

A Review of Initial Teacher Training in Wales

Professor Ralph Tabberer

July 2013

Executive Summary

In September 2012, the Minister for Education and Skills announced a review of the quality and consistency of Initial Teacher Training (ITT) in Wales. The review is part of a multi-faceted reform plan designed to raise standards in Welsh schools.

The review followed reorganisation that was undertaken as a result of the Furlong review in 2006, which led to the establishment of three ITT Centres for the different regions in Wales.

Progress to improve ITT since the 2006 review has been slow and Wales does not yet meet the top international benchmarks to which it aspires. Independent inspection evidence is only published on one Centre at the time of this report but the clear signs are that standards across Wales are adequate rather than good. A key challenge remains, namely to ensure that ITT quality and practice become more consistent.

The new Centres have been slow to implement the stronger and more coherent management approach that they need in order to consolidate ITT best practices and to ensure consistently high standards.

In order to raise ITT performance, it is recommended that systematic measures be taken that address all the features that are weak relative to the highest performers globally, such as Singapore, Finland and Canada. This report includes 15 specific recommendations that are intended to bring all the parties together to raise quality in the sector.

The first step is to improve leadership of the sector as a whole in Wales because ITT has tended to be in the margins of school policy and reform. Improvements will require stronger engagement between the regulatory bodies such as the Department for Education and Skills, Estyn, the General Teaching Council for Wales and the Higher Education Council for Wales. The major focus of the engagement should be to raise quality through focused and concerted efforts that cause the ITT providers to raise their game.

It would be helpful if the regulatory bodies, collectively, were to signal even more clearly to schools the importance of strengthening teacher education, both in-service and initial. One recommendation is for Wales to consider a Training School scheme that brings recognition to schools that are excellent in ITT and continuous professional development.

It is recommended that Wales continues with schemes that provide incentives to the highest calibre candidates. Although many courses are successful in recruiting, they do not always get the very best graduates. The Welsh Government should do all in its power to affirm the high status of the teaching profession, so that it attracts the very best in each graduate cohort.

Vice Chancellors, and the senior management of all the Higher Education Institutions playing a role in ITT, need to take a more active part in managing the changes required and in improving areas such as performance management and research. There is a lot of scope for the ITT Centres to adopt common approaches in these areas, as well as in trainee assessment and mentoring.

This review points to the need for better management and more effective collaboration as the foundations for improving ITT in Wales. But providers should also understand that, if the current weaknesses persist and if they fall short, individually or collectively, the Department for Education and Skills and HEFCW have the powers to reallocate a sizeable proportion of trainee numbers to willing and capable providers.

This review looks forward to the revisions planned to the Practising Standards for Teachers, which will offer an opportunity to align all standards governing teachers' early careers. By producing a clear, planned progression it will be easier to avoid overloading ITT provision with too many priorities and it will help ensure that important skills in managing behavior and special needs will be properly reinforced and strengthened over time.

Chapter 1: Introduction

1. In September 2012, the Minister for Education and Skills announced a review of the quality and effectiveness of Initial Teacher Training (ITT) in Wales, to take place during academic year 2012/13.
2. The review work was undertaken by Professor Ralph Tabberer and began in October 2012. With the active support of all stakeholders, the review was completed in May 2013. This report and its recommendations are intended to inform future policy, some of which will be subject to wider consultation.
3. The scope of the review was to address ITT leading to Qualified Teacher Status (QTS) for teachers working in maintained schools in Wales (see Appendix C). This includes undergraduate and postgraduate course provision currently provided by Higher Education Institutions (HEIs), including distance learning courses provided by the Open University and employment-based teacher training delivered under the Graduate Teacher Programme (GTP).
4. The review concentrated on those areas most important for raising the quality of teaching as follows:
 - a) the quality and consistency of teaching, training and assessment in ITT
 - b) ITT course structure and the coverage of specific issues in ITT
5. The review addressed a range of issues including:
 - the balance between practical teaching experience in school and university-led training
 - the overall length of ITT courses
 - if specific subjects and topics are given sufficient coverage on ITT courses
 - how the sector engages with schools and local authorities to ensure ITT courses deliver NQTs who meet their needs.
6. The review came almost seven years after the Furlong Review of ITT provision in Wales (Furlong et al., 2006). In January 2006, the Furlong Review recommended structural and organisational changes that were intended to alter the landscape of ITT provision and ensure that the main providers would have a viable future, both educationally and financially.

Chapter 2: Context

7. In 2006, the Furlong Review made 36 recommendations designed to improve ITT in Wales, including:
 - a. better workforce planning and tracking of trainees' destinations;
 - b. clearer focus on preparing trainees to teach in Welsh schools;
 - c. a reduction of ITT places, to match supply to demand;
 - d. a move to a wholly postgraduate entry route for teaching, phasing out the BA (Education);
 - e. continuity in the unit of resource;
 - f. protection of and, if possible, an increase in Welsh language numbers;
 - g. the establishment of three main Schools of Education, providing training and research;
 - h. conduct of an annual NQT survey by the General Teaching Council for Wales (GTCW);
 - i. the introduction of Professional Learning and Development Schools;
 - j. changes to induction including the introduction of appropriate competences for early professional development;
 - k. a new advisory body and forum intended to bring ITT providers together nationally.

8. The recommendations of the Furlong Review were considered by the Welsh Government and, on 26 March 2006, an ITT Change Plan was published and debated in the National Assembly for Wales, with the aim of aligning ITT better with need by 2010/11. Since 2006, the following activity has taken place:
 - a. a significant reduction in ITT intake numbers has been implemented;
 - b. improvements to teacher workforce planning have been made including the development of a Teacher Planning and Supply Model (TPSM) for Wales;
 - c. a reconfiguration of ITT provision resulting in the establishment of three main Centres of ITT;
 - d. raising the quality of employment based training routes into teaching and the setting of specific entry requirements for this route;
 - e. reviewing Welsh medium ITT provision; and
 - f. introducing changes to the ITT regulatory requirements to support changes in ITT provision.

9. The change in ITT intake numbers amounted to a reduction of some 33 per

cent in the number of new teachers coming into ITT since 2004/05.

10. The most important reform was in consolidating provision into three new ITT Centres serving different Welsh regions. In 2006, the authors of the Furlong report said:

“If ITT is going to play its part in meeting the challenges of tomorrow, then Wales needs an ITT sector that is of high quality, is strong and is financially secure and itself able to embrace and help lead change.”

11. The three main ITT Centres are:

- North and Mid Wales Centre for Teacher Education and Training – (bringing together Aberystwyth University and Bangor University)
- South West Wales Teacher Education and Training (bringing together what was at the time Swansea Metropolitan University and Trinity St David’s, Carmarthen – now combined as the University of Wales Trinity Saint David)
- South East Wales Centre for Teacher Education and Training (bringing together Cardiff Metropolitan University and what is now the University of South Wales, having merged Newport University and the University of Glamorgan)

12. Wales has a relatively small ITT sector that is required not only to supply new teachers of quality but also to serve the regions, which are diverse both in terms of population density and Welsh language and cultural traditions. The Furlong Review pointed the way to a workable solution that helped Wales to rationalise ITT provision while reducing its trainee numbers, which were too high. The adopted solution removed the risk that in a declining market, the balance and coverage of provision - as well as the quality - across Wales would be seriously disturbed.

13. At the time of this review, the ITT landscape has these key features:

- for the academic year 2013/14, 1630 places have been allocated to ITT providers, of which 750 are primary and 880 secondary
- almost all secondary trainees enter through the postgraduate route or by new routes (see below)
- about 60 per cent of primary trainees enter through the postgraduate route and 40 per cent through the undergraduate route which has not been closed, although numbers taking this route have significantly reduced

- three main ITT Centres, involving partnerships between HE institutions in Wales
 - the Open University operating as a further provider, implementing a flexible, distance learning route to QTS in certain secondary subjects
 - employment-based provision via the Graduate Teacher Programme, which has about 60 places available each year
 - providers are subject to inspection by Estyn, who are about two thirds of their way through the first inspection cycle for ITT since 2005
14. In addition, new initiatives have begun to re-shape the ITT environment. Fuller details are provided in Appendix B and one of the most important reforms has been the introduction of a Masters in Educational Practice (MEP). This represents a move to establish a Masters level entry level for future trainees. The introduction of Teach First (see paragraph 96) brings further opportunities.
 15. Finally, it is important to recognise that the ITT landscape in Wales is being changed by a new wave of school reforms, designed to address weaknesses in school performance and student achievement.
 16. These reforms were first introduced in a twenty-point plan for reform announced by the Minister for Education and Skills in February 2011. The full 'Improving Schools' implementation plan includes measures to strengthen school leadership, professional development, governance, performance management, literacy and numeracy, inspection, Welsh-medium education, behavior and attendance, inclusion, and safeguards and support for vulnerable children as well as ITT (Welsh Government, 2012).
 17. In summary, after seeing disappointing results from international assessments of student performance, the Welsh Government has set out to create, systematically, a new climate of higher expectations for schools. This is crucial to understanding the context for this review because, at its heart, the ultimate question to be addressed is whether ITT is capable of playing the part that it should in raising standards in Welsh schools.

