



Llywodraeth Cymru
Welsh Government

Review of the activities of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol

The Task and Finish Group's
report

Review of the activities of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol

Audience

The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol; universities, further education colleges and work-based learning providers in Wales; learners and organisations that represent their interests; organisations that represent educational organisations in Wales; Welsh Government departments; organisations representing employers; private sector companies in Wales; organisations working to promote the use of Welsh and other stakeholders; partners involved in the field.

Overview

In August 2016 the Cabinet Secretary for Education announced the establishment of a Task and Finish Group to review the activities of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol and make recommendations on the way forward. The review would inform future policy and budget decisions regarding the Coleg. This document summarises the Task and Finish Group's findings and recommendations.

Action required

None – for information only.

Further information

Enquiries about this document should be directed to:

Welsh Language Division

Welsh Government

Cathays Park

Cardiff

CF10 3NQ

e-mail: Cymraeg@gov.wales

Additional copies

This document can be accessed from the Welsh Government's website at gov.wales

Related documents

Welsh-medium Education Strategy (2010)

Cymraeg 2050 – a million Welsh speakers (2017) Welsh language strategy

Contents

Foreword	2
Summary of the recommendations	3
Part 1: Introduction and policy context	7
Part 2: The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol – current situation	9
Budget	9
Targets and achievements	10
Progress against targets	10
Part 3: Review approach	12
Part 4: Findings and recommendations	13
4.1: General comments	13
4.2: The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol's structure	14
General comments	14
Governance	14
4.3: Specific activities	16
Engagement with schools	16
Scholarships	19
Welsh Language Skills Certificate	20
4.4: Indicators and targets	21
4.5: The relationship between the Coleg and higher education establishments	23
General comments	23
Change from the Academic Staffing Scheme to subject funding	23
Branches	25
Part 5: Extending the Coleg's remit to include the post-16 sector	27
Background and targets	27
Findings	28
Part 6: Funding the Coleg	32
General comments	32
Value for money and sustainability	32
Funding the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol in the future	33
Part 7: The Coleg's role in relation to recent policy developments	35
Appendix 1: The Group's Terms of Reference	36
Appendix 2: Members of the Task and Finish Group	37
Appendix 3: Establishments which presented oral evidence	38
Appendix 4: Written responses received	41

Foreword

I am pleased to present this report on the work and role of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol. It is the result of 6 months' work and meetings across Wales. I'm very grateful to the Task and Finish Group's members, Heledd Bebb, Rhun Dafydd, Bethan Guilfoyle, Barry Liles, Noel Lloyd and Mari Lloyd-Williams, for their hard and thoughtful work. The report has benefitted from receiving input from such experienced members, with wide-ranging expertise. Thanks also to the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol for its co-operation, and to every individual and organisation that provided evidence. Finally, thank you to the Welsh Government officers who worked on the report for their professional support.

I hope the report will be of use to the Cabinet Secretary for Education and the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language as they consider the future of Welsh-medium education in the post-compulsory sectors. I hope, it will assist to strengthen Welsh language provision across the higher education, further education and work-based learning sectors in the years to come.



Delyth Evans

Chair of the Task and Finish Group

Summary of the recommendations

Recommendation 1: The Welsh Government should extend the role of the Coleg to be a recognised national strategic body for developing the Welsh language across the higher education, further education and work-based learning sectors.

Recommendation 2: As the responsibilities of the Coleg extend to the post-16 sector, the College should change the composition of the Board of Directors, ensuring that:

- any change in the composition of the Board of Directors reflects its new responsibilities;
- the Board membership has a high level of expertise and considerable recent experience in the higher education, further education and work-based learning sectors;
- the Board membership is balanced across the sectors;
- some Board members have knowledge and experience of the needs of the world of work;
- the membership of the Board should not be greater than it is at present, and;
- the means by which members are appointed to the Board avoids conflict of interest, or perception of conflict of interest.

Recommendation 3: The Coleg should consider streamlining its general governance to make it as transparent as possible. It should consider the number, structure and membership of all committees and groups which contribute to the governance of the Coleg, based on their effectiveness and transparency.

Recommendation 4: The Coleg should consider whether there is scope to reduce bureaucracy and internal processes, including in terms of monitoring, without impairing the effectiveness of the activities.

Recommendation 5: To the extent that it will be necessary to divert the Coleg's resources in the coming period, the Coleg should focus on protecting and developing the activities that are most critical to supporting the Welsh Government's Welsh Language Strategy.

Recommendation 6: The Coleg should focus its marketing messages on promoting the Welsh language as a skill in the workplace, rather than marketing the Coleg as a separate body. In so doing, the Coleg should:

- focus on supporting schools by developing marketing materials for use by teachers, pupils and parents;
- support Welsh-medium, bilingual and English-medium schools;

- redirect its promotional work to reach younger pupils in year 9 and 10, before they begin to make decisions about their post-16 education, and;
- coordinate its marketing work closely with the marketing departments of individual further and higher education institutions to ensure clear and consistent messages to school pupils regarding the value of the Welsh language.

Recommendation 7: The Welsh Government should, in partnership with the Coleg, put more pressure on schools and local authorities to contribute to the Language Strategy by communicating clear and consistent messages on the value of the language as a skill in the workplace and the importance of progression to higher education and post-16 education.

Recommendation 8: The Coleg should amend the scholarship scheme by:

- considering abolishing the Main Scholarship based on value for money as it is probable that there is no need for a financial incentive to students who decide to study at least 80 credits per year through the medium of Welsh;
- focusing on the development of the Incentive/Flexible Scholarships Scheme in order to more effectively target those students who would not choose to study through the medium of Welsh without financial incentive, and;
- ensure that there are scholarships for subjects which meet the needs of employers in order to strengthen the relationship between the Welsh language and the economy, in line with the Welsh Government's language policy.

Recommendation 9: The Coleg should continue to offer Research Scholarships due to the value of the scheme to Welsh-medium research, to scholarship and learning, and in terms of supporting future lecturers.

Recommendation 10: The Coleg should consider how it can develop the Welsh Language Skills Certificate by introducing different levels of attainment, allowing it to be more accessible to additional students and apprentices.

Recommendation 11: The possibility of offering the Welsh Language Skills Certificate to students who study outside of Wales should be explored, enabling them to maintain contact with the language in order to highlight opportunities for employability/further study in Wales (e.g. work experience, Masters degrees).

Recommendation 12: The Welsh Government should continue to set targets for the Coleg on the basis of 5 and 40 credits through the medium of Welsh, which should reflect the needs of the Government's Welsh Language Strategy. The Coleg should continue to record the number of students completing 80 credits per year.

Recommendation 13: The Coleg should discuss with individual institutions how they can enrich the experiences offered under the 5 credit indicator to ensure that students who are recorded under this indicator use the language to some extent.

Recommendation 14: The Welsh Government and the Coleg should develop an additional indicator based on the percentage of school pupils who can speak Welsh who go on to study through the medium of Welsh in higher or further education.

Recommendation 15: The Coleg should work more proactively when setting priorities and making strategic decisions regarding the support given to different subjects.

Recommendation 16: In developing the subject grants scheme, the Coleg should;

- work in an open and transparent manner, to secure the sector's support and to foster confidence in the subject grants process;
- ensure that its plans are clear and include a clear timetable for changes which affect the institutions;
- monitor the impact of the new subject grant scheme carefully and make a full assessment of the impact and success of the scheme after three years;
- when offering subject grants, the Coleg should consider the number of locations that provide courses in the same subject, and reduce the number, if appropriate, to ensure the sustainability of the provision, and;
- ensure that there are subject grants for subjects/areas where there is a demand amongst employers for bilingual skills.

Recommendation 17: Individual institutions should make every effort to ensure best value for money by investing their own funding and resources to contribute to the Welsh-medium provision in order to add to what is supported by the Coleg.

