also priorities in the field of education planning, the role of the National Centre for Learning Welsh, the Welsh for Kids programme, supporting individuals to speak Welsh and promoting the use of the language among children and young people.

The Minister announced the consultation on a new strategy for the Welsh language, *A million Welsh speakers by 2050*, on 1 August.⁶ The strategy proposes six development areas, including planning and language policy, normalisation, education, people, support and rights.

Also on 1 August the Cabinet Secretary for Education announced she was setting up a task and finish group to review the activities of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol.⁷ The review will

⁵ <http://gov.wales/about/cabinet/cabinetstatements/2016-new/welshlanguage/?skip=1&lang=en>

⁶ <http://gov.wales/about/cabinet/cabinetstatements/2016-new/welshlangstrategy/?skip=1&lang=en>

⁷ <http://gov.wales/about/cabinet/cabinetstatements/2016-new/colgcyymraegcenedlaethol/?skip=1&lang=en>

consider the role of the Coleg for the future, its relationship with the Further Education sector and will inform policy and funding decisions.

2. Engagement on the report

The report was published on the website of the Welsh Government and responses to it were invited. Nine responses were received. The respondents include individuals or committees from Carmarthenshire, Neath Port Talbot and Isle of Anglesey Councils, Cardiff and Bangor Universities, the National Centre for Learning Welsh, Cymdeithas Cyfieithwyr Cymru, the Welsh Language Commissioner and Cymdeithas yr Iaith. The full responses and a thematic summary are published on the Welsh Government website.⁸

⁸ <http://gov.wales/topics/localgovernment/language-work-and-bilingual-services/?skip=1&lang=en>

3. Welsh Government response to the recommendations

RECOMMENDATION 1(a): The Welsh Government should articulate an ambitious vision and publish a new strategy for the Welsh language as a matter of urgency.

The Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language published a new draft Welsh language strategy on 1 August 2016, in accordance with the duty in section 78 of the Government of Wales Act 2006. The new strategy incorporates an ambitious vision and the Welsh Government's long-term aim for the language, namely *A million Welsh speakers by 2050*. The three-month public consultation on the strategy closes on 31 October 2016. The final strategy will show how the Welsh Government is taking steps to achieve its relevant well-being objectives under the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 (the "2015 Act").

On the basis of responses to the consultation, the Welsh Government will publish its final strategy during 2017, along with action plans for the short and medium term. Section 5 of the draft strategy focuses on some of the actions that are needed in the first five years, and the areas where there is a need to develop detailed policies to ensure that resources are prioritised appropriately.

RECOMMENDATION 1(b): the Welsh Government, on the basis of its long-term strategy for the Welsh language, should revise and introduce amendments to the 2011 Measure and introduce a Welsh Language Bill in the Assembly during the term of the fifth National Assembly (2016 – 2021).

It is appropriate to keep the 2011 Measure under review for several reasons. The Welsh Government and the Welsh Language Commissioner now have experience of implementing the Measure. Our experience of the system of standards to date suggests that there is a need to simplify the process of formulating and setting standards. We agree that there is scope to revisit the Measure and the processes involved. The Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language has announced that we will start on that work once the vision in the final strategy is set and introduce a new Bill in due course.

In *A million Welsh speakers by 2050*, we set out how we want to develop a better balance between promotion, legislation and regulation. The response to the consultation on the strategy will help us to consider this further as part of the review of the 2011 Measure.

RECOMMENDATION 1(c): the Welsh Government should support these measures with a visible campaign to raise awareness of the position and importance of the Welsh language in our public life.

Raising awareness of the scope and importance of the Welsh language in our public life is an integral part of the Welsh Government's efforts to promote the Welsh language under our current strategy, and that will continue into the future under the aegis of the new strategy.

We look forward to considering the responses to the consultation on the strategy in terms of our proposals to improve goodwill towards the Welsh language in order to "normalise" further.

RECOMMENDATION 2(a): the Welsh Government should legislate to ensure that a statutory level of proficiency in Welsh is essential for the following posts in Local Government in Wales: the head of paid service and chief executive; the corporate director with responsibility for human resources; the director of education; the director of social services.

Recommendations 2(a) and 3 are related.

There was a lack of unanimity on these recommendations amongst the Working Group members. One member was of the opinion "*these recommendations could not be implemented in some or many areas of Local Government in Wales*". Putting to one side any question of the potential conflict between such a policy and equality legislation (raised by respondents from Cardiff University), even respondents who are in principle supportive of the two recommendations draw attention to the practical challenges such a policy would raise in terms of recruitment and the shortage of Welsh language skills in the employment market, including for senior management, technical and professional roles.