Chapter 3: World class ITT standards

18. In their report examining why some countries had strong education systems and others weak ones, Barber and Mourshed (2009) observed that teaching quality is the most important determinant of student outcomes. This reinforced the message they first delivered in an earlier report (2007) on the world's best performing school systems:

“The quality of an education system cannot exceed the quality of its teachers.”

19. Their comments are indicative of a discussion taking place, now, around the world, about the future of school reform. ITT is certainly a major contributor to teaching quality in most countries with advanced school systems. The ITT sector addresses far fewer teachers than the Continuous Professional Development (CPD) sector but, due to course length and its position at the very start of a teacher's professional career, it has enormous strategic importance. It can establish professional values, habits and behaviours that help guide a teacher's career.
20. Given the context of the wider school reform in Wales, it is reasonable to set current ITT practice against an international quality benchmark. In a recent OECD report, Andreas Schleisser (2012) summarised the key features of successful systems and it is worth quoting his findings at some length:

“Though perhaps not as central to matching teacher demand and supply, initial teacher education is another important part of the equation to ensure the supply of a high-quality teaching force in the longer term. OECD research (OECD, 2010) has identified some principles that are worth noting:

- *Education systems benefit from clear and concise profiles of what teachers are expected to know and be able to do in specific subject areas. This includes both subject-matter knowledge as well as knowledge of how to teach it. Such profiles can guide initial teacher education, teacher certification, teachers' on-going evaluation, professional development and career advancement, and also help to assess the extent to which these different elements are effective. The profiles can reflect the school's learning objectives and profession-wide understanding of what counts as accomplished teaching.*

- *Many countries have moved their initial teacher-education programs towards a model based less on academic preparation and more on preparing professionals in school settings, with an appropriate balance between theory and practice and collaboration among teachers as a key aspect. In these programs, teachers get into classrooms earlier, spend more time there and get more and better support in the process. This can include both extensive course work on how to teach – with a strong emphasis on using research based on state-of-the-art practice – and more than a year teaching in a designated school, associated with the university, during which time the teacher is expected to develop and pilot innovative practices and undertake research on learning and teaching, in partnership with other teachers and under the guidance of accomplished teachers. The Finnish University Training is a prominent example for the effective implementation of such an approach.*
- *More flexible structures of initial teacher education can be effective in opening up new routes into the teaching career, without compromising the rigor of traditional routes. The stages of initial teacher education, induction and professional development need to be interconnected to create a lifelong learning framework for teachers. In many countries, teacher education is not just providing sound basic training in subject-matter knowledge, pedagogy related to subjects, and general pedagogical knowledge; it also seeks to develop the skills for reflective practice and on-the-job research. Increasingly, initial teacher education tends to emphasise developing the capacity of teachers in training to diagnose student problems swiftly and accurately and to draw from a wide repertoire of possible solutions to find those that are appropriate to the diagnosis. Some countries provide teachers with the research skills needed to enable them to improve their practice in systematic ways. For example, in Finland, the Shanghai province of China and many parts of the United States, teachers are trained to be action researchers in practice, with the ability to work out ways of ensuring that any student starting to fall behind is helped effectively.*
- *In addition, some countries have moved from a system in which teachers are recruited into a larger number of specialised colleges of teacher education, with relatively low entrance standards, to a relatively smaller number of university-based teacher-education colleges with relatively high entrance standards and relatively high status in the university.”*

21. Drawing on the work of the OECD, and that of McKinsey on the reform

history of individual countries, it is possible to map out the distinctive features of ITT and broader teacher development in high performing systems.

22. The interesting point about the systems where teacher quality is strong – and where teacher development is perceived to be strong – is that they are not distinguished by structures. Commentators usually point to countries such as Finland, Singapore, Taiwan and Canada as examples where performance on international tests of student attainment is strong and teaching preparation is good. Some of them have only one ITT provider, some depend on just a few and, in other cases, there are many more with devolved responsibilities. The institutional structure of ITT does not appear to be a determining issue.
23. An example is Finland where education is an integral part of Finnish culture and society, and teachers enjoy great respect and trust (Sahlberg, 2010). All training is based in one of the eight universities, begins with an undergraduate course and is supported by scientific content and educational research methodologies. The entry level for most permanent employment as a teacher is a master's degree, with an expectation of independent research, which means that training can take from five to seven years. Pre-school and kindergarten teachers have a bachelor's degree.
24. In Finland, training focuses on developing 'pedagogical thinking skills' and combines subject strengths with pedagogical method and educational theory. Although each university has autonomy, every department of education has a detailed and binding strategy for improving its teacher education programmes. Candidates progress from basic to advanced and then to final practice, with their major teaching practice usually taking place in special Teacher Training Schools that are governed by the universities and which operate similarly to normal public schools. Responsibility for induction and continuous professional development are devolved and programmes are more variable in quality.
25. A second example is Singapore. In this case, ITT is focused in the National Institute of Education (NIE) which is part of Nanyang Technological University. Since 1971, it has been the monopoly ITT provider and has a governing body chaired by the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Education. 12 academic groups oversee the organisation's management structure, which supervises the delivery of undergraduate, postgraduate, diploma and higher degrees in education as well as leadership development programmes.
26. NIE has adopted and refined a Teacher Educational Model designed to transform the planning, delivery and evaluation of their programmes. The model has values, skills and knowledge components, and reflects the

Ministry's competency framework. It emphasises putting learning at the centre of the teachers' work; having high expectations and standards and transmitting a strong drive to learn; and teachers making a commitment to their own professional development (NIE, 2009). Recent reviews in Singapore suggests that trainee teachers need a stronger dose of pedagogical knowledge as well as subject strength (NIE, 2011).

27. NIE also gives a lot of attention to the theory-practice gap in training teachers. It provides a good grounding in school practice and encourages school-based inquiry or research. Emphasis is increasingly placed on the value of experiential learning. There is a customised programme of mentor training. As in Finland, teaching is actively promoted as a high status profession.
28. In the OECD Education Working Paper series, Musset examines current practices in different countries and reinforces the importance of teacher education (Musset, 2011):

“Teacher education is important because of its impact upon teacher quality. To teach is a complex and demanding intellectual work, one that cannot be accomplished without the adequate preparation. Teacher education not only ensures that teachers are – and remain competent, but it also assures that they stay motivated through time (Eurydice, 2004). Research shows that most effective way to raise educational quality is to modify initial teacher education and recruitment, and to develop the means to train teachers that are already in-service; indeed, teacher education has a significant impact on teachers' behaviours and teaching skills, and on the student outcomes.”

29. Musset identifies several features common to advanced ITT systems: a balance of provision addressing subject-matter (content knowledge), teaching techniques (pedagogical knowledge) and practical school experience.
30. Musset describes the variety that exists in terms of ITT organisation, for example in: the existence of traditional (undergraduate and postgraduate route) and new models (alternative pathways) of ITT provision; the variety in institutional characteristics; the variety in course length; and the existence of concurrent (teaching academic and pedagogical knowledge simultaneously) and consecutive (teacher training after an individual has already gained a strong body of subject knowledge) programmes. The report makes several recommendations for reform which include: increasing coherence between the education received by teachers and what actually happens in the classroom; seeing teacher education as a continuum; acknowledging the importance of CPD; closer cooperation bonds between different education

providers; supporting new school-based programmes; and making teacher education more flexible.