Recommendation 18: The Coleg should develop and harmonise the core activities of its branches whilst safeguarding the flexibility to respond to the specific conditions of individual institutions.

Recommendation 19: The Coleg should work closely with the higher education institutions to ensure that the branches have sufficient input and influence at a strategic level within the institutions.

Recommendation 20: The remit of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol should be extended to include the post-16 sector.

Recommendation 21 To develop activity within the post-16 sector the Coleg should;

- establish a specialist planning board under the auspices of the Coleg, that will include representation from further education colleges, the work-based learning sector and Welsh Government, to develop an action plan to increase Welsh-medium provision within the post-16 sector;
- the planning board should prioritize three specific areas: supporting the current staff of colleges and training providers to develop their skills in order to teach bilingually, developing Welsh-medium teaching resources, and promoting the opportunities and benefits for learners in the Welsh Government's priority areas, and;
- create a post-16 planning unit to support the work of the Planning Board and to respond to the new responsibilities.

Recommendation 22: In partnership between the Welsh Government, the Coleg and other stakeholders, consideration should be given to how the capacity of the vocational sector to assess through the medium of Welsh could be developed, both internally within institutions and externally by the awarding bodies.

Recommendation 23: The Coleg should consider every opportunity to review costs, particularly central costs, to ensure value for money.

Recommendation 24: The Coleg should continue to be funded directly by the Welsh Government. The funding options should be reviewed within four years as the role and responsibilities of the new post-compulsory body become clearer.

Recommendation 25: The Coleg should discuss with the Welsh Government the need for any additional funding in response to their new responsibilities. This should be based on an action plan, but in the short term an increase in the central costs is not considered necessary.

Part 1: Introduction and policy context

- 1.1 In recent years, Welsh Government has paid increasing attention to the need to develop Welsh-medium higher education and post-16 education. The Welsh Government's Welsh-medium Education Strategy (2010) established the vision for an education and training system which ensures an increase in the number of people who are fluent in the language and are able to use the language with their families, in the community and in the workplace. Within the Strategy, there was a specific objective to improve the planning of learning pathways for Welsh-medium progression into higher education in priority academic subjects and vocational areas. This objective was reinforced in the policy statement *Living Language: Language for Living - Moving Forward 2014-2017*, published in March 2016, to strengthen the relationship between language and the economy.
- 1.2 Since its establishment in 2011, the Coleg has contributed towards the Welsh Government's strategic aims by developing and promoting Welsh-medium higher education across Wales.
- 1.3 In September 2016 an independent report was published into higher education and student finance funding arrangements (Professor Diamond's report). The report included two specific recommendations which are relevant to the Coleg:
 - *Welsh Government to work with the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol, HEFCW, the HEIs and other stakeholders such as further education institutions, schools, the National Centre for Learning Welsh, employers and national voluntary and community-based organisations in order to secure maximum impact and greatest value from public investment in, and support for, Welsh-medium higher education.*
 - *To support a sustainable funding model; annual investment from HEFCW in the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol and its scholarship programme should be maintained at least at the level for academic year 2016/17 (£5.8m).*
- 1.4 In its response to the Diamond Report the Welsh Government said it accepted the first recommendation and will consider the second.
- 1.5 Professor Ellen Hazelkorn published a report: '*Towards 2030 - A framework for building a world-class post-compulsory education system for Wales*' in March 2016. The report recommended the establishment of a single strategic authority to be responsible for the supervision of post-compulsory education and training. In its response to the report (January 2017), the

Welsh Government announced that it would consult on the establishment of a single authority in line with the model proposed by Professor Hazelkorn.

- 1.6 Within the Welsh Government's Programme for Government, Moving Wales Forward 2016-2021, there is a commitment to work towards achieving one million Welsh speakers by 2050. In response to this objective, the Welsh Government's new Welsh Language Strategy *Cymraeg 2050 – a million Welsh speakers* was published on 11 July 2017¹. The *Cymraeg 2050 – work programme 2017-21* includes a specific aim to: *develop post-compulsory education provision which increases rates of progression and supports everyone, whatever their command of the language, to develop Welsh language skills for use socially and in the workplace.*
- 1.7 The Programme for Government also includes a specific commitment to explore the potential expansion of the remit of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol to include further education.
- 1.8 In August 2016, the Cabinet Secretary for Education announced that a Task and Finish Group would be established to review the role and activities of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol (Appendix 1: Task and Finish Group Terms of Reference). The Cabinet Secretary asked the Group to consider the current structure of the Coleg, funding options, and the Coleg's relationship with the higher education institutions. In addition, the Group was asked to consider whether to extend the Coleg's remit to include the post-16 sector.
- 1.9 As part of its response to the Diamond Report, the Welsh Government said that the Task and Finish Group's review would be used to support future policy and budget decisions concerning the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol.
- 1.10 On 12 June, towards the end of this review, Estyn published a report: *Welsh-medium teaching and learning in further education*. One of the report's main findings was that too few learners who speak Welsh continue with their studies through the medium of Welsh or bilingually in further education colleges. It presented a series of recommendations for the Welsh Government and to further education colleges on how to improve the provision.
- 1.11 In response to the report, all recommendations for the Welsh Government were accepted in full or in principle. It was noted that this Task and Finish Group would be considering the future role of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol within further education. The Group discussions and the evidence received reflect the Estyn report's findings.

¹ <http://gov.wales/docs/dcells/publications/170711-welsh-language-strategy-eng.pdf>

Part 2: The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol – current situation

- 2.1 The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol was established in 2011, in line with the strategic priorities of the Welsh Government, in order to plan, develop, co-ordinate and promote Welsh-medium higher education. The structure and budget of the Coleg was largely based on the report of the Planning Group chaired by Professor Robin Williams (2008-09).
- 2.2 Through strategic and academic planning the Coleg works with higher education institutions to develop Welsh-medium provision across Wales, building on the Welsh-medium provision which already existed and developing capacity within institutions where there was no previous provision.

Budget

- 2.3 In its report, the Planning Group recommended that the Coleg should receive regular funding, similar to the higher education institutions, allowing a degree of certainty in order to plan for the future. This would enable the Coleg to support higher education institutions rather than be in competition for funding. The funding model was based on a gradual increase in the budget with the funding being provided through the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales (HEFCW). As well as the core grant, an additional budget via HEFCW would support Welsh-medium scholarships.

Table 1: Total funding provided to the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol between 2010/11 and 2016/17

Academic Year	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17
Core grant (£m)	£1.281	£4.104	£5.304	£6.496	£7.644	£8.480	£5.436
Welsh medium scholarships		£0.130	£0.230	£0.330	£0.330	£0.330	£0.330
Total	£1.281	£4.234	£5.534	£6.826	£7.974	£8.100	£5.766

Source: HEFCW

- 2.4 In the financial year 2017-18 the Coleg's funding is the responsibility of the Welsh Language Division within Welsh Government. £5.4 million has been allocated to support the activities of the Coleg during the current year, with £0.330m provided by HEFCW to support the Welsh-medium scholarship scheme. The purpose of this change to the funding responsibilities was to provide stability to the Coleg during the review period.

Targets and achievements

- 2.5 In its report the Planning Group suggested potential targets for the new organisation, and these were adopted by HEFCW as a means of measuring progress. The following targets were offered within Professor Williams' report:

Increase of 50% over five years (i.e. from 3,760 in 2006/07 to around 5,600), in the number of Welsh students studying at least part of their course through the medium of Welsh in higher education institutions. It also considers that an increase of 100% (i.e., to around 7,500) after ten years was a highly challenging, but worthy aim. There should, however, be a full review of progress after five years to inform the setting of future targets and funding and this review should also cover the structure and operation of the Coleg. In the long term a realistic aim would be to have provision in Welsh, all or in part, somewhere in Wales in most subjects.