The Welsh Language Commissioner and respondents from Cardiff University stress that the guiding principle hitherto in Wales (and elsewhere e.g. the Basque Country, New Brunswick) has been that there should be a direct relationship between the requirements of the post itself and the Welsh language skills of the post holder. The Welsh Government agrees with this principle, which is the basis for the relevant standards under the 2011 Measure.

The standards regime, as it has been applied to Local Authorities by the Commissioner, requires Local Authorities to assess the language skills requirements relating to all new or vacant posts. This gives them flexibility to design roles and undertake workforce planning in ways which maximise the distribution of Welsh language skills requirements in the organisation. The Welsh Language Commissioner has a statutory responsibility to monitor and enforce the standards. We note in her response that the Commissioner says:

"under the standards regime the Commissioner has the ability to ask to see assessments undertaken by organisations and in due course it will be possible to learn what kind of assessments are being conducted and the extent to which organisations are responding to the duty positively."

There is also a strong argument that the Welsh Government's strategic objective – a million Welsh speakers by 2050 – would be compromised if there was a loss of popular goodwill towards the language. The Welsh Government agrees with the Welsh language Commissioner in her five-year report, *The Position of the Welsh Language 2012 – 2015*, that it is "*reasonable to assume that a favourable attitude towards the Welsh language is a prerequisite for use of Welsh.*" Building and maintaining a favourable attitude towards the

language is essential as part of a strategy of 'normalisation'. A policy of imposing skills requirements, unrelated to the requirements of the post, would threaten this goodwill.

The Welsh Government agrees that there is a need for leadership on the Welsh language from those who lead our public services. On balance, however, we conclude that Recommendation 2(a) is impractical and that it would not be wise to break the principle that there is a direct link between the requirements for Welsh language skills and the requirements of the post.

RECOMMENDATION 2(b): If you do not already possess the required linguistic skills, the legislation should place statutory duties on Local Authorities to provide suitable training and set aside time for the individuals in question in order to enable them to acquire the essential language skills.

Recommendation 2(b) flows from Recommendation 2(a). Although the Welsh Government does not accept Recommendation 2(a), we recognise the importance of Recommendation 2(b).

The standards that have been prescribed for application by the Commissioner to Local Authorities provide for this (the Welsh Language Standards (No. 1) Regulations 2015 ("the 2015 Regulations")). Standard 130 places a duty on bodies to provide basic Welsh language lessons *during working hours* (our emphasis), and training for staff on its use, and standard 131 places a duty on bodies to provide further training for staff who have received basic training. Standard 129 places a duty on bodies to train staff on how to use the language effectively in key situations – meetings, interviews and complaints and disciplinary procedures.

It is for the Commissioner to impose these duties on bodies and monitor compliance.

RECOMMENDATION 2(c): the Welsh Government should direct Academi Wales (and any other national institution which provides leadership training for the public sector in Wales) in order to ensure that the Welsh language is given prominence in the principles of One Public Service and that Academi Wales provides training for leaders of the public service on the challenges and responsibilities facing leaders in a bilingual country.

Academi Wales is part of the Welsh Government and therefore subject to the standards regime, as well as the well-being duty under section 3 of the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015. The well-being goals include *A Wales of vibrant culture and thriving Welsh language*.

The Commissioner notes that from 30 September 2016 Academi Wales will be expected to comply with standard 84 which provides, ' *If you offer an education course that is open to the public, you must offer it in Welsh* '. Education course is interpreted in Schedule 1, Part 3, paragraph 44 of the Regulations as, ' *any seminar, training, workshop or similar provision which is provided in order to educate or improve the skills of members of the public.* '

In addition, Academi Wales has commissioned research into leadership and management skills in a bilingual country and has received the research report and the supporting recommendations. This is currently being reviewed and a commission specification will be drafted based on the recommendation to procure a programme with open access across the public sector to senior leaders. It is anticipated that the first cohorts will take place during 2017/18.

RECOMMENDATION 3: Welsh language skills should be essential for all new posts in every Local Authority in Wales.

As noted above, Recommendations 2(a) and 3 are related.

There was a lack of unanimity on these recommendations amongst the Working Group members. One member was of the opinion *“these recommendations could not be implemented in some or many areas of Local Government in Wales”*. Putting to one side any question of the potential conflict between such a policy and equality legislation (raised by respondents from Cardiff University), even respondents who are in principle supportive of the two recommendations draw attention to the practical challenges such a policy would raise in terms of recruitment and the shortage of Welsh language skills in the employment market. The Welsh Language Commissioner notes in her response:

“before legislating in this area it would be necessary to ensure the current educational system in Wales can meet these ... needs” [...] “Education is the main source of Welsh speakers today ... Based on the evidence available, it appears that there has not been a significant increase in the numbers receiving education or care through the medium of Welsh in recent years’.”