31. Musset also conducted a literature review, examining the characteristics of different national systems. She concludes:

“A complete teacher education combines strong subject-matter and pedagogical knowledge, the ability to collaborate with diverse actors (students/colleagues/administrators), and the capacity to continue developing these skills and to understand the in depth context of the schools in which they teach. Teacher education programmes should be designed as an incentive to bring the right people into teaching and to make it adequate to the country’s specific needs, depending on the quality and the quantity of future teachers that it is considered suitable.”

32. A fuller literature review was undertaken by Menter et al. (2010), to support the Donaldson review of teacher education in Scotland (Donaldson, 2011). The authors include a helpful characterisation and outline of teacher education approaches in Scotland, Australia, Canada, England, Finland, France, Italy, Japan, Netherlands, New Zealand, Northern Ireland, Norway, Singapore, South Korea, USA and Wales. They comment on the fragmented nature of the research but point to a number of important findings including variation between countries as to the degree to which responsibility for standards and expectations are devolved.
33. A study of teacher education in the European Union (FIER, 2007) and a European Commission report on teacher education quality (European Commission, 2007) agreed in commending the development of a continuum of teacher professional development and the development of ‘research-based teacher education’.
34. The evidence from these resources, and from an exhaustive review into teacher education policy in the US (Darling-Hammond, 1999), indicates that it is not matters of structure that the strong performers have in common but clear features and qualities. These include the following:
- a. A clear regulatory framework
 - b. ‘Sector leadership’ that is organised, well-connected and consultative
 - c. Strong providers (or a single strong provider) who are well-led locally
 - d. Strong training and pedagogic models that permeate all programmes
 - e. An approach based on ‘practical theory’ involving high levels of school

practice

- f. Subject and specialist strengths in the tutors and faculty
 - g. A clear framework for 'early professional development' that runs across ITT, induction and into the early years of a teacher's career
 - h. Research that is aligned to the ITT models and practice, helping to shape and re-shape approaches over time
 - i. A high status profession that attracts top graduates
 - j. Schools working in long-term partnerships with higher education providers, using the same pedagogic models
 - k. A strong culture, and practice, of continuous professional development in the schools
 - l. Accountability for all ITT providers, collectively and individually
 - m. The availability of good data that help providers evaluate performance and track their own progress over time
 - n. A relentless orientation to improve, continuously, all ITT programmes and practices
35. This provides a useful framework for weighing the strengths and areas for improvement of current ITT provision in Wales.

Chapter 4: An overview of ITT quality and consistency in Wales

36. The current quality of ITT in Wales is adequate and no better. This judgment does not solely come from the findings of Estyn, which is almost two thirds of the way through a programme of inspecting the three new ITT Centres in Wales. The assessment is largely shared by providers, officials and the leading stakeholders.
37. This does not mean that newly qualified teachers in Wales are poor. On the contrary, the large majority of trainees are entering the teaching profession in Wales with skills that are essential to the modern profession: they have reasonable subject or other specialist knowledge, they are trained to use modern and effective classroom techniques and they know how to conduct themselves professionally, paying careful attention to the education and wellbeing of the children in their care. In international competition, most newly qualified teachers from Wales would be very employable.
38. The challenge is that ITT provision could be better. And to help raise standards throughout Wales, it needs to be much better.
39. The evidence from inspection and self-evaluation shows that ITT provision in Wales is not meeting the standards set by the highest performers globally. The weaknesses that were found in the 2011/12 Estyn inspection in the south west, which included one College that was previously rated 'good', are illustrative. The Centre received praise for:
 - the good progress made by trainees towards achieving QTS standards
 - the wide variety of challenging and stimulating learning experiences provided
 - the high quality of the training on the undergraduate programme
 - the good role model for trainees provided by many tutors
40. Yet the Centre was criticised because:
 - a minority of trainees do not have good enough literacy skills
 - a minority of trainees do not develop their planning and reflective skills well enough
 - the quality of training is too variable across programmes
 - assessment does not always identify deficits in trainees' skills

41. These criticisms point to problems in recruitment, quality and consistency. It is clear that in their new inspections of ITT, Estyn have raised the bar regarding quality and consistency, but this is to be welcomed. It is essential that Estyn provide their objective and external judgment of quality based on high international standards. And this is especially important in a small country like Wales, where the providers do not experience local competition that might otherwise provide an additional driver to improve.
42. It should be noted that the views of newly qualified teachers, themselves, are more positive. The GTCW conducted surveys of newly qualified teachers and those completing induction in 2011. The GTCW found that some 88 per cent of trainees considered their course to be good or very good, and some 90 per cent rated their induction programme as good or very good (GTCW, 2012). Response rates to the survey questionnaires were around 50 per cent. The National Student Survey results for final-year undergraduates are also good.
43. Such a positive response gives ITT providers comfort that their efforts are valued but it is at odds with the observations made by many commentators, including head teachers and school mentors who were consulted in this review. To examine the issue, 30 NQTs and 30 school mentors were questioned in a small-scale exercise commissioned from Old Bell 3, a commercial research group based in Wales.
44. The interview findings confirmed that NQTs value the supervision and guidance they get from the best of their tutors. The findings also reinforced the difficulties that ITT providers face getting the balance between theory and practice right. The criticisms that were offered were mainly aimed at elements of the course that did not directly translate into resources and practices that worked in the classroom. The main criticisms emerged where NQTs and mentors perceived pedagogic approaches, and a few tutors, to be out-of-touch with current school priorities and practices. The report is available from the researchers at www.oldbell3.co.uk.
45. It is important to acknowledge the strong relationship that is established by the ITT providers with most trainees. This is crucial to the success of ITT, where many new entrants to the profession are eager to build both the skills and confidence they need, quickly. But a careful analysis of strengths and weaknesses, across ITT provision in Wales, is required if the sector is to translate good relationships into world-class teacher preparation.
46. Using the framework introduced in the last Chapter, it is now possible to map out the strengths of current provision and areas for improvement in more detail and to point a way forward.

Chapter 5: Detailed findings and recommendations

47. In the following section, the gap between where ITT in Wales needs to be and current practice, is summarised under the section headings set out in paragraph 34.

A clear regulatory framework

48. Successful systems tend to have clear frameworks that set out, *inter alia*, teacher standards at entry to the profession. In different countries, the responsibility for maintaining these standards is held at different levels in the system. This largely reflects reform history in each instance but the more successful systems are bound together by a high level of common understanding about the rules and standards by which the system as a whole works.
49. In Wales, the regulatory framework is sound. There is a clear set of standards, accreditation rules and ITT requirements in terms of curriculum, programme types, programme arrangements and details such as course length and time in schools. These provide clear expectations and the balance between subject knowledge, pedagogic knowledge and classroom skills, for example, is good.
50. Improvements can be made, particularly in better alignment of the standards for teachers at different stages in their career, to clarify progression. This issue is taken up in paragraphs 80-85. Additionally, with several bodies closely involved in guiding, advising, inspecting and supporting ITT – the Department for Education and Skills, Estyn, GTCW and HEFCW – it is particularly important that they collaborate closely and offer ITT providers clear direction. This issue is taken up in paragraphs 51-55.

‘Sector leadership’ that is organised, well-connected and consultative

51. Successful systems are distinctive in that ITT is a clear and immediate focus for those in charge of the school service. The character and particular demands of ITT are understood by leading policy-makers. When reform is considered, across the school system, the role and contribution of ITT is addressed. Discussion and consultation takes place, to ensure that reforms are properly aligned and all take part
52. In Wales, this has not been the case. ITT has been in the margins of school reform and there has been too little consideration given to the contribution it could make to new reform initiatives. Termly meetings take place involving providers, policy-makers and regulators – and consultation is undertaken on new policies – but the ITT Centres, and their representative bodies, could be involved in policy development earlier.
53. For example, in the recent drive to improve literacy and numeracy through the National Frameworks, ITT providers were not brought to the table to discuss their full involvement. Similarly, there are cases where reforms within ITT have been put forward without sufficient, early consultation with the sector about the optimum arrangements. Consequently, ITT providers have become uncomfortable with some reforms and, too often, the first response has appeared to be negative.
54. This points, first and foremost, to a need to strengthen leadership of the sector yet Wales is not large enough to justify a new organisation that is distinctively focused on ITT. Improvements are certainly needed to strengthen ITT understanding, consultation and representation within the Department for Education and Skills in Wales. Technical knowledge about the way that ITT works will help reformers refine policy and secure better buy-in.
55. Better leadership will carry ideas to key partners such as HEFCW, GTCW and UCET Cymru before important decisions are made about implementation details. It should be a matter of course for new school reforms to include provision for support to ITT as well as to schools and local authorities; usually, the additional costs will be marginal.

RECOMMENDATION 1

That the Department for Education and Skills appoint a senior adviser with specific responsibility for ITT, who will play a key part in providing leadership in policy advice and in raising ITT standards with all providers.

Strong providers (or a single strong provider) who are well-led locally

56. The foundations of good ITT are always the providers. In Finland, there is a strong and devolved body of expertise in teacher education that has developed over many years. In Singapore, one centre has a monopoly of provision, and conducts its affairs with rigorous attention to detail.
57. ITT provision in Wales falls short of these high benchmarks although it is clear that there are some good managers and strong tutors in whom to invest. On the positive side, providers build strong relationships with their trainees and, in their inspection of the south west Centre, Estyn found the prospects for improvement to be 'good' because the provider had a clear vision about where they were heading, they understood their areas of weakness and they managed recent changes well.
58. Consistency is the biggest problem. ITT is a complex activity and, to be successful, a provider is required to deliver well across many different subjects, specialisms and age groups. This implies that tutors should be subject to effective performance management arrangements. There are additional challenges due to the requirement to organise training in schools as well as in the host institutions. These are matters that require improvements in management, and in quality assurance, to ensure that programme implementation in the Centres has a higher fidelity and reliability.
59. It would have been better if structural changes that followed the Furlong review were more quickly translated, in each Centre, into strongly managed teams capable of delivering quickly on the changes required. Leadership faltered and many issues took too long to resolve. The renewal of inspection by Estyn, which has brought with it higher expectations of management and coordination across each Centre, has exposed progress as slow.
60. It is not clear that the participating HEIs in Wales have provided the senior leadership required. Consultation with the Vice Chancellors through Higher Education Wales (HEW) brought forward evidence that senior leaders shared an understanding of the need to raise the status of teaching and the profile of ITT. But their quality assurance systems were largely indicating no serious cause for concern, when the problem was that expectations have not been high enough and more urgent action was needed.
61. It would be helpful if the senior leadership teams in the HEIs took a more active role in promoting consistency, strengthening performance management and building research capability. Each Centre needs to develop as a strongly managed entity in its own right and it would make sense for the three Centres to establish more, common approaches. They have made

some progress in this regard over the assessment of applicants but much more is possible, for example in the performance management of staff.

62. HEFCW has demonstrated that it stands ready to safeguard the role and quality of ITT in higher education in Wales. It should now seek to work more closely with Estyn, first at the point of feedback to HEIs and Centres about their inspections so that the need for improvements is clearly understood. And, second, it should consider the evidence from Estyn, the quality of the action plans generated, and the urgency and capability of the management teams involved, in determining whether ITT improvements are likely under the existing arrangements for each Centre.
63. There is a question here, about whether it might be better for ITT providers to be caused to compete more for trainee numbers so that there might be a greater incentive to improve quickly. Given the size of Wales, the diversity of the regions and the direction of the Furlong reforms, this would be difficult to implement without having an impact on priority recruitment subjects and local teacher supply. It is for this reason that the recommendations in this review point the way less towards added competition and more towards targeted collaboration.
64. But there are limits to collaboration and, if ITT providers fail inspections or continue at their current pace of improvement, the Department for Education and Skills and HEFCW should work closely in finding alternative ITT solutions. The key driver for the sector should always be quality. ITT providers should understand that they are expected to collaborate in implementing best practices and that if they fall short, individually or collectively, a sizeable proportion of trainee numbers can and will be reallocated to more willing and capable providers.

RECOMMENDATION 2

That Estyn and HEFCW collaborate more closely in following up inspection, in order to secure from ITT providers, and the collaborating HEIs, a stronger commitment to changes that will quickly strengthen the local leadership and quality of each ITT Centre.

RECOMMENDATION 3

That the Department for Education and Skills and HEFCW discuss contingency plans for reallocating trainee numbers in the case of continued under-performance, either in individual Centres or by the sector as a whole.

Strong training and pedagogic models that permeate all programmes

65. It is striking in successful systems that there is a continuous dialogue – if not debate – about the training approach that they adopt and there is usually a programme of evaluation and research that is constantly striving to question and improve the approach. For example, Singapore is distinctive in communicating and updating its training models (NIE, 2009).
66. Similarly, provision is at its best when schools and their local ITT providers share a pedagogic model – or to put it more simply, a teaching approach – that is appropriate to teaching, say, the early years, upper primary children, or subjects such as science and history. By building these shared models, schools and providers combine to ensure that trainees encounter common expectations and receive complementary support.
67. There was not enough evidence that this has been given a priority in the ITT Centres. There was no evident dialogue – or critique – of training models. Although there were cases where providers worked with their partner schools in one area – such as the Foundation Stage – to build common expectations, this work was not carried forward across all provision.
68. In the current context, which is one of classroom reforms in Wales that are being introduced at an increased pace, this is a significant weakness. If schools are adopting new frameworks, for example in the teaching of literacy and numeracy, it is important – for the credibility of ITT as well as for the impact on trainees – that the ITT sector is pro-active in promoting the right classroom strategies and approach.
69. This is an area that needs to be addressed by the providers themselves, it can be enhanced through UCET Cymru, and the Department for Education and Skills can help by briefing providers about forthcoming classroom-focused initiatives.

RECOMMENDATION 4

That ITT providers review their training models and pedagogic models, to make sure that trainees receive clear and consistent guidance on how they should organise teaching and learning in their subject(s) and phase(s).

An approach based on ‘practical theory’ involving high levels of school practice

70. The modern shift to more school-based preparation in ITT is worldwide. All the most developed ITT models integrate educational theory, subject and pedagogic elements, with school practice.

71. In Wales, this is a notable strength. Providers introduce trainees to school experience quickly and this is something that prospective teachers welcome. It is in schools that the trainees make sense of all that they are learning. It is the part of the course for which they usually have the highest regard.
72. Recently, steps have been taken to increase requirements for school-based activity and this is welcome. A careful balance is needed to ensure that programmes are rich in school and classroom experience, but also require trainees to strengthen their subject knowledge and gain important insights into educational theory.
73. The additional risk in making even more of the training school-based is that school quality remains inconsistent. The introduction of flexible and employment-based routes is a welcome development, since it should help stimulate strengths in schools' management of ITT. It is beneficial that the Open University and Teach First now undertake ITT provision in Wales because both have had to work particularly hard to get the school side of the partnership working in their models. Both have very good ratings from Ofsted inspection in England.
74. There is insufficient capacity in schools, at present, to undertake a much fuller role in ITT, as has been envisaged in England, but there is certainly further scope for Wales to take measures to strengthen the part that schools play in ITT, because this will contribute extra capacity. The initiatives proposed and taken in other countries, to establish 'hub teaching schools' or 'training schools', give pointers as to ways to develop school-side strengths.

RECOMMENDATION 5

That a national network of Training Schools be established – based on providers' recommendations and starting with a small number of highly committed schools – in order to give recognition to those that are already playing a major part in ITT and to create a network for policy-makers and providers to consult, and collaborate with, in improving school-based practices.

Subject and specialist strengths among the tutors and throughout the faculty

75. Subject knowledge and what is called 'content-pedagogic knowledge' (knowing what difficulties students have in learning and knowing how to teach accordingly) are essential components of the best ITT programmes.
76. In the design of ITT provision, this is a relatively strong feature in Wales because the ITT requirements are well balanced with an appropriate subject

emphasis. Yet providers express difficulties in recruiting tutors in priority subject areas.

77. ITT is not consistently attracting the very best educators in the system – most are looking first to employment in schools and local authorities. Shortages are a consequence.
78. With differences in salaries, this problem will not be easily repaired and success will depend upon:
 - Improving the status of teacher education and of ITT provision, so that it features strongly as a career choice that is both satisfying in itself and likely to lead to further career progression
 - Improving performance management in ITT, so that staffing strengths and weaknesses are identified and professional development is put in place to raise performance where necessary
 - Considering joint appointments between ITT providers and schools, and between ITT providers and local authorities
79. In priority subject areas, it would be particularly helpful for ITT providers to explore closer links with local authorities, and to pilot joint appointments with local authorities in hard-to-fill posts.

RECOMMENDATION 6

That ITT providers consider joint appointments in priority subjects and adopt common performance management approaches for all their staff that set high standards and ensure every tutor is appraised annually of their strengths and areas for improvement, and actively supported in their own continuous professional development.

A clear framework for ‘early professional development’ that runs across ITT, induction and into the early years of a teacher’s career

80. Successful systems seek to align ITT provision with the induction and professional development that should carry a teacher through the early years of their career.
81. In some countries, standards are written for entry to ITT, for successful progression to QTS, for completion of the induction year and for progress to an experienced or advanced teacher status. In Wales, the components are in place to provide just such a progressive framework.

82. The value of this approach is greater when, as in Wales, there are significant pressures on the time available for training on one-year programmes. A good framework covering the early years of teaching can set progressive expectations in areas such as special needs and behaviour management – which all parties, especially the trades unions, recognise are difficult to tackle in sufficient breadth and depth in ITT alone.
83. The introduction of the new Masters in Educational Practice (MEP) is beneficial and further work on a comprehensive set of career standards could help guide the complementary development of the MEP alongside the other Masters programmes offered by ITT providers.
84. A review of Practising Teacher Standards is proposed and this provides an early opportunity to align standards better and improve clarity.
85. Care has to be taken in drafting standards because, in practice, they are used for quite different purposes, for example as a low-stakes check on progress through induction or as very precise criteria to guide performance management later in a teacher’s career. But a single framework will help to provide an overview and to clarify the main features of a teacher’s progression. This can then guide the drafting of the more detailed standards and rules required for different assessment purposes.

RECOMMENDATION 7

That in the planned review of Practising Teacher Standards, the standards for QTS, for induction and for making progress in the first three to five years of teaching be drafted and aligned so that they provide a clear path to guide teachers’ early career progression.

Research that is aligned to the ITT models and practice, helping to shape and re-shape approaches over time

86. Research plays an important part in successful ITT systems. In Singapore, teachers are introduced to research methods and the single provider, NIE is a prestigious educational research centre in its own right. In Finland, trainees take a very active research role and are instructed in how to conduct learning-related inquiries so that they can carry this expertise into their teaching career.
87. In Wales, ITT is not strongly connected to research and progress to remedy this problem has been slow. There are historical and structural reasons for the fracture between ITT and research, and the position has possibly got worse since the Furlong Review in 2006. The historical problem starts with a relatively weak role for research in guiding educational practices. This is

exacerbated by the fact that that the best educational research centre in Wales – in Cardiff University – has no direct engagement in ITT. The structural problem is that within the Research Excellence Framework, UK funding council policy directs quality research funding towards research teams, and activities, that do not suit the professional and school-based training environment that the ITT Centres seek to manage. The consequence is that, with a few exceptions where individual postholders maintain research interests and links of their own, neither tutors nor trainees conventionally have a strong research association that influences their work.

88. Given this background, there is no easy solution and it will be best to follow two tracks. The first is to support the newly-established Wales Institute of Social and Economic Research Data and Methods (WISERD) because it will introduce more ITT staff to modern social science research methods and disciplines. The WISERD Education initiative is designed to increase research capabilities and capacity in the sector. Each ITT Centre can benefit from ensuring that selected staff take up opportunities to participate in quantitative and longitudinal studies.
89. The second is to strengthen classroom- and learning- focused research as an activity within ITT programmes. It will be valuable for ITT providers to look at the way research is incorporated in ITT in Finland (see, for example, Sahlberg 2011) as well as to consider systematic approaches to ‘lesson study’, a practitioner-research approach promoted in Japan (see, for example, Rock and Wilson, 2005 or Burghes and Robinson, 2009).
90. It is essential that the leadership teams in each ITT Centre, and in the collaborating HEIs, take the initiative in reviewing their ITT research engagement and make clear plans to re-build active links between teaching and research. The current position, whereby research has a low status in a professional training environment, is untenable. It should be an expectation that managers, tutors and trainees will be engaged in research and will be influenced by practical, scientific inquiry.

RECOMMENDATION 8

That ITT providers take urgent steps to strengthen research engagement among tutors and trainees so that teaching and teacher training are strongly influenced by practical, scientific inquiry methods.

A high status profession that attracts top graduates

91. It is the goal of all ITT sectors to attract high-calibre candidates into a high status profession. In Wales, ITT provision attracts sufficient candidates to fill most programmes and targeted financial incentives play an important part in

helping to fill priority courses. The major challenge for Wales is in continuously attracting graduates of the highest calibre.

92. Training incentives have best rewarded those entering postgraduate courses with high degree classifications in the priority recruitment subjects (mathematics, physics, chemistry, ICT, Welsh and modern foreign languages). ITT trainees undertaking other secondary postgraduate courses and primary studies with first class degree classifications also receive a financial incentive.
93. The review was asked to comment on the appropriateness of incentives. Wales currently has a sensible balance, although significant challenges arise as a result of the different student funding regimes that apply in Wales and England. In certain circumstances, a Welsh student joining a teacher training institution in England can benefit from better student fee support from Wales *and* a higher financial incentive from England.
94. While the different funding regimes exist, there will be anomalies of this kind. Their impact on recruitment needs to be monitored and, in this regard, it is an advantage that Wales can track changes in England and make annual adjustments to their own incentives.
95. Additional incentives are made available for those undertaking their training through the medium of Welsh, under the Welsh Medium Improvement Scheme. The Scheme is important in increasing the number of teachers available to teach through the medium of Welsh. The competition for talented graduates in this area of the market makes a compelling case to continue with these incentives.
96. The introduction of Teach First Cymru is potentially an advantage in re-positioning teaching as a career choice for better graduates. As Teach First, the initiative has a history of success in England in bringing more graduates from the top universities into teaching, especially in priority subjects. The initiative specifically targets high-achievers who are offered enhanced experiences that prepare them for leadership roles, first to work in schools with disadvantaged populations and later, if they wish, to give them access to high status employment beyond teaching. The programme will recruit up to 40 trainees in secondary schools this autumn (2013/14) and every effort should be made to publicise its success in attracting new candidates to teaching.
97. The incentives and the adoption of new initiatives are essential measures that are needed to promote teaching as a career for the very best graduates in Wales. Marketing and messaging should be strengthened, so that prospective candidates are left in no doubt that teaching is seeking to attract the very best people in each generation.

98. In some countries, these messages are promoted in targeted campaigns designed to present teaching in the best light. In Wales, the marketing should begin with the Welsh Government, and Ministers, using their own access to the media to convey the right messages.
99. The signal needs to be given that teaching is not just seeking more new entrants but is seeking the very best. As a career it can offer good opportunities to gain valuable skills as well as a route to positions of responsibility, and roles of importance to the community, which are well-rewarded. In this context, it would be a further advantage if strong candidates could see that incentives come not solely in the form of immediate financial packages but also through opportunities to get their career on a 'fast-track' to positions of higher responsibility. Such measures are very much part of making teaching a modern and competitive career in other countries.

RECOMMENDATION 9

That the Welsh Government more actively promotes teaching as a career choice for the very best graduates and career changers, ensuring that the profession continues to reflect the community it serves in Wales, and takes steps whenever possible to improve the career path for high performing individuals.

RECOMMENDATION 10

That teacher training incentives be maintained as a flexible measure that can be adjusted annually to encourage high performing candidates in specific areas of need.

Schools working in long-term partnerships with higher education providers, using the same pedagogic models

100. Successful ITT systems ensure that schools work very closely with higher education providers, so that trainees learn to teach in an environment where theory and practice are integrated well and where new teachers receive consistent messages and are given consistent support.
101. In Wales, as in many other countries where ITT is devolved to providers serving different regions, the success of ITT is strongly affected by the quality of school partnerships. Such partnerships need careful management, so that all carry out their responsibilities and so that training expectations are clear. Recommendation 5 points to the establishment of a new network of Training Schools for Wales that could help improve understanding about roles, responsibilities, quality and consistency.

102. It is obviously better if providers can depend on a continuing relationship with the schools they value. This creates the opportunity for the ITT provider to invest in helping to train mentors, embed assessment practices and improve classroom practices.
103. Providers express concern that some schools enter and leave the partnership from year to year. Sometimes they ascribe this behavior to the school's anxiety about their own inspection. Whatever the cause of a break in the relationship, every effort should be made to avoid it. It would be helpful if the Department for Education and Skills were to take the lead in encouraging schools to maintain continuous partnerships with ITT providers and to help combat any impression that a school can benefit in the short term from not taking trainees.

RECOMMENDATION 11

That the Welsh Government convey to schools the simple and straightforward message that continuous involvement in ITT is an expectation of all good schools and of all schools aspiring to be good.

A strong culture, and practice, of continuous professional development in schools

104. ITT is not the only part of professional development. Schools that have strong CPD practices and traditions generally find it easier to absorb trainees and to support their professional learning and assessment.
105. In Wales, it is difficult to find a clear judgment about the overall quality of CPD provision in schools. In Estyn's inspection reports, and their Annual Report, there are few direct comments on CPD but under 'leadership and management' HMCI Wales has indicated that "many schools" make appropriate provision for teachers' CPD based on appraisal of teachers' classroom strengths and weaknesses (HMCI Wales, 2012). It would be helpful to have more detailed evidence because international studies suggest that CPD tends to be very variable in quality and take-up, even in countries like Finland (see, for example, Sahlberg 2010).
106. In schools, efforts are frequently made to prioritise CPD that supports the school's improvement and action plans but there is less emphasis usually given to supporting teachers with their own individual CPD plans. Teacher appraisal systems do not always lead to identifying individual training needs and evaluating the means by which they are addressed.
107. There is an opportunity for Wales to take a leading position, internationally,

on teacher education and to emphasise the importance of strengthening professional systems for managing and developing teacher quality. It would be helpful if the Department for Education and Skills were to work closely with Estyn and the GTCW to clarify expectations in this area. If Estyn in particular was able to signal to schools the importance it assigns to systems that directly improve teachers' knowledge, skills and quality, it would help to reinforce the importance of focusing on teacher quality, as the most important factor within a school's control.

RECOMMENDATION 12

That the Welsh Government reinforces the message to schools that it expects them to have strong professional development systems and practices which cause teachers to be active and effective in developing their skills, year on year, and that in school inspections, Estyn examines more closely how schools take direct measures to enhance teachers' quality and skills.

Accountability for all ITT providers, collectively and individually

108. In good ITT systems, providers are held to account for their quality. In Wales, Estyn provides a good measure of accountability to the sector, through institutional inspection. Provision is inspected independently and objective judgments are published in reports made available to the public.
109. There is scope for improvement, however. There was a gap before institutional inspections of ITT providers were restarted after the Furlong Review and it is only becoming clear now that progress under the new Centres has been too slow.
110. Similarly, accountability is only really effective if follow-up is effective. It would strengthen the Welsh system if ITT inspections were more regular, if the follow-ups happened more quickly, and if Action Plans were required against the same timetable as applies to schools. In terms of accountability, full institutional inspections are likely to have greater impact than thematic inspections.
111. Additionally, as was indicated in paragraph 62, it would improve accountability if Estyn and HEFCW collaborated in feeding the outcomes of inspection back to providers and in commenting on their Action Plans.

RECOMMENDATION 13

That a regular cycle of ITT inspection be maintained and with heightened expectations regarding the publication of action plans and the introduction of measures to remedy weaknesses.

The availability of good data that help providers evaluate performance and track their own progress over time

112. The availability of data that helps track performance and clarify issues is a further feature of most good school systems. Data help to make strengths and weaknesses more visible. Data are an aid to accountability.
113. In Wales, ITT providers are beginning to generate more data that will allow them to (a) evaluate different training approaches and routes, (b) track different students' progress, and (c) examine the contribution of specific tutors and schools.
114. It will be valuable if all ITT Centres share and benchmark their data, so that areas of high performance are recognised and best practices promoted for others to adopt.

RECOMMENDATION 14

That ITT providers collaborate through UCET Cymru and with other key stakeholders to identify the key performance data that they can share, in order to provide cross-Wales benchmarks that help track trainees progress and reveal relative strengths and weaknesses in school and Centre provision.

A relentless orientation to improve, continuously, all ITT programmes and practices

115. The most successful ITT systems are highly ambitious. It is significant that high performing countries in comparative educational studies have often elected to undertake improvements and sustain initiatives over a significant period of time. They have sought quick gains, of course, but they have also attempted to establish habits – and coalitions – that increase their long-term capability.
116. Many of those working in ITT providers in Wales are ambitious to improve but, in their leadership and management, the ITT Centres and the supporting HEIs have not driven reform at sufficient pace. It would help the status and profile of the sector if the ITT Centres and HEIs were to signal clearly their wish to make better progress, individually and collectively.

RECOMMENDATION 15

That ITT Centres share their improvement plans and agree measures that will collectively, as well as individually, help them set higher expectations

for the progress of ITT provision in Wales towards greater consistency and quality.

Chapter 7: Conclusions

117. Expectations have risen in Wales and significant reform measures are now in place, designed to raise school performance and student achievement. ITT provision is expected to play an important part in supporting these reforms. ITT quality can help ensure that teachers enter the profession equipped with the skills, attitudes and knowledge they require to make a continuing and growing contribution to school effectiveness over time.
118. ITT Centres in Wales have built good relationships with trainees but quality and consistency need to be improved if Wales is to have a world class ITT sector. The key responsibility lies with the providers but it will certainly help if the sector is more fully consulted and engaged in reform measures.
119. Traditionally, ITT provision in Wales has not played a significant part in directly supporting improvements in classrooms and in schools. Largely, providers have occupied a place in the margins of school policy and senior leaders in the HEIs have not been able to help bridge the gap. The low status of research in ITT is a further indicator that the special characteristics – and the special importance – of the sector are not being fully appreciated.
120. This makes little sense. It is now recognised, worldwide, that teaching quality is one of the most important factors, if not *the* most important, that school reformers have it in their control to change. Globally, this is bringing more attention than ever both to ITT and to the future of CPD.
121. In this review, progress in Wales on ITT has been compared against a challenging benchmark and it has been found to need improvement in many areas, especially leadership and management, consistency, staff competency and expectations of schools.
122. All the stakeholders have indicated that they accept that improvements are needed. The leading organisations, such as the Department for Education and Skills, Estyn, GTCW, HEFCW and UCET CYMRU, have expressed a strong wish to work together more closely. Expectations *are* rising and it is crucial that all the stakeholders become more ambitious for ITT provision, and sustain that ambition.
123. Significant improvements in teacher education take time. The Welsh Government can give a powerful signal of its intentions to make teacher education in Wales world-class if it adopts a systematic and multi-faceted

approach to improving performance. It can take the lead by strengthening its messages about the status and importance of teaching, and by encouraging a stronger culture of professional development in its schools.

124. Marked improvements will take time but swift measures can be taken that will clearly signal the way forward. The recommendations in this report are intended to point the way. It is intriguing that when observers visit high-performing systems such as Singapore and Finland, they often leave commenting about how much easier it must be to establish successful practice in smaller systems.
125. Wales is a relatively small system. It needs to turn this to its advantage and to bring all parties together to make the improvements it can achieve in ITT quality and consistency.

Appendices

Appendix A

Recommendations

1. That the Department for Education and Skills appoint a senior adviser with specific responsibility for ITT, who will play a key part in providing leadership in policy advice and in raising ITT standards with all providers.
2. That Estyn and HEFCW collaborate more closely in following up inspection, in order to secure from ITT providers, and the collaborating HEIs, a stronger commitment to changes that will quickly strengthen the local leadership and quality of each ITT Centre.
3. That the Department for Education and Skills and HEFCW discuss contingency plans for reallocating trainee numbers in the case of continued under-performance, either in individual Centres or by the sector as a whole.
4. That ITT providers review their training models and pedagogic models, to make sure that trainees receive clear and consistent guidance on how they should organise teaching and learning in their subject(s) and phase(s).
5. That a national network of Training Schools be established – based on providers’ recommendations and starting with a small number of highly committed schools – in order to give recognition to those schools that are already playing a major part in ITT and to create a network for policy-makers and providers to consult, and collaborate with, in improving practice.
6. That ITT providers consider joint appointments in priority subjects and adopt common performance management approaches for all their staff that set high standards and ensure every tutor is appraised annually of their strengths and areas for improvement, and actively supported in their own continuous professional development.
7. That in the planned review of Practising Teacher Standards, the standards for QTS, for induction and for making progress in the first three to five years of teaching be drafted and aligned so that they provide a clear path to guide teachers’ early career progression.
8. That ITT providers take urgent steps to strengthen research engagement among tutors and trainees so that teaching and teacher training are strongly influenced by practical, scientific inquiry methods.