- 2.6 In the annual grant letter from HEFCW, the target below is included along with the additional target for those studying at least 40 credits through the medium of Welsh:

The number of students studying higher education courses at higher education institutions and further education institutions in Wales who do at least 5 credits of their course through the medium of Welsh, per annum, increasing from 4,335 in 2011/12 to 5,600 in 2015/16, including an increase from 2,269 to 3,030 in the number of those studying at least 40 credits per year.

Progress against targets

Table 2: Number of students studying at least 5 credits in Welsh

	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
Welsh Universities only	4,560	4,321	4,865	4,914	5,306	5,565
Universities and FE colleges		4,335	4,882	4,932	5,399	5,658 ²

Source: HESA student record for universities, further education data has been provided directly to the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol.

² This figure is less than the official record from HESA. A question has been raised with regard to one piece of data from one University – therefore the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol has withdrawn those figures from the data. The total data would have been 6,702.

2.7 The data against the target of 5 credits through the medium of Welsh shows a steady increase over the period, with the numbers for 2015/16 higher than the original target of 5,600.

Table 3: Number of students studying at least 40 credits in Welsh

	20010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
Welsh Universities and FE colleges	2,023	2,255	2,343	2,427	2,558	2,837

Source: HESA student record for universities, further education data has been provided directly to the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol.

2.8 There has been a steady increase over recent years in the numbers of students who are studying at least 40 credits in Welsh. Nevertheless the number in 2015/16, which is 2,837 students, is lower than the target set of 3,030.

2.9 It is worth noting that, although the above targets provide a means of measuring the performance and success of the Coleg, its activities are much broader. Developing a positive environment for studying through the medium of Welsh, and developing resources and the ability of universities to provide courses in Welsh, has been key to achieving the increase in student numbers.

2.10 Additional activities include: developing technical infrastructure, in particular through the Coleg's resources and e-learning platform Y Porth; providing training programmes and a route to qualify as recognised educators through the medium of Welsh for academic staff; developing a community of researchers and specialists working in Welsh; and publishing Gwerddon, the Welsh-medium academic e-journal.

Part 3: Review approach

3.1 Membership of the Task and Finish Group is seen at Appendix 2.

3.2 The Group began its work in November 2016. There were seven meetings in locations across Wales where evidence was received from stakeholders and the following groups:

- Universities
- Further Education Colleges
- The Work-based Learning Sector
- Students
- Organisations representing the sectors
- Organisations with an interest in the Coleg's work.

3.3 Oral evidence was received from 19 organisations.(See appendix 3)

3.4 In addition the Group requested evidence via the Welsh Government's website.

3.5 An article about the review appeared in Dysg, and contributions were invited.

3.6 Written responses were received from 30 organisations and individuals (see Appendix 4).

3.7 The Group had the opportunity to review reports on the background to the establishment of the Coleg, an evaluation of the Coleg completed by HEFCW in 2014, Welsh Government policy documents and strategies, and documents and information prepared by the Coleg.

Part 4: Findings and recommendations

4.1: General comments

- 4.1.1 Based on the evidence received the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol is an effective and successful organisation, which makes a key contribution to Welsh-medium provision in the higher education sector. Across the evidence received during the review, the overall picture of the current activities of the Coleg, its effectiveness, and ability to work with the individual institutions, was a positive one.
- 4.1.2 When the Coleg was established in 2011, it had a difficult task, as a new body, to gain the trust and co-operation of the individual higher education institutions. It managed to develop effective means of collaborating with an operating model that has won support from the individual institutions. This success, during a relatively short period, deserves praise.
- 4.1.3 Evidence was received from higher education institutions which sets out the progress made in terms of Welsh-medium provision over the last five years across a wide range of subjects. This growth can be attributed to the work of the Coleg. It was said the increase would not have happened had it not been for the work of the Coleg.
- 4.1.4 Looking ahead, the Group is of the view that the Coleg needs to continue its work of supporting Welsh language provision within higher education. Solid foundations have been laid within the various universities, but the important progress made will not be sustainable without continuous support.
- 4.1.5 At the same time, there is a definite demand for the development of Welsh-medium provision across the post-16 sector. No evidence was received which contradicted this. After considering the evidence received and the various operational options, the Group concluded that the responsibilities of the Coleg should be extended to include the post-16 sector. As the Coleg currently does not have the in-house expertise to undertake the work in its entirety, a new dedicated structure will need to be created within the Coleg to ensure the necessary experience and expertise is available to lead on the initial planning work.
- 4.1.6 As the Coleg extends its remit, it is essential that the quality of provision through the medium of Welsh continues to be a priority. The student experience must be absolutely central, and it is crucial that the provision is of the highest quality. The Coleg's Strategic Plan 2017/18 emphasizes the need to ensure high quality provision, and this is to be welcomed. It is

essential that the same attention and priority steers the Coleg's work in planning for the post-16 sector. The Coleg will need to work closely with the individual institutions to monitor and safeguard the standard of provision.

- 4.1.7 Based on the evidence received, and in the context of the Welsh Government's objective to ensure million of Welsh speakers by 2050, it is timely that the Coleg is developing its role in the coming years. The Government should extend the role of the Coleg to be a recognised national strategic body for Welsh language development across the higher education, further education and work-based learning sectors.
- 4.1.8 With strong leadership, the necessary expertise, and with the support of the individual institutions, the Group believes that the Coleg is in a strong position to make a key contribution to achieving the Welsh Government's Welsh Language Strategy in the post-compulsory education sector during the next period.

4.2: The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol's structure

General comments

- 4.2.1 During the initial phase of work, overall the Coleg's structure has been suitable for the task of developing a Welsh-medium provision within higher education.
- 4.2.2 There were many references in the evidence received to the high quality and dedication of the Coleg's staff.
- 4.2.3 There was some evidence that some of the processes of the Coleg are too staff-intensive and are influenced by central bureaucracy, with the monitoring requirements for some of the activities too onerous. There is room for the Coleg to consider whether some of the administrative work can be streamlined, including on the monitoring side, without impairing on the effectiveness of the activities.

Governance

- 4.2.4 The current governance structure of the Coleg is as follows:
- **The court**, which is composed of ten institutional members (higher education) and ten members who have been nominated by stakeholders.
 - **The Board of Directors**, which comprises an independent chair, six members who have been nominated by higher education institutions, four independent directors, one member representing the Coleg's

academic staff, and one nomination from the National Union of Students Wales.

- **Appointments Committee**, responsible for the process of appointing the Chair and directors. This committee has three independent members.

4.2.5 A consistent message that came through the evidence received was the possibility of conflict of interest on the Board of Directors, or a perception of a conflict of interest. As there is significant representation from the higher education sector on the Board, there is a danger that the perception could arise of a conflict between the interests of individual institutions and the interests of the Coleg. Although there was no evidence that this has actively been a problem, the Board's current composition is open to this risk, and this risk will need to be reduced in the future.

4.2.6 If the Welsh Government accepts the recommendations of the Group to extend the remit of the Coleg, the composition of the Board of Directors will need to be revised anyway to reflect the new responsibilities. It should be ensured that Board members have balanced expertise and recent experience at a high level across the higher education, further education and work-based learning sectors. When considering the core purpose of the Coleg, which is to ensure the workforce of the future, it should also be ensured that some Board members have experience and knowledge of the needs of the world of employment.

4.2.7 The membership of the Board should not be greater than it is at present.

4.2.8 It must be stressed that Board Members are not representatives but are there to act in the best interests of the Coleg. We therefore recommend that the method of appointing members to the Board is consistent with this principle to minimize the risk of a perception of a conflict of interest (see 4.25).

Recommendation 1: The Welsh Government should extend the role of the Coleg to be a recognised national strategic body for developing the Welsh language across the higher education, further education and work-based learning sectors.

Recommendation 2: As the responsibilities of the Coleg extend to the post-16 sector, the College should change the composition of the Board of Directors, ensuring that:

- any change in the composition of the Board of Directors reflects its new responsibilities;

- the Board membership has a high level of expertise and considerable recent experience in the higher education, further education and work-based learning sectors;
- the Board membership is balanced across the sectors;
- some Board members have knowledge and experience of the needs of the world of work;
- the membership of the Board should not be greater than it is at present; and;
- the means by which members are appointed to the Board avoids conflict of interest, or perception of conflict of interest.

Recommendation 3: The Coleg should consider streamlining its general governance to make it as transparent as possible. It should consider the number, structure and membership of all committees and groups which contribute to the governance of the Coleg, based on their effectiveness and transparency.

Recommendation 4: The Coleg should consider whether there is scope to reduce bureaucracy and internal processes, including in terms of monitoring, without impairing the effectiveness of the activities.

4.3: Specific activities

4.3.1 Due to the specific requirements of the terms of reference and the need to focus on the key tasks, it was not possible to look in detail at each individual activity of the Coleg. Overall, we conclude that the activities of the Coleg are effective and fit for their purpose. To the extent that the Coleg's resources will need to be redirected in the coming period, the Coleg should focus on protecting and developing the activities that are most critical to achieving the aims of the Welsh Government's Welsh Language Strategy.

4.3.2 In the following paragraphs, attention is given to activities based on the evidence received that consistently mentioned the need for a change of emphasis or further development, namely engagement with schools, scholarships, and the Welsh Language Skills Certificate.

Engagement with schools

4.3.3 The Coleg's work in terms of engagement with schools is extremely important and will become increasingly central as it extends its role in the next phase.

4.3.4 To date the Coleg has focused its attention on the supply side, ensuring that the necessary provision is available in the institutions so that

prospective students can take advantage of them. The Coleg has been marketing at school level and within universities to disseminate the message with regard to the benefits of progression to higher education, but this activity has not been prioritized in the first period.

- 4.3.5 The Group found that there are certain difficulties with the Coleg's current arrangements in terms engagement with schools.
- 4.3.6 Some evidence referred to the name 'Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol' and the possibility that it can be misleading. The messages conveyed to pupils are confusing at times due to a misunderstanding about the role and function of the Coleg. It is clear that some pupils (and students) believe that the Coleg is a separate college, rather than an organization for development/promotion of Welsh-medium courses or modules. A different name for the Coleg could be considered, a name which would more accurately reflect its functions. Although the Group sees value in such a change in the long term, it does not recommend any change in the immediate future. Rather, the Coleg's marketing activities should concentrate on conveying the message about the Welsh language's value as a skill, rather than marketing the brand of the Coleg itself.
- 4.3.7 There is no certainty that the Coleg's marketing messages always manage to meet the needs of sixth form students. The Coleg is careful to avoid promoting one institution at the expense of another, but this can create difficulty when students from year 12 and 13 ask for specific information about the locations of different subjects that are provided through the medium of Welsh. As a result, the appropriateness of the Coleg's marketing work for this age group may need revisiting.
- 4.3.8 The individual universities promote their own courses in schools to attract students, so there is inevitably some duplication between the marketing activities of the Coleg and the individual higher education institutions.
- 4.3.9 It is not practical for the Coleg to undertake the promotion of the Welsh language in schools by itself. It would be impossible for the Coleg to visit every school, and schools themselves need to take more responsibility for the promotional work in the classroom.
- 4.3.10 The Coleg should focus on supporting schools by developing marketing materials for use by teachers, pupils and parents. The Coleg should work closely with schools and local authorities to ensure that the appropriate information reaches pupils and their parents in an accessible format at the most suitable age, in order to help pupils make the best choices for their future.

4.3.11 The Group is of the view that the work of promoting the Welsh language should extend to all secondary schools that provide Welsh-medium lessons, including bilingual and English-medium schools.

4.3.12 During the next phase the Group recommends that the Coleg increases its engagement with schools by focusing on developing messages and materials for younger pupils in year 9 and 10, before they make decisions on their post-16 education. The Coleg should focus on developing more specific messages on the value of Welsh as a skill in the workplace and where appropriate as a social and cultural advantage. It should avoid marketing itself and duplicating the work of the universities and further education colleges as they promote their own courses and institutions with older pupils.

4.3.13 At the same time, the Coleg should coordinate its work closely with the individual institutions' marketing departments to ensure that clear and consistent messages are given to school pupils about the value of the Welsh language.

4.3.14 It is essential that schools contribute to the process by working in close partnership with the Coleg to highlight the value of the language as a skill in the workplace, in order to contribute to the Welsh Government's Welsh Language Strategy.

Recommendation 5: To the extent that it will be necessary to divert the Coleg's resources in the coming period, the Coleg should focus on protecting and developing the activities that are most critical supporting the Welsh Government's Welsh Language Strategy.

Recommendation 6: The Coleg should focus its marketing messages on promoting the Welsh language as a skill in the workplace, rather than marketing the Coleg as a separate body. In so doing, the Coleg should:

- focus on supporting schools by developing marketing materials for use by teachers, pupils and parents;
- support Welsh-medium, bilingual and English-medium schools;
- redirect its promotional work to reach younger pupils in year 9 and 10, before they begin to make decisions on their post-16 education, and;
- coordinate its marketing work closely with the marketing departments of individual further and higher education institutions to ensure clear and consistent messages to school pupils regarding the value of the Welsh language.

Recommendation 7: The Welsh Government should, in partnership with the Coleg, put more pressure on schools and local authorities to contribute to the Language Strategy by communicating clear and consistent messages on the value of the language as a skill in the workplace and the importance of progression to higher education and post-16 education.

Scholarships

4.3.15 The scholarships are the Coleg's main financial tool to influence students' choices. They are:

- The **Main Scholarship** for students studying at least 80 credits per year through the medium of Welsh (up to 35 per year/£3,000 over three years).
- **Incentive/Flexible Scholarship** for students studying at least 40 credits per year through the medium of Welsh (150 Incentive scholarships available each year/£500 per year or £1,500 over three years).
- **Masters' Scholarship** for students who plan to study a course with at least 60 credits taught through the medium of Welsh (10 scholarships/£3,000 over a period of a year).
- **Research Scholarships Scheme:** Up to 10 scholarships are funded jointly with the institutions for students who want to study towards a doctorate through the medium of Welsh.

4.3.16 It is the view of the Group that the scholarships are an effective and practical way of encouraging prospective students to continue to study through the medium of Welsh.

4.3.17 The review received some evidence that the Main Scholarship is provided occasionally to students who study in Welsh regardless of the financial incentive. To ensure value for money, it is important that the scholarships are targeted at students who need an incentive to study through the medium of Welsh, and not to someone who would choose to do so without an incentive. Although it is not possible to differentiate always between one group and the other, the Coleg should revisit the way scholarships are targeted.

4.3.18 Based on the evidence received, the Group is not of the opinion that the Main Scholarship offers the best value for money. It is very likely that pupils who intend to study at least 80 credits through the medium of Welsh will do so regardless of an additional incentive. If the Main Scholarship is maintained more effort should be made to target learners more effectively.

4.3.19 It is the Group's view that the Incentive Scholarship offers the best opportunity of targeting students who would not decide to study through the medium of Welsh without a financial incentive. The scholarships should continue to be available in subjects which meet the needs of employers to strengthen the relationship between the Welsh language and the economy, in line with Welsh Government strategic priorities.

4.3.20 The Masters' Scholarships, co-funded by the Coleg and the individual institutions are an effective means of supporting students to continue with their studies at postgraduate level through the medium of Welsh.

4.3.21 The Research Scholarships are advantageous not only for the individual student but in order to contribute to scholarship and learning in the Welsh language and developing the next generation of lecturers in key priority subjects.

Recommendation 8: The Coleg should amend the scholarship scheme by:

- considering abolishing the Main Scholarship based on value for money as it is probable that there is no need for a financial incentive to students who decide to study at least 80 credits per year through the medium of Welsh;
- focusing on the development of the Incentive/Flexible Scholarships Scheme in order to more effectively target those students who would not choose to study through the medium of Welsh without financial incentive and;
- ensure that there are scholarships for subjects which meet the needs of employers in order to strengthen the relationship between the Welsh language and the economy, in line with the Welsh Governments language policy.

Recommendation 9: The Coleg should continue to offer Research Scholarships due to the value of the scheme to Welsh-medium research, to scholarship and learning, and in terms of supporting future lecturers.

Welsh Language Skills Certificate

4.3.22 The Welsh Language Skills Certificate is an effective method of demonstrating students' linguistic proficiency providing them with evidence of their skills for the world of work.

4.3.23 There is scope to develop the Welsh Language Skills Certificate further to make it accessible to more students. Consideration should be given to introducing different levels of attainment within the certificate and differentiating between oral and written language skills. This would make

the certificate accessible to students who speak Welsh but choose to study through the medium of English, to apprentices, and to students who study outside Wales. Extending the Certificate will create increased opportunities for use within higher and further education institutions, as well as in the workplace.

Recommendation 10: The Coleg should consider how it can develop the Welsh Language Skills Certificate by introducing different levels of attainment, allowing it to be more accessible to additional students and apprentices.

Recommendation 11: The possibility of offering the Welsh Language Skills Certificate to students who study outside of Wales should be explored, enabling them to maintain contact with the language in order to highlight opportunities for employability/further study in Wales (e.g. work experience, Masters degrees).

4.4: Indicators and targets

- 4.4.1 In Part 2: Targets and Achievements, a summary is provided of the Coleg's targets and the number of students studying at least 5 credits and 40 credits through the medium of Welsh.
- 4.4.2 The Group received mixed evidence on the indicators used by the Coleg. Some institutions are of the opinion that the 5 credits indicator is too low to offer students any significant experience of studying through the medium of Welsh. It has been suggested that it is possible to record students under the 5 credits indicator by only providing bilingual materials – with no significant requirement for the student to use the language within the learning.
- 4.4.3 On the other hand, strong evidence was received from other institutions that 5 credit indicator enables students to receive a small proportion of their course through the medium of Welsh and that this initial experience can build confidence and lead students to deeper use of the Welsh language.
- 4.4.4 The Group recommends that the Coleg continues to use both the 5 and 40 credits indicators which fit the targets linked to the Coleg's funding agreement. The Coleg should consider ways of encouraging institutions to enrich learners' experiences offered under the 5 credits indicator.
- 4.4.5 The number of students studying 80 credits per year or more through the medium of Welsh should continue to be recorded and considered as an indicator of those who have significant Welsh language skills.

- 4.4.6 Looking to the future, consideration should be given to developing an additional indicator based on the number (and percentage) of school pupils who can speak Welsh who go on to study through the medium of Welsh in higher or further education. Such an indicator would be a more effective way of measuring the success of the Coleg in the context of the growth in Welsh and bilingual schools.
- 4.4.7 One factor which is outside the control of the Coleg (but which affects its ability to meet its targets) is the number of students who have received their education through the medium of Welsh who choose to study at universities outside Wales. Based on the numbers who apply to study at university, an increasing number of Welsh students choose to study in England. In 2011, 33% of prospective students from Welsh-medium and bilingual schools applied for places in universities in England. By 2015 the percentage had increased to 42% of pupils of Welsh-medium and bilingual schools.
- 4.4.8 In addition, there is evidence that it is the most able students (A-level results ABB+) who are most inclined to choose to study in England, with numbers increasing each year. Several contributors referred to the Welsh Government's student funding policy for Wales and the Seren Network in this context.
- 4.4.9 The above trends make the work of the Coleg more difficult as it strives to increase the numbers who are studying at our universities through the medium of Welsh. The statistics also require further attention when considering the long term linguistic needs of Wales, both economically and socially.

Recommendation 12: The Welsh Government should continue to set targets to the Coleg on the basis of 5 and 40 credits through the medium of Welsh, which should reflect the needs of the Government's Welsh Language Strategy. The Coleg should continue to record the number of students completing 80 credits per year.

Recommendation 13: The Coleg should discuss with individual institutions how they can enrich the experiences offered within the 5 credit indicator to ensure that students who are recorded under this indicator use the language to some extent.

Recommendation 14: The Welsh Government and the Coleg should develop an additional indicator based on the percentage of school pupils who can speak Welsh who go on to study through the medium of Welsh in higher or further education.

4.5: The relationship between the Coleg and higher education establishments

General comments

- 4.5.1 The relationship between the Coleg and higher education institutions is a successful and effective one. Since its inception the Coleg has developed a way of working with the various institutions which is constructive and responds well to different needs and priorities. The quality and dedication of the Coleg's staff was highly praised during the course of the review.
- 4.5.2 In offering their evidence, all of the higher education institutions attributed the increase in Welsh-medium provision within their own organisation to the work of the Coleg, stating categorically that the increase would not have happened were it not for this work. This is testament to the constructive relationship that has been created between the Coleg and the institutions.
- 4.5.3 The only area where questions were raised concerning the relationship between the Coleg and the individual institutions was in the context of the Coleg's governance. Further detail on this subject is seen in Part 4.2 of the report.
- 4.5.4 As the Coleg develops its national strategic role in the coming period, it is inevitable that its relationship with individual institutions will change to some degree. The Coleg will need to work more proactively in setting priorities and in making strategic decisions regarding the support given to different areas and subjects. Both the Coleg and the individual institutions will need to adapt to this new way of working and ensure, on both sides, that the successful relationship developed so far continues into the future.
- 4.5.5 The Coleg's duty to continue to work in an open and transparent manner will be central to the relationship, to ensure the support of institutions and foster confidence in the proposed subject planning process. The Coleg should ensure that its plans are understood and that they include a clear timetable for changes that affect the institutions. The individual institutions will also have a duty to use their own resources to contribute to the Welsh-medium provision adding to what is supported by the Coleg.

Change from the Academic Staffing Scheme to subject funding

- 4.5.6 From the current financial year, the Coleg is operating a new academic plan. The previous model of financing individual lecturers through the Academic Staffing Scheme will change gradually to a funding system based on subject grants. The new funding model represents added value offering an incentive for organisations to make better use of each member

of staff who are able to teach through the medium of Welsh. These changes will not take effect for some years while the current staffing scheme runs its course and while the budget transfers to the new model.

- 4.5.7 The evidence received generally welcomed the change in the academic plan to a subject-based funding system. It is too early to predict how the change to the subject grants will affect Welsh-medium provision as a whole, and specifically on staffing levels within individual institutions. Concern was expressed about the severe financial pressures within the higher education sector and the impact on jobs across departments. In this context the Coleg will need to assess the impact and success of the subject plan after three years.
- 4.5.8 Evidence was received about the need to provide courses through the medium of Welsh in an institution when there was already provision available at another institution. Concerns were raised with regard to duplication of provision across institutions and the potential impact of this on the numbers of students on individual courses.
- 4.5.9 When considering sustainability and value for money the Coleg will need to consider whether it is sustainable to develop courses in additional settings if Welsh-medium provision already exists elsewhere. The group accepts that there will be priority subjects where there may not be sufficient numbers to maintain the provision in several locations, and consideration will have to be given to centralising the provision in these cases.
- 4.5.10 It is likely that centralising some subjects in one or two locations will make the courses more sustainable in the long-term by attracting greater numbers of students, which will be of benefit to the institutions.
- 4.5.11 In line with the Government's Welsh Language Strategy, and responding to the needs of employers, the Coleg should prioritise subjects and areas where there is a demand amongst employers for bilingual skills.

Recommendation 15: The Coleg should work more proactively when setting priorities and making strategic decisions regarding the support given to different subjects.

Recommendation 16: In developing the subject grants scheme, the Coleg should;

- work in an open and transparent manner, to secure the sector's support and to foster confidence in the subject grants process;
- ensure that its plans are clear and include a clear timetable for changes which affect the institutions;

- monitor the impact of the new subject grant scheme carefully and make a full assessment of the impact and success of the scheme after three years;
- when offering subject grants, the Coleg should consider the number of locations that provide courses in the same subject and reduce the number, if appropriate, to ensure the sustainability of the provision, and;
- ensure that there are subject grants for subjects/areas where there is a demand amongst employers for bilingual skills.

Recommendation 17: Individual institutions should make every effort to ensure best value for money by investing their own funding and resources to contribute to the Welsh-medium provision in order to add to what is supported by the Coleg.

Branches

4.5.12 The most prominent link the Coleg has with students is the Coleg's branches which are located within the individual institutions. There are currently eight branches, including two that include further education institutions.

4.5.13 It is noted that the Coleg is conducting an internal review of the branches' activities as part of its strategic plan.

4.5.14 There was support for the branches system, although the role and activity of the branches vary greatly within the structure of the individual institutions. There was evidence that some branches are a core part of the structure of the organisations, while others are marginal in terms of their connection with senior officials and are working at too low a level to have any strategic influence within the organisation (for example, placing emphasis on providing social opportunities for students through the medium of Welsh).

4.5.15 The branches are an important part of the Coleg's work and should be further developed during the next period. In the Group's view, it is important that the Coleg develops a structure of core activities for the branches that add real value to the work of institutions in terms of promoting the Welsh language and supporting students. In doing this, we should ensure sufficient flexibility within the structure to respond to different conditions within the institutions.

4.5.16 The Coleg will need to work closely with the individual institutions in order to ensure that each branch can represent the Coleg's objectives effectively and contribute at a strategic level to the development of Welsh-medium provision within the institutions.

Recommendation 18: The Coleg should develop and harmonise the core activities of its branches whilst safeguarding the flexibility to respond to the specific conditions of individual institutions.

Recommendation 19: The Coleg should work closely with the higher education institutions to ensure that the branches have sufficient input and influence at a strategic level within the institutions.

Part 5: Extending the Coleg’s remit to include the post-16 sector

Background and targets

- 5.1 In contrast to the higher education sector, further education colleges and work-based learning providers are funded directly by the Welsh Government. Funding agreements are used by the Welsh Government to influence and encourage training institutions and companies to develop their Welsh-medium provision.
- 5.2 The Welsh Government’s Welsh-medium Education Strategy ³ (WMES) was published in April 2010. It included a vision for continued growth of Welsh-medium education and training in all sectors and age ranges. Targets for growth within the post-16 sector were set and progress is reported in the annual report for the Welsh-medium Education Strategy.
- 5.3 This target was reported on in the 2015/16 Annual Report on the Welsh-medium Education Strategy, as follows:

Table 4: Welsh-medium and bilingual learning activities in the further education and work-based learning sector 2009/10 – 2014/15.

Students’ learning activities according to the medium of instruction (LA26)	2009/10	2010/11*	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15**
	CC+D***	CC+D	CC+D	CC+D	CC+D	CC+D
Further Education Institutions	6.2%	5.7%	6.7%	8.4%	8.5%	7.2%
Work-based Learning	1.5%	3.0%	3.9%	3.6%	3.0%	6.7%

*Before 2010/11, data for work-based learning was provided by further education institutions, and categorized under 'further education institutions'. Since 2010/11 this data has been categorized under 'work based learning' and thus a decrease was seen in the data for colleges.

** The definition of Post-16 Welsh-medium and bilingual teaching was changed in the lifelong learning Wales record (LA26). This became active in 2014/15. Now the recorded medium of learning and language of the assessment for each person is recorded, rather than the whole class where teaching takes place. As a result of this, there is a reduction from 8.5% in 2013/14 to 7.2% in 2014/15.

*** CC = Welsh-Medium, D = Bilingual

³ <http://gov.wales/docs/dcells/publications/100420welshmediumstrategyen.pdf>

- 5.4 In order to support the further education colleges and work-based learning providers to achieve the targets, during the period shown in table 4 the Welsh Government funded Bilingual Champions in all further education institutions and in support of work-based learning providers.
- 5.5 During the same period the Welsh Government continued to support further education colleges with the Welsh-medium Allowance, given as part of their annual revenue settlement, together with an allowance to the work-based learning sector to support the development of Welsh-medium or bilingual learning activities.
- 5.6 In addition, Sgiliaith is funded by the Welsh Government to provide practical methodological assistance to lecturers and assessors to enable them to lecture and support their students through the medium of Welsh.
- 5.7 Within the Welsh Government's Programme for Government for the next five years, *Moving Wales Forward*, there is a commitment to create at least 100,000 high quality apprenticeships to people of all ages. It is expected that a large number of the proposed apprenticeships will be in priority sectors in terms of the Welsh language. This will put increasing pressure on the work-based learning sector to support the Government's Welsh Language Strategy.

Findings

- 5.8 There is no doubt that the post-16 sector has a vital role to play in achieving the Welsh Government's goal of a million Welsh speakers. Students in the post-16 sector are most likely to continue to live and work in their communities and use the language in local workplaces and services. Ensuring language continuity for these young people after they leave school will be essential.
- 5.9 Very little progress was seen in Welsh-medium provision within FE colleges over the last five years (see table 4), with a somewhat larger increase among providers of work-based learning (from an initial point which was considerably lower). A greater increase will be needed in future if the Welsh Government is to achieve the goal of one million Welsh speakers.
- 5.10 The Group received clear evidence from the further education and work-based learning sectors that strategic leadership was needed at a national level in order to extend the Welsh-medium provision within the various institutions. Although Colegau Cymru, the representative body for the sector,

supports the colleges to extend their Welsh-medium and bilingual provision, and the National Training Federation for Wales (NTFW) supports the work-based learning sector, with limited resources the ability of both organizations to make a significant difference is restricted.

- 5.11 The Group received a great deal of evidence which emphasised the difference between the higher and further education sectors, in terms of the range of subjects, students' skills, and the learning environment. Within the post-16 sector the provision includes:
- Academic courses/A Levels
 - Vocational programmes ranging from Level 1 to Levels 4 and 5
 - Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification
 - Numeracy and literacy support, including GCSE re-sits
 - Independent living skills programmes
 - Engagement/traineeship programmes
 - Work-based learning programmes based on the needs of employer
 - A wide range of short courses for employers
 - Basic skills for adults.
- 5.12 Much of the work in the sector takes place outside the classroom, in a variety of workplaces. Courses are delivered by trainers and technical workers as well as lecturers. These factors, together with the wide range of courses, add to the challenge of providing courses through the medium of Welsh.
- 5.13 Based on the evidence received, it became clear to the Group that the current strategy of the Coleg for the higher education sector would not transfer effectively to the post-16 sector. Due to the complexities of the sector, there is no single simple answer to the question of how to improve the provision, nor is there one single model of action that will have the necessary influence. Action will be required at several levels according to the diverse needs of the individual institutions, building on the good work that already takes place in a number of organisations.
- 5.14 The Group considered the strengths and weaknesses of the Coleg in terms of extending its responsibilities to the post-16 sector, along with other options for providing strategic leadership to the sector, including further direct intervention by the Welsh Government, guidance by another external body, or the creation of a new body for the sector.
- 5.15 After considering all the evidence, the Group concluded that the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol would be the most suitable body to carry out the

work to develop Welsh Language provision within the post-16 sector. Among others, the main factors in favour of extending the remit of the Coleg were:

- Evidence of effective achievement in the higher education sector
- Staff expertise in planning, monitoring, and partnership working
- Established links with the post-16 sector
- Experience of working within schools to promote the Welsh language
- Library of resources and e-learning platform
- Value for money – operational structure in place
- New Chair with a post-16 sector background.

5.16 However, at present the Coleg does not have the necessary expertise at an operational level to carry out the planning work for the post-16 sector. The Coleg itself is aware of this deficiency.

5.17 In order to ensure that the necessary expertise is available to the Coleg, the Group recommends the Coleg establish a post-16 Planning Board with representation from the further education colleges, the work-based learning sector and the Welsh Government.

5.18 The Planning Board should, under the auspices of the Coleg, lead the work of preparing the initial plan for developing the Welsh-medium provision within further education colleges and the work-based learning sector, building on the good work already taking place within the sectors to secure progress.

5.19 In order to support the work of the Post-16 Planning Board, the Coleg should create a post-16 planning unit within the existing structure of the Coleg to research, collect data and implement the initial plan.

5.20 The Group recommends that there should be a focus on three specific activities: Supporting the current staff of colleges and training providers to develop their skills in order to be able to teach bilingually; developing Welsh-medium teaching resources to support teaching; and promoting the opportunities and benefits for learners in the Welsh Government's priority areas.

5.21 We received a great deal of evidence noting the lack of qualifications and assessment tools through the medium of Welsh. It is clear that there is a serious shortage of assessors who are able to assess through the medium of Welsh, including a shortage of internal quality assessors (IQAs), and a lack of external assessors in the awarding bodies who can work confidently through the medium of Welsh. Developing this infrastructure is vital if the provision is to develop.

5.22 With the Coleg's resources and e-learning platform Y Porth, already in existence, and the Coleg producing and sharing resources for the higher education sector, the Coleg is in a strong position to start supporting the development of resources for the post-16 sector, and to do so immediately.

5.23 The range of training already provided by Sgiliaith and the support from ColegauCymru will be expected to contribute to the planning process and the Coleg will need to work closely with Sgiliaith to develop appropriate plans to support the skills of the institutions' existing staff.

5.24 The Coleg will be expected to work closely with the National Training Federation for Wales to develop resources and staff who are able to assess through the medium of Welsh within the work-based learning sector and to ensure that the post-16 sector as a whole is supported.

5.25 The Coleg should agree with the Welsh Government some attainable indicators to measure success within the sector.

Recommendation 20: The remit of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol should be extended to include the post-16 sector.

Recommendation 21: To develop activity within the post-16 sector the Coleg should;

- establish a specialist planning board under the auspices of the Coleg, including representation from further education colleges, the work-based learning sector and Welsh Government, to develop an action plan to increase Welsh-medium provision within the post-16 sector;
- the planning board should prioritize three specific areas: supporting the current staff of colleges and training providers to develop their skills in order to teach bilingually, developing Welsh-medium teaching resources, and promoting the opportunities and benefits for learners in the Welsh Government's priority areas, and;
- create a post-16 planning unit to support the work of the Planning Board and to respond to the new responsibilities.

Recommendation 22: In partnership between the Welsh Government, the Coleg and other stakeholders, consideration should be given to how the capacity of the vocational sector to assess through the medium of Welsh could be developed, both internally within institutions and externally by the awarding bodies.

Part 6: Funding the Coleg

General comments

- 6.1 The budget of the Coleg since its establishment can be seen in Table 1 (Page 10). There has been a decrease in the Coleg's budget from £8.1m in 2015/16 to £5.8m in 2016/17; the reduction does not seem to have had a negative effect on outcomes.
- 6.2 There was some evidence that staffing costs and the central expenditure of the Coleg were generous, particularly in the context of the challenging financial situation across the higher education sector. But there was no evidence that the expenditure on the whole had not been successful and effective.
- 6.3 The evidence received by the higher education institutions firmly stated the importance of the investment made by the Coleg to develop their Welsh-medium provision. The importance of maintaining the investment for the future was emphasized, and concern was expressed that extending the remit of the Coleg to the post-16 sector would lead to a reduction in the budget that was available to support the higher education sector. Without continuity in the current investment, the institutions were clear in their view that the important progress made to date would not be sustainable.
- 6.4 In the post-16 sector, there was agreement that much more needed to be done to increase Welsh-medium provision within the colleges and in the work-based learning sector. Additional investment would be required to ensure the necessary progress. The colleges were all of the view that the Welsh-medium Allowance, which is part of the current annual financial settlement, should remain in place and any new investment should be in addition to the allowance.

Value for money and sustainability

- 6.5 It was not possible for the Group to explore in depth all aspects of the Coleg's spending, nor to analyse each individual investment. Based on the evidence received, the Group came to the following conclusions about the funding of the Coleg:
- 6.6 A significant majority of the Coleg's budget is taken up by direct investment to develop the Welsh-medium provision in the higher education sector. Overall, the activities funded by the Coleg are effective and achieve their objectives. The central costs as a percentage of the Coleg's budget are reasonable, and reflect the costs within comparable organisations.

- 6.7 The investment will need to be sustained within higher education in order to maintain the growth in provision that we've seen already. The growth will not be sustainable without continuity in this investment. The Group agrees with Diamond's recommendation (see page 7) that we need a sustainable funding model for the future.
- 6.8 The Coleg's new academic plan offers opportunities to secure better value for money by stimulating the institutions to contribute more of their own resources to extend the provision within and across departments, instead of relying on individual lecturers funded by the Coleg.
- 6.9 If the Coleg's role extends to the post-16 sector, there is scope within budget and in terms of the central activities of the Coleg to make savings and to redirect its work and its focus to a large extent. The Group does not therefore see the need for a significant increase in the level of central staff in order to take on the additional responsibilities.
- 6.10 Additional budget will be needed to support the growth of Welsh-medium provision in the further education and work-based learning sectors at an institutional level. The value of the investment is dependent on an agreement between the Coleg and the Welsh Government regarding priority activities following a period of planning.

Funding the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol in the future

- 6.11 The Group considered how the Coleg is funded in the context of the Hazelkorn Report (see page 7) and the Welsh Government's intention to establish a single authority to regulate, oversee and co-ordinate the post-compulsory sector in Wales.
- 6.12 It is not reasonable for the Group to make a detailed recommendation about the Coleg's relationship with any new authority while these developments are still under consideration. The Coleg will obviously have to work closely with any new body for the sector, but the exact nature of the relationship will depend on a number of factors that have yet to be decided.
- 6.13 The Group received a range of evidence on the need for an arm's length relationship between the Welsh Government and the Coleg. While some organisations and individuals believe an arm's length relationship needs to be established in order to protect the independence of the Coleg, others felt that a direct relationship between the Welsh Government and the Coleg is advantageous because of the strategic importance of the Coleg to the work

of achieving the Welsh Government's Language Strategy in this next crucial period.

- 6.14 Because of the changes under consideration following the Hazelkorn report, together with the need for close co-operation between the Welsh Government and the Coleg to implement the Welsh Language Strategy, the Group recommends that the approach to funding the Coleg continues as it is currently through direct annual agreement between the Welsh Government and the Coleg. The arrangement should continue until the establishment of the new body for the post-compulsory sector.
- 6.15 When the composition and responsibilities of the new body is clearer, the Group recommends that we look again at the method of funding the Coleg, and consider (for example) whether to make the new body responsible for funding of the Coleg.
- 6.16 When planning a new body for the post-compulsory sector, the Welsh Government will need to consider the role of the other bodies serving the sector. The Coleg is already working with the National Centre for Learning Welsh, which is responsible for the development of Welsh for Adults. There is scope for co-ordinating the work of the Centre and the Coleg further, and consideration will need to be given as to how best to ensure efficiency and value for money across the Welsh-medium post-compulsory sector in the context of other developments.

Recommendation 23: The Coleg should consider every opportunity to review costs, particularly central costs, to ensure value for money.

Recommendation 24: The Coleg should continue to be funded directly by the Welsh Government. The funding options should be reviewed within four years as the role and responsibilities of the new post-compulsory body become clearer.

Recommendation 25: The Coleg should discuss with the Welsh Government the need for any additional funding in response to their new responsibilities. This should be based on an action plan, but in the short term an increase in the central costs is not considered necessary.

Part 7: The Coleg's role in relation to recent policy developments

- 7.1 In the course of the review constant attention to the Coleg's role in supporting the objectives of Government policies was considered. The Coleg does not operate in a vacuum, and it is in a position to influence and respond to policy in the fields of education, higher education, skills and the economy, and the Welsh language, to name but a few.
- 7.2 In response to Professor Diamond's report into higher education funding and student finance arrangements, the Group agrees with Diamond's recommendation that we need sustainable funding and annual investment in the future to support Welsh-medium education within higher education.
- 7.3 When considering the Welsh Government's Welsh language policy and the objective to work towards one million Welsh speakers by 2050, the Coleg's work and influence within higher education will be key to maintaining and developing the progression from statutory education. If the Group's recommendation to extend the responsibilities of the Coleg to the post-16 sector is approved, the Coleg's contribution to developing the workforce of the future will be essential in terms of the further education and the work-based learning sector.
- 7.4 The recommendations of Professor Hazelkorn's report, '*Towards 2030 - A framework for building a world-class post-compulsory education system for Wales*' will be the subject of further consultation by the Welsh Government. Considering this, it is not reasonable for the Group to make detailed recommendations concerning the Coleg's relationship with any new authority while those developments are still under consideration. The Coleg's relationship with the new post-compulsory body will need to be reconsidered as its responsibilities become clearer.
- 7.5 Looking to the future, the Coleg is in a position to contribute positively to the development and implementation of a wide range of government policies. It will be one of the key organisations as the Welsh Government undertakes the work of achieving the objectives of the Welsh Language Strategy. It is timely, therefore, that the Coleg develops its role and its reach to be a recognised national strategic body for developing the Welsh language across the higher education, further education and work-based learning sectors.
-

Appendix 1: The Group's Terms of Reference

The task and finish Group were required to consider the following:

- Whether the current model and structure for the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol is appropriate and fit for the purpose to promote and develop Welsh-medium higher education provision from 2017 onwards. If not, define the future role, activity and structure of the Coleg (or alternative entity), with full consideration of value for money and sustainability.
- The future options for funding the Coleg.
- The sustainability of the working relationship between the Coleg and Welsh higher education institutions.
- Whether the Coleg's remit should extend to the post-16 sector (further education and work based learning, and if so, provide potential options on how to take this forward.
- The role of the Coleg in response to the recommendations of the Diamond review and other recent policy developments.

Appendix 2: Members of the Task and Finish Group

- Delyth Evans, member of the National Assembly for Wales between 2000 and 2003 – Chair
- Barry Liles, Principal Coleg Sir Gâr
- Heledd Bebb, Previously a lecturer for the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol, now a Director of OB3 Research
- Bethan Guilfoyle, former head teacher of Treorchy Comprehensive School
- Rhun Dafydd, nominated as a student representative by NUS Wales
- Professor Mari Lloyd-Williams, Lecturer at the University of Liverpool
- Professor Noel Lloyd, former Vice-Chancellor Aberystwyth University.

Appendix 3: Establishments which presented oral evidence

	Organisation	Name	Title	Date
1	Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol	Andrew Green Ioan Matthews Dafydd Trystan Catherine Rees Dylan Philips Gwennan Schiavone	Chairman of the Board of Directors Chief Executive Registrar and Senior Academic manager Senior Corporate Affairs Manager Senior Academic Manager Senior Academic Manager	25 November 2016
2	Higher Education Funding Council for Wales	Celia Hunt Dr Cliona O'Neill	Director of Strategic Development Head of Student Experience	13 January 2017
3	Welsh Government	Bethan Webb	Deputy Director, Welsh Language Division	13 January 2017
4	National Students Union Wales	Fflur Elin Ifan James	NUS Wales President Welsh Language officer	13 January 2017
5	Aberystwyth University	Rhodri Llwyd Morgan Mari Elin Jones Elin Royles	Pro Vice-Chancellor Manager, Centre for Welsh Language Services Chair of the University Branch of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol	6 February 2017
6	University of South Wales	Gwawr Jones William Callaway	Head of the Welsh Unit & Welsh Language Officer University Secretary and Clerk to the Governors	6 February 2017
7	University of Wales Trinity Saint David	Gwilym Dyfri Jones	Pro Associate Vice-Chancellor	6 February 2017
8	Bangor University	Jerry Hunter Llion Jones	Professor and Pro Vice Chancellor Director, Canolfan Bedwyr	7 March 2017
9	Betsi Cadwaladr University Health Board	Meilyr Emrys Alaw Griffiths	Welsh Language Officer Welsh Language Officer	7 March 2017
10	Welsh Government	Awen Penri Branwen Thomas	Head of Welsh in Education Development Branch Senior Officer post-16, Welsh in Education Development Branch	7 March 2017
11	Colleges Wales	Claire Roberts	Director of Engagement	7 March 2017
12	Coleg Cambria	Llinos Roberts	Head of Corporate Communications & Welsh Language	7 March 2017
13	Cymdeithas yr Iaith	Sel Williams	Member of the Education Group with responsibility for the	11 April 2017

		Ffred Ffransis Colin Nosworthy Mirain Llwyd Roberts	Coleg Cymraeg campaign Member of the Education Group Communications and Assembly Liaison Officer Chair of Bangor students Cymdeithas yr Iaith Cell	
14	Gower College Swansea	Anna Davies	Bilingual Champion	11 April 2017
15	Cardiff and Vale College	Kay Martin	Cardiff and Vale College Principal	11 April 2017
16	Grŵp Llandrillo Menai	Linda Wyn	Principal of Coleg Menai and Coleg Meirion-Dwyfor	11 April 2017
17	Welsh Government	Richard Evans	Senior Skills officer, Welsh Language Division	25 April 2017
18	National Training Federation for Wales	Jeff Protheroe Ryan Evans	Director of Operations Bilingual Champion	25 April 2017
19	Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol	Haydn Edwards Ioan Matthews Dafydd Trystan	Chairman of the Board of Directors (from 1 April 2017) Chief Executive Registrar and Senior Academic manager	25 April 2017

Appendix 4: Written responses received

	Name or Organisation
1	Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol
2	Cymdeithas yr Iaith
3	Coleg Sir Gâr
4	The National Centre for Learning Welsh
5	National Union of Students Wales
6	Higher Education Funding Council for Wales
7	Coleg Gwent
8	Welsh language Commissioner
9	Cardiff Metropolitan University
10	Iwan Thomas
11	Cwm Taf University Health Board
12	Aneurin Bevan University Health Board
13	Care Council for Wales
14	Catrin Williams
15	NHS Wales Shared Services Partnership
16	Sian Morgan Lloyd and Manon Edwards Ahir
17	Cardiff University
18	University of Wales Trinity Saint David
19	Betsi Cadwaladr University Health Board
20	Dyfodol i'r iaith
21	Swansea University
22	Bangor University
23	Grŵp Llandrillo Menai
24	Colleges Wales
25	Merfyn Morgan
26	University of South Wales
27	National Training Federation for Wales
28	The Open University
29	Cardiff and Vale Collage
30	John O'Shea – The College Merthyr Tydfil (Video clip)