The Welsh Language Commissioner and respondents from Cardiff University stress that the guiding principle hitherto in Wales (and elsewhere e.g. the Basque Country, New Brunswick) has been that there should be a direct relationship between the requirements of the post itself and the Welsh language skills of the post holder. The Welsh Government agrees with this principle, which is the basis for the relevant standards under the 2011 Measure and which the Welsh Language Commissioner has a statutory responsibility to monitor and enforce.

There is also a strong argument that the Welsh Government’s strategic objective – a million Welsh speakers by 2050 – would be compromised if there was a loss of popular goodwill towards the language. Building and maintaining goodwill towards the language is essential as part of a strategy of ‘normalisation’. A policy of imposing skills requirements, unrelated to the requirements of the post, would threaten this goodwill.

On balance, we conclude that Recommendation 3 is impractical and that it would not be wise to break the principle that there is a direct link between the requirements for Welsh language skills and the requirements of posts in Local Authorities.

RECOMMENDATION 4: Local Authorities, including in their function as Local Education Authorities, should be under a statutory duty to undertake workforce planning in terms of linguistic skills, and where required, to provide suitable training to meet those needs.

The current standards regime applicable to Local Authorities provides for workforce planning in terms of linguistic skills and for the provision of suitable training. Paragraph 5 of Schedule 3 to 2015 Regulations, namely standards 127-135, relate directly to "*standards relating to a body developing Welsh language skills through planning and training its workforce.*"

It is for the Commissioner to impose these standards on bodies and monitor compliance.

RECOMMENDATION 5(a): the National Centre for Learning Welsh should develop a national strategy for Welsh in the workplace by the end of 2016, to be introduced by providers from the beginning of September 2017.

The Welsh Government recognises the importance and urgency of a national strategy revising and improving provision for Welsh in the workplace, in order to assist and support institutions and public services, not only to comply with the standards regime but to be ambitious and innovative for the Welsh language.

The National Centre for Learning Welsh is fully operational since August. The purpose of the Centre is to "*provide strategic leadership for the Welsh for adults sector*".⁹ It is essential that the Centre works jointly with employers and providers to ensure a suitable strategy and provision to support the Welsh Government's objective of *A million Welsh speakers by 2050*.

As well as the actions which they have under the other strategic objectives, the Centre's *Strategic Plan* identifies what they intend to achieve in 2016/17 in relation to Welsh in the workplace under *Strategic Objective 2: develop innovative schemes to ensure opportunities and contexts where learners can use their Welsh with confidence*:

- Consult employers in developing a Welsh in the Workplace Strategy.
- Publish a Welsh in the Workplace Strategy.
- Run a pilot scheme with significant employers.
- Develop active partnerships with bodies in various sectors.
- Discuss informal and semi-formal provision with providers and partners.

⁹ The Centre's *Strategic Plan*, <http://learnwelsh.cymru/swyddi-canolfan-dysgu-cymraeg-cenedlaethol>

RECOMMENDATION 5(b): Commercial suppliers of Welsh language training in the workplace intended for use by the public services should be contracted within the strategic framework set by the National Centre for Learning Welsh.

The Welsh Government agrees that all providers of Welsh in the workplace should be contracted under a strategic framework led by the National Centre for Learning Welsh, primarily to ensure the provision is of high quality and is planned strategically to meet the needs of employers, and to avoid duplication in the development of resources.

The best way to implement this recommendation will be considered as the National Centre for Learning Welsh develops its strategy for Welsh in the Workplace provision, and in line with procurement rules.

Recommendation 5 (c): The Welsh Government should adopt a single national standard Welsh language proficiency framework to be used by the whole of the public sector in Wales.

The current Welsh for Adults curriculum is mapped to the Common European Framework of Reference for languages. The National Centre for Learning Welsh is reviewing the Welsh for Adults curriculum at present in order to create a national framework for learning Welsh, to be used by providers, the public sector and employers in the private sector in future.

Consideration will also be given to how this framework will link with the new curriculum which is being developed for schools, in order to ensure there is one continuum of learning Welsh from cradle to grave.

RECOMMENDATION 6: The Welsh Government should work with the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol and Welsh Universities to ensure that the Welsh-medium MPA/MBA courses are available to future Local Government leaders, and fund 8 places every year for the next five years.

On 1 August, the Cabinet Secretary for Education, Kirsty Williams AM, announced a review of the future role of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol. This will be an opportunity to consider the priorities of the Coleg.