9. That the Welsh Government more actively promotes teaching as a career choice for the very best graduates and career changers, ensuring that the profession continues to reflect the community it serves in Wales, and takes steps whenever possible to improve the career path for high performing individuals.
10. That teacher training incentives be maintained as a flexible measure that can be adjusted annually to encourage high performing candidates in specific areas of need.
11. That the Welsh Government convey to schools the simple and straightforward message that continuous involvement in ITT is an expectation of all good schools and of all schools aspiring to be good.
12. That the Welsh Government reinforces the message to schools that it expects them to have strong professional development systems and practices which cause teachers to be active and effective in developing their skills, year on year, and that in school inspections, Estyn more critically examines how schools take direct measures to enhance teachers' quality and skills.
13. That a regular cycle of ITT inspection be maintained and with heightened expectations regarding the publication of action plans and the introduction of measures to remedy weaknesses.
14. That ITT Centres collaborate through UCET CYMRU and with other key stakeholders to identify the key performance data that they can share, in order to provide cross-Wales benchmarks that help track trainees progress and reveal relative strengths and weaknesses in school and Centre provision.
15. That ITT Centres share their improvement plans and agree measures that will collectively, as well as individually, help them set higher expectations for the progress of ITT provision in Wales towards greater consistency and quality.

Appendix B

Responsibilities and the regulatory framework

The Welsh Government is responsible for making policy decisions in relation to the initial training and qualification requirements of teachers in Wales and for setting the annual initial teacher training (ITT) course intake targets which help determine the supply of newly qualified teachers. The Welsh Government is also responsible for deciding the level of financial incentives available to students and provides funding, via the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales (HEFCW) to ITT Centres in Wales to administer and support the provision of ITT courses.

The Welsh Government also funds the ITT Centres to administer and deliver the Graduate Teacher Programme (GTP) under the employment-based teacher training scheme.

The majority of ITT in Wales leading to Qualified Teacher Status (QTS) is undertaken through undergraduate or postgraduate courses offered at higher education institutions. In addition to this traditional route, QTS can also be gained by undertaking employment-based teacher training, or distance learning via the Open University.

In order to gain QTS, trainees must demonstrate that they meet the QTS Standards, currently the Qualified Teacher Status Standards Wales 2009 (2009 No. 25). A copy of the 2009 QTS Standards can be seen on the Welsh Government's website at:

<http://wales.gov.uk/legislation/subordinate/nonsi/educationwales/2009/3220099/?lang=en>

The provision of employment-based teacher training is governed by statutory arrangements. For example, the 2012 employment-based teacher training Scheme provides for two programmes: the Graduate Teacher Programme (GTP) and the Additional Training Graduate Programme (ATGP). Under the GTP, graduates who do not have QTS may be employed to teach in a school, while following an approved training programme organised by an employment-based ITT provider designed to enable them to meet the QTS Standards.

After open competition, Teach First Cymru has been chosen to prepare a programme that will see 150 new graduate teachers trained under the ATGP across academic years 2013/14 and 2015/16.

ITT Accreditation criteria

The entry requirements for employment-based teacher training schemes are set out in the Scheme described above. The ITT requirements for mainstream ITT are set out in the Criteria for Initial Teacher Training Accreditation by the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales 2006 as amended. These documents are subject to periodic updating. The current versions are available here:

<http://wales.gov.uk/legislation/subordinate/nonsi/educationwales/2006/CriteriaforITT2006e?lang=en>

<http://wales.gov.uk/legislation/subordinate/nonsi/educationwales/2006/CriteriaforTTAccred2006e?lang=en>

The Welsh Government will update the statutory ITT accreditation criteria to take account of recent consultation outcome as follows:

- i. from academic year 2014/15 the minimum ITT entry requirements will change from a standard minimum of a GCSE grade C or equivalent in English and mathematics to one of equivalent to a grade B
 - ii. from academic year 2013/14 a new provision which will make it mandatory for all ITT Centres to ensure that all entrants are assessed as having functional personal skills in literacy and numeracy applicable in a professional teaching context will be introduced
 - iii. from academic year 2013/14 a new provision which will make it mandatory for all ITT Centres to ensure that trainee teachers' personal skills in literacy and numeracy are regularly and accurately assessed throughout their training; and specifying that at the point trainees are assessed as having met all the QTS Standards, that ITT Centres must be able to satisfy themselves that the standards are still met will take effect
 - iv. from academic year 2013/14 a new provision which will make it mandatory for all ITT Centres to ensure that students are trained in the teaching of literacy and numeracy appropriate to the phase and subject being studied, and that this forms an integral part of training courses
- II. for entry to ITT programmes commencing in academic year 2014/15 time in schools will increase from 18 to 24 week duration for those undertaking PGCE primary courses;

The Teacher Planning Supply Model (TPSM) and ITT Intake Target Setting

The TPSM for Wales was introduced following the Furlong review of ITT in 2006. A

research project has been commissioned to undertake some operational research work to look at the quality of the TPSM's forecasting and its value in projecting regional or more detailed subject targets. At present, the TPSM represents the best analysis of data in a highly diverse country where detailed workforce planning is challenging.

The Welsh Government notifies The Higher Education Funding Council for Wales (HEFCW) of the overall ITT intake target allocations annually. In turn HEFCW notifies the individual ITT Centres of their allocations by phase of study, primary or secondary and subject. A link to this information on HEFCW's website is provided here:

http://www.hefcw.ac.uk/policy_areas/itt/itt_intake_targets.aspx

The Minister agreed the ITT intake targets for 2013/14 in the autumn of 2012.

ITT Incentives

For academic year 2013/14, support remains focused on targeting priority recruitment subjects and on recruiting high calibre candidates.

- priority incentives will be available for new eligible students starting postgraduate ITT courses in the 2013/14 academic year in mathematics, physics, chemistry, modern foreign languages, Welsh and ICT
- incentives were variable depending on degree qualifications – eligible postgraduate students with a first class degree received the highest funding levels, with progressively lower amounts for those a 2.1 or 2.2, and funding was not available for those without at least a 2.2.

Outside of the priority subjects, only new eligible students with a first class degree starting postgraduate ITT courses in the 2013/14 academic year in all other designated secondary subjects or in primary studies received incentive grants. Additional incentives will be available for primary postgraduate ITT students with a first class degree, whose specialist subject is English or mathematics.

This support builds on the tuition fee grant, which is available to students ordinarily resident in Wales who started full-time postgraduate ITT courses in the 2013/14 academic year on the same basis as undergraduate courses. The ITT incentive grants available in Wales for new eligible students on specified postgraduate (PGCE) ITT courses leading to QTS starting in the 2013/14 academic year are as follows:

Initial Teacher Training in Wales

Honours degree qualification of student	Postgraduate secondary courses in mathematics, physics, chemistry, modern languages, Welsh and ICT	All other Postgraduate secondary courses and Postgraduate primary courses
1st (and 2.1 in physics)	£15,000	£3,000
2.1 (not physics)	£10,000	£0
2.2	£6,000	£0

Additionally, an incentive of £1,000 is available for students undertaking primary postgraduate programmes with a first class degree in English or mathematics

Quality Assurance in ITT

Under the terms of the Further and Higher Education Act 1992, HEFCW is required to secure that provision is made for assessing the quality of education provided in institutions for whose activities it provides, or is considering providing, financial support.

Estyn is responsible for providing independent inspection of the quality of all education and training funded by the Welsh Government (excluding higher education but including ITT and youth and community work training). Estyn's aim is to raise standards and quality in education and training in Wales through inspection and advice, in support of the vision and strategic direction set out by the Welsh Government. A series of inspection of the reconfigured ITT sector is under way.

The qualifications framework

The requirements that need to be met by persons to be recognised as qualified teachers in Wales are set out in Schedule 2 to the School Teachers' Qualifications (Wales) Regulations 2012 (S.I. 2012/724). The following persons are recognised as qualified teachers in Wales provided that they meet certain specific requirements. These persons must:

- (a) hold a first degree or equivalent qualification awarded by a United Kingdom institution or an equivalent degree or other qualification awarded by a foreign institution;
- (b) have successfully completed a course of initial teacher training at an accredited institution in Wales;
- (c) have undertaken a period of practical teaching experience for the purposes of

that course of initial teacher training (i) wholly or mainly in a school or other educational institution (except a pupil referral unit) in Wales at which the National Curriculum for Wales is taught in relation to the foundation phase, or the second, third or fourth key stages, as is appropriate to the school or institution; and (ii) where the practical teaching experience at the school or institution referred to in paragraph (i) corresponds with and is appropriate to that course of initial teacher training; and

(d) be assessed by the accredited institution as meeting the QTS standard.

Additionally, QTS is awarded to those successfully undertaking employment-based teacher training in Wales. These persons must:

(a) have successfully completed a period of training on an employment-based teacher training scheme or otherwise satisfied the requirements of the scheme; and

(b) be assessed as meeting the QTS standards by an accredited institution.

The GTCW is the competent authority in Wales for recognising teachers with QTS, including such applicants who are trained elsewhere.

Time in school

The ITT course requirements require providers to ensure that trainees spend at least a specified time being trained in school, although recognised prior achievement of time in school may count toward the total at the providers discretion. Other settings can count toward the total time including early year settings; sixth form and FE colleges if these are applicable to the key stages and curriculum a student is being trained to teach and provided trainees spend sufficient time in school to enable them to demonstrate that they can meet the QTS standards.

For ITT courses in Wales this is currently:

- 24 weeks for all two and three year undergraduate courses and secondary postgraduate courses
- 18 weeks for all primary postgraduate course (24 weeks from 2014/15)
- 32 weeks for four year undergraduate programmes

Following the recent consultation on changes to the ITT entry requirements the length of the primary postgraduate school component is set to change from 18 weeks to 24 weeks from September 2014/15.

Trainees are required to have experience of at least two schools, ideally with a diverse range of pupils to afford the trainee a contrasting school placement

experience. The time in each school must be sufficient to enable the trainee's mentor to observe the trainee teaching and evidencing the required QTS standards.

Relationship with Partner Schools

ITT Centres manage their relationship with their partnership schools. They pay the schools direct and in the main prefer to use schools in their locality. Schools in England may be used for a short period of training toward the overall time commitment, but normally only where the Wales curriculum specific standards have already been evidenced at a placement school in Wales. Capacity issues particularly in certain subjects can arise which can mean providers compete for partnership schools, or have difficulty in placing students in a particular subject.

Appendix C

Aims of the 2013 ITT Review

The review was asked to cover ITT leading to Qualified Teacher Status (QTS) for teachers working in maintained schools in Wales. This meant addressing undergraduate and postgraduate course provision currently provided by Higher Education Institutions (HEIs), distance learning courses provided by the Open University, and employment-based teacher training delivered under the Graduate Teacher Programme (GTP).

The review was asked to concentrate on those areas most important for raising the quality of teaching as follows:

- a) The quality and consistency of teaching, training and assessment in ITT; and
- b) ITT course structure and the coverage of specific issues in ITT. Coverage of these items will look at the basics of what higher education institutions deliver in ITT. The range of issues identified include:
 - i. the balance between practical teaching experience in school and university led training;
 - ii. the overall length of ITT courses;
 - iii. if specific subjects and topics are given sufficient coverage on ITT courses; and
 - iv. how the sector engages with schools and local authorities to ensure ITT courses deliver NQTs who meet their needs.

Appendix D

Acknowledgements

I wish to thank all those individuals, institutions and groups who contributed their time, data, thoughts and ideas to this review.

From the beginning, I was well supported and guided by the Minister and officials at the Department for Education and Skills. Colleagues in the leading national organisations were also very helpful and I could not have made much progress at all without the generous and professional support I received at all times from senior colleagues at Estyn, GTCW and HEFCW. I received helpful written submissions from many bodies including the teachers' trades unions and Higher Education Wales.

I greatly enjoyed my visits to the ITT Centres and my discussions with colleagues from the Open University. I learned more from the observations and reflections of these managers, tutors and partnership schools than from any other source. There is a community of ITT providers, supported by UCET Cymru, that has the potential to lead the sector out of the margins and in to a much stronger position, provided they are given the active leadership and support both of the Department for Education and Skills and of their contributing institutions.

I am particularly grateful both to the GTCW and to Old Bell 3 for the evidence that they provided regarding new entrants to the profession. Additionally, I received valuable help and encouragement from Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol and from colleagues undertaking the Cwicwlwm Cymreig review, who could advise me on important matters of Welsh language and culture. I also gained broader insights from talking directly to Ministerial groups including the Minister's Practitioner Panel and other review bodies.

Appendix E

References

Barber, M. and Mourshed, M. (2007). How the World's Best-Performing School Systems Come Out on Top. London: McKinsey & Company.

Barber, M. and Mourshed, M. (2009). Shaping the Future: How Good Education Systems Can Become Great in the Decade Ahead. London: McKinsey & Company.

Burghes, D. and Robinson, D. (2009). Lesson Study: Enhancing Mathematics Teaching and Learning. Reading: CfBT.

Darling-Hammond, L. (1999). Teacher Quality and Student Achievement: A Review of State Policy Evidence. Washington: Center for the Study of Teaching and Policy, University of Washington.

Darling Hammond, L. and Rothman, R. (Eds. 2011). Teacher and Leader Effectiveness in High Performing Systems. CA: Stanford Center for Opportunity Policy in Education.

Donaldson, G. (2011). Teaching: Scotland's Future. A Report of a Review of Teacher Education in Scotland. Edinburgh: Scottish Government.

European Commission (2007). Improving the Quality of Teacher Education. See: <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:C:2007:300:0006:0009:EN:PDF>.

Finnish Institute of Educational Research (FIER), University of Jyväskylä (2009). Teacher Education Curricula in the EU. See: http://ec.europa.eu/education/school-education/doc/teacherreport_en.pdf.

Furlong, J., Hagger, H. and Butcher, C. (2006). Review of Initial Teacher Training Provision in Wales. Oxford: OUDES.

General Teaching Council for Wales (2012). The experiences of NQTs and the completion of ITET and Induction. Cardiff: GTCW.

HMCI, Wales (2012). The Annual Report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales 2011-12. Cardiff: Estyn.

Menter, I., Hulme, M., Elliot, D. and Lewin, J. (2010). Literature Review on Teacher Education in the 21st Century. Edinburgh: Scottish Government Education Analytical Services.

Musset, P. (2010). Initial Teacher Education and Continuing Training Policies in a Comparative Perspective: Current Practices in OECD Countries and a Literature Review on Potential Effects. Education Working Papers, No. 48. Paris: OECD.

National Institute of Education (2009). TE21: A Teacher Education Model for the 21st Century. Singapore: NIE.

National Institute of Education (2011). Six Decades of Transforming Teaching. NIE Annual Report: Key Highlights of AY 2009/10. Singapore: NIE.

OECD (2010). Strong Performers and Successful Reformers in Education: Lessons from PISA for the United States. Paris: OECD Publishing.

Rock, T. and Wilson, C. (2005) 'Improving teaching through lesson study', Teacher Education Quarterly, Winter 2005.

Sahlberg, P. (2010). The Secret to Finland's Success: Educating Teachers. Stanford, CA: Stanford University School of Education.

Sahlberg, P. (2011). Developing effective teachers and school leaders: the case of Finland. In Darling Hammond, L. and Rothman, R. (Eds. 2011). Teacher and Leader Effectiveness in High Performing Systems. Op cit.

Schleisser, A. (Ed. 2012). Preparing Teachers and Developing School Leaders for the 21st Century: Lessons from around the world. Paris: OECD Publishing.

Welsh Government (2012). Improving Schools. Cardiff: Welsh Government Department for Education and Skills.