The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol has an important role to ensure that professions of all kinds in Wales benefit from graduates who have been taught and trained through the medium of Welsh. Development of a Welsh-medium MPA/MBA course will increase the opportunities for graduates to continue to study for a higher degree through the medium of Welsh and ensure there is a workforce and leaders in the Local Government sector who possess Welsh language skills.

There is a need to consider how best to achieve this by confirming the needs of the Local Authorities, and to ensure that course content suits the requirements, before developing the capacity and a national structure to deliver the course in an effective manner. The small numbers of potential students will mean that there will be a cost to maintaining the

provision and consideration should be given to the different models of providing such a course which would ensure that the costs and the future of the course is sustainable.

RECOMMENDATION 7: The Welsh Government should establish a Language Technology Board and a language technology fund to provide leadership in this area.

We agree with the recommendation the Welsh Government should establish a Language Technology Board to give direction in the field of language technology. The Welsh Government already invests in work to develop language technologies such as Welsh voice to text technology.

Under *Development area 5: Support* in the draft strategy, the Welsh Government notes this objective:

“Continue to develop the technological and digital provision to enable everyone to live their lives through the medium of Welsh.

How:

- *Invest in projects to create a technological infrastructure (computer assisted translation, artificial intelligence, voice recognition technology etc.) so that Welsh can be used on electronic devices.*
- *Influence the private sector to invest in language technology in Wales, in partnership with the language technology sector internationally.”*

The Welsh Government will consider the responses that come over the period of consultation before publishing a final strategy and action plans in 2017.

RECOMMENDATION 8(a): Increasing the uptake of Welsh-medium services should be a specific aim in the Welsh Government's next strategy for the Welsh language.

Under *Development area 2: Normalisation* in the draft strategy, the Welsh Government notes this objective:

“For the Welsh language to be a natural element of being a citizen in Wales in order to make it relevant to everyone, whether they speak Welsh, English or any other language, and elicit an appreciation of it among people moving to Wales.

How:

- *Foster a situation where it is completely normal for people to use the Welsh language in their dealings with the state and public institutions in Wales.*
- *Increase people’s confidence to use Welsh so that they are more likely to begin conversations in Welsh and choose to use services in Welsh.*
- *Ensure that the Welsh language is more prominent in the audio-visual environment, so that it is evident it has official status and is an integral part of the linguistic landscape of Wales.*

- *Improve our understanding of what affects people’s linguistic practices at key points in their lives by conducting long term longitudinal research.”*

The Welsh Government will consider the responses that come over the period of consultation prior to publication of the final strategy in 2017, as well as action plans.

RECOMMENDATION 8(b): the Welsh Government should Commission a qualitative research to understand the factors and conditions that influence the choices of individuals and) when using the Welsh language at work and b) when using services through the medium of Welsh.

This is being considered as part of the Welsh Government's draft strategy, *A million Welsh speakers by 2050*.

The draft strategy recognises the importance of research which can assist in planning specific behaviour change interventions. For example, it notes the Welsh Government's intention to take steps to improve understanding in the following areas:

- Development area 2: Normalisation *“Improve our understanding of what affects people’s linguistic practices at key points in their lives by conducting long term longitudinal research.”*
- Development area 3: Education *“Use the findings of longitudinal research to ascertain when specific interventions are most likely to increase the rate of progression [between different phases of education and the world of work].”*
- Development area 4: People *“Improve our understanding of the local factors which affect the Welsh language, and of the discussions about how the definition of “community” is evolving, and plan accordingly.”*

We also note the attention that the Commissioner pays to the importance of research in her response to the report.

The Welsh Government will consider the responses to the consultation on the draft strategy before publishing a final strategy and action plans in 2017.

RECOMMENDATION 8(c): On the basis of this research, the Welsh Government should fund effective behavioural change interventions to increase the uptake of Local Government services in Welsh, including digital services, and to promote bilingual administration.

The Welsh Government will continue to fund interventions to increase use of the Welsh language and Welsh language services in order to reach the goal of a million Welsh speakers. We will consider how best to do this in the future in the light of the responses to the consultation on the draft strategy.

RECOMMENDATION 9: The Welsh Government should place a statutory duty on Local Government to promote local economic development, and ensure consideration of the growth and prosperity of the Welsh language as part of that duty.

The Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 sets seven well-being goals which include the following:

- *A prosperous Wales*
- *A Wales of cohesive communities*
- *A Wales of vibrant culture and thriving Welsh language*

Under section 3 of the 2015 Act, every Local Authority must set objectives that are designed to “*maximise its contribution to achieving each of the well-being goals*” and to take “*all reasonable steps (in exercising its functions) to meet those objectives.*” In doing so, they must work in accordance with the sustainable development principle, defined in section 5 of the Act of 2015:

- Long term - The importance of balancing short-term needs with the need to safeguard the ability to also meet long-term needs.
- Prevention - How acting to prevent problems occurring or getting worse may help public bodies meet their objectives.
- Integration of - Considering how the public body’s well-being objectives may impact upon each of the well-being goals, on their other objectives, or on the objectives of other public bodies.
- Collaboration - Acting in collaboration with any other person (or different parts of the body itself) that could help the body to meet its well-being objectives.
- Involvement - The importance of involving people with an interest in achieving the well-being goals, and ensuring that those people reflect the diversity of the area which the body serves.¹⁰

The Auditor General for Wales has a duty under section 15 of the 2015 Act to carry out examinations of all public bodies named in the Act in order to assess the extent to which the body has acted in accordance with the sustainable development principle when setting well-being objectives and taking steps to meet those objectives. There is a general duty on the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (under section 18 of the 2015 Act) to promote the sustainable development principle and to monitor and assess the extent to which public bodies, including Local Authorities, are meeting the well-being objectives they have set.

Taken together, the Welsh Government considers that the 2015 Act places a duty on every Local Authority to integrate economic development, the resilience of communities and support for the vitality of the Welsh language through their decisions and actions.

¹⁰ <http://thewaleswewant.co.uk/about/well-being-future-generations-wales-act-2015/sustainable-development-principle>

RECOMMENDATION 10: The Welsh Government, in a full and equal partnership with Local Government, should develop and implement a linguistic-economic strategy for the counties of Anglesey, Gwynedd, Ceredigion, Carmarthenshire and adjacent and relevant areas, based on the towns of Bangor, Aberystwyth, Carmarthen and Llanelli.

The Welsh Government fully recognises the importance of a thriving economy in rural areas, including the areas identified. Without a thriving economy and good jobs, the position of rural towns and communities could deteriorate with an adverse effect on the language. The programme for government, *Taking Wales Forward 2016-21*, sets out how we will deliver a Wales that is prosperous and secure, healthy and active, ambitious and learning and united and connected. It sets out a very wide range of Welsh Government actions to secure successful and sustainable rural towns and communities, as well as programmes of work to improve public services, housing, digital infrastructure, transport, tourism, business support, education and training, innovation and support for specific sectors and clusters such as the creative industries.

It is important however, that we take a joined-up approach rather than develop a host of strategies for every individual purpose and *Taking Wales Forward* will be underpinned by four major crosscutting strategies. Under the 2015 Act, Local Authorities have a responsibility to provide leadership in the development of well-being plans for their areas through the Public Services Board, plans which integrate both economic development, community and linguistic objectives. Current legislation allows Local Authorities to do so in conjunction with other Local Authorities. The Welsh Government will encourage, support and facilitate formal collaboration of this kind, not only in the city regions, but also in North Wales and West and Mid Wales.

RECOMMENDATION 11: The Welsh Government should monitor the development of the Swansea Bay City region to ensure that the prosperity of the Welsh language in east Carmarthenshire (including Llanelli and the Gwendraeth and Amman Valleys) is a specific priority.

The Welsh Government has sought to encourage and facilitate collaboration across city regions. However, it is ultimately a matter for local partners within the city regions to determine their priorities for development and growth, recognising that there are significant opportunities for the Welsh Language in thriving and well-connected city regions.

Where Local Authorities (and any other bodies subject to the legislation) are exercising any of their functions in respect of city regions, then they are subject to both the standards regime under the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011 as are applied to them by the Commissioner and the well-being goals and other duties under the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015. It is for the Welsh Language Commissioner, the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales and the Auditor General for Wales to monitor and take action as appropriate.

RECOMMENDATION 12: The Welsh Government and our Universities should invest in fundamental research to develop a model which describes the essential elements of an effective linguistic- economic strategy as a basis for further policy development.

The Welsh Government's research priorities will be framed by the development of the four crosscutting strategies, *Prosperous and Secure, Ambitious and Learning, Healthy and Active and United and Connected.*

RECOMMENDATION 13: The Welsh Government should include a section on the trends for the geographical distribution of Welsh speakers over the next 25 years in its first report on likely future trends under the Well-being of Future Generations Act 2015.

Agree.

RECOMMENDATION 14: The Future Generations Commissioner should have regard to linguistic-economic policy and good practice in her work plan, including in the context of the city regions, and report on it in her first Future Generations Report.

This is a matter for the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